

PDF hosted at the Radboud Repository of the Radboud University Nijmegen

The following full text is a publisher's version.

For additional information about this publication click this link.

<http://hdl.handle.net/2066/43560>

Please be advised that this information was generated on 2018-07-07 and may be subject to change.

Reviews

Jahrbuch für Antike und Christentum, 46 – 2003. Edited by Georg Schöllgen and others.
Pp. 209 incl. 22 ills + 22 black-and-white and colour plates. Münster:
Aschendorff, 2004. €74. 3 402 08137 7; 0075 2541
JEH (57) 2006; doi:10.1017/S0022046905216214

This rather belated issue of the *Jahrbuch* is dedicated to the distinguished student of early Christianity in the Middle East, Albrecht Dihle, on his eightieth birthday. There are nine articles and seventeen learned reviews, the former being almost equally divided between literary studies and archaeology. An interesting article by Bruno Bleckmann seeks to identify the anonymous *Vita BHG* 365 with a missing fragment of Philostorgius' *Church history* relating to the first conflict between Constantine and Licinius in 315–16. Altay Coskun provides a detailed account of the long-running and blood-stained conflict between Pope Damasus and his rival Ursinus in 366–73, and analyses the motives and actions of successive *praefecti* Viventius and Maximinus in supporting Damasus. Zahi Hawass and Gawdat Gabra describe the excavation of a Coptic hermitage at Mansouria, in an extension of the western desert, 25 km north of the Giza pyramids. The excavators regret the apparent lack of care by the authorities of the fine sixth–seventh-century Coptic frescos found in the course of the excavation. Two further pieces of archaeological research, on the reliquaries of Nicolas of Myra, by Philipp Niewöhner, and a survey of six churches in Pednelissos in Pisidia between the fourth and seventh centuries AD, by Ulrike Karas and Sebastian Ristow, complete a well-balanced, and well-produced, issue. Of the reviews, two by Winrich Löhr on Henry Chadwick's *The Church in ancient society*, and Wucherpennig's study of Heracleon, are outstanding. There is, however, a tendency among reviewers to write mini theses, which sometimes obscure the character of the work under review. As usual, the editors have produced a faultless, scholarly, volume.

GONVILLE AND CAIUS COLLEGE,
CAMBRIDGE

†W. H. C. FREND

Behind locked doors. A history of the papal elections. By Frederic J. Baumgartner.
Pp. xv + 272. Basingstoke: Palgrave Macmillan, 2003. £19.99. 0 312 29463 8
JEH (57) 2006; doi:10.1017/S0022046905226210

The papal election, the conclave, retains its mystique and was seen in action for the first time in over a quarter of a century in April 2005 with the swift election of Josef

Ratzinger as Pope Benedict XVI. The protracted end of John Paul II's pontificate, the perceived divisions in the Roman Catholic Church between conservatives and progressives and the vogue for conspiracy theories all contributed to a burgeoning industry of books and articles on 'the next pope'. Baumgartner's timely volume largely avoids speculation about the future and concentrates on past conclaves. It provides a useful potted history of the papacy and the college of cardinals, a survey of individual conclaves, and a commentary on the development of the mechanics of the conclave up to John Paul II's instructions of 1996 which kept the pope's election within the college of cardinals as it has been since the eleventh century. Outside political influences emerge as a constant problem: first the Roman nobles and later the Catholic powers, notably France, with the last veto of a papal candidate by a European state, Austria, coming as late as 1903. Baumgartner writes lucidly and with an appealing lightness of touch; his book is particularly useful in dismissing notions of false antiquarianism and clearing the 'holy smoke' which too often obscures the papal *sede vacante* and conceals the effectiveness of what is a tried and humane process.

DOWNSIDE ABBEY

AIDAN BELLENGER

African Christianity. An African story. Edited by Ogbu U. Kalu. (Perspectives on Christianity. Ser. 5, 3.) Pp. xv + 631 incl. 10 maps. Pretoria: University of Pretoria, 2005. R215 (paper). 0 620 33647 1

JEH (57) 2006; doi:10.1017/S0022046905236217

The chronology of African church history has long been a matter of political and religious importance. At stake is the authenticity of African Christianity. Is Christianity a nineteenth-century import, brought by European missionaries and irrevocably tied to the colonial project? Or can a history linking Christianity to Africa over the *longue durée* be identified? Missionaries addressed this question by assigning their students biographies of early African Christians to read. In central Kenya, Presbyterian students in the 1940s read, in Swahili, the life stories of Apolo Kivebulya (the famed evangelist of the eastern Congo), King Khama of South Africa, Ghanaian educationalist James Aggrey and other prominent characters of the nineteenth century. African ecclesiastical entrepreneurs looked for inspiration in the more distant reaches of Christian history. The African Orthodox Church, founded in 1920s South Africa by a Garveyite churchman, claimed ecclesiastical authority from the patriarchate of Alexandria. Africa's contemporary church historians have further deepened the chronology of African Christianity. Adrian Hastings's monumental *The Church in Africa* (Oxford 1994) starts in 1450 with a history of medieval Ethiopia. Elizabeth Isichei's *History of Christianity in Africa* (Grand Rapids 1995) and Mark Shaw's *The kingdom of God in Africa* (Grand Rapids 1996) go even further back, to the earliest years of the Common Era. Ogbu Kalu's edited collection participates in the ongoing effort to position African Christianity within the longer span of African history. Written for seminary students in Africa, this book aims to show how, over two thousand years, African converts, preachers, chaplains, healers, evangelists, freed slaves and theologians have made their own diverse Christianities.

The first portion of the book is arranged chronologically, documenting the history of African Christianity from its genesis in Alexandria to its medieval incarnation in Ethiopia. The authors lay emphasis on the centrality of Africa to the cosmopolitan world of the early Church. Kenneth Sawyer and Youhana Youssef describe the pivotal role that Alexandrian theologians played in the formulation of Christian doctrine. William Anderson and Ogbu Kalu reconstruct the history of the kingdom of Nubia, which fought off Arab armies in AD 642 and preserved a Christian culture lasting through the 1300s. David Kpobi reconstructs the biographies of the African chaplains who worked in the Dutch and Portuguese trading settlements of western Africa during the 1700s; and Paul Gundani profiles the African clergy who evangelised the medieval central African kingdoms of Kongo and Mutapa and in Mozambique.

The second part of the book is arranged thematically, not chronologically. After Jehu Hanciles's survey of the links between abolitionism and the missionary movement in nineteenth-century Europe, subsequent essays discuss the different brands of Christianity that Africans developed. J. W. Hofmeyer surveys the politics of mainline Churches, while Kalu himself writes about the 'Ethiopian' Churches, which in the late nineteenth and early twentieth centuries rejected the cultural ensemble that European missionaries imposed on Christian converts. Graham Duncan and Kalu discuss the revival movements of eastern and southern Africa of the 1930s and 40s, and Afe Adogame and Lizo Jafta analyse the ritual practice of the diverse African Instituted Churches. The latter chapters of the book focus on the theological situation of contemporary African Christianity: Kwabena Asamoah-Gyadu surveys the field of Pentecostal Christianity, while Philomena Njeri Mwaura highlights women's roles in charismatic Churches. The book concludes with three essays from theologians – Nyambura Njoroge, Tinyiko Sam Maluleke and J. N. K. Mugambi – which outline the task of theology in relation to current politics, gender relations and African tradition.

This book is a tremendous affirmation of the diversity, vitality and longevity of African Christianity. There is much here to inspire, humble and motivate readers. But *African Christianity: an African story* is largely a history of institutions. Kalu and his contributors parcel Africa's intellectual history into different ecclesiastical bundles, obscuring the broader fields of thought and action in which Christian ideas played. The chapter on 'Islamic challenges in African Christianity', for example, poses Christianity in opposition to Islam, arguing that Africa is a 'veritable laboratory for analyzing a host of emerging themes relevant to relations between the two faiths' (p. 118). Other contributors compare and contrast Christianity with 'traditional religion'. Chukwudi Njoki's essay on mission Churches, for example, argues that there was 'hardly any serious dialogue initiated between Christian theology and the theology of traditional religions' (p. 226). Revivalist Christianity, by contrast, betrays (according to Duncan and Kalu) a 'certain sense of continuity with the traditional past, embedding African Christianity into the deep structure of all African traditional religions' (p. 306). African Instituted Churches are similarly credited with 'addressing the problems raised within the interior of the primal worldview' (p. 329, repeated on p. 307). But in whose eyes were Islam, Christianity and traditional religion discrete faiths? John Peel, writing about nineteenth-century northern Nigeria, has illuminated how Islamic thought shaped Yoruba concepts of God and the afterlife, concepts that later migrated into the lexicon of Christian

missionaries (*Religious encounter and the making of the Yoruba*, Indiana 2002). And Christian ideas could shape apparently primal worldviews, too. As Jeff Peires has shown, Xhosa thinkers during the nineteenth century melded the coming Christian kingdom with their own, indigenous millennium, producing prophets who were at once Christian and traditional in their teleology (*The dead will arise: Nongquawuse and the great Xhosa cattle killing movement of 1856–57*, London 1989). And for southern Africa more generally, David Chidester has illuminated how African thinkers actively appropriated missionaries' theology in order to construct their own, 'traditional' religions (*Savage systems: colonialism and comparative religion in southern Africa*, Charlottesville 1996). African thinkers have long taken Christianity apart, drawing on its intellectual and symbolic resources to reshape their own intellectual traditions. But many of Kalu's contributors view African Christianity as a discrete project from other religious and intellectual systems. They sort different Churches under different chapter headings, and thereby impose on history a precision that Africans outside the academy never experienced.

African Christianity: an African story is a richly instructive resource for scholars, students and inquirers. But, as Bishop Henry Okullu writes, 'everywhere in Africa things are happening. Christians are talking, singing, preaching, writing, arguing, praying, discussing ... This then is African theology' (p. 474). Historians, too, could profitably move outside the churchyard and into the broader field where Africans thought out their own theologies.

SELWYN COLLEGE,
CAMBRIDGE

DEREK R. PETERSON

Retribution, repentance, and reconciliation. Papers read at the 2002 summer meeting and the 2003 winter meeting of the Ecclesiastical History Society. Edited by Kate Cooper and Jeremy Gregory. (Studies in Church History, 40.) Pp. xiv + 384. Woodbridge: Boydell Press (for the Ecclesiastical History Society), 2004. £45. 0 9529733 9 1; 0424 2084

JEH (57) 2006; doi:10.1017/S0022046905246213

This collection of twenty-seven essays, reaching from the Roman empire in the second century to South Africa at the start of the twenty-first, indicates the range of current scholarship on topics related to transgression and restoration, both ecclesiastical and societal. Most of the essays are clearly argued, well documented and indicate the significance of their conclusions. Hugh McLeod's introduction offers an overarching vision of the book's coherence: 'For most of their history, Christians have held the principles of retribution, repentance and reconciliation in balance, insisting on the possibility of reconciliation between God and humanity and between human beings, on repentance as a necessary precondition, and the inevitability of retribution if there is no repentance and reconciliation' (p. 1). Several themes emerge from the collection read as a whole. First, interest continues in the theological understandings and pastoral practices related to the forgiveness of sin. Through many of the essays we continue to learn that it was never simple; in any given era and location, a variety of approaches was present and often competing. As Richard Price asserts in his essay on the early Middle Ages, historical penitential practice belongs 'to a tradition at once richer and more flexible' than one often sees

today (p. 29). Second, various essays show penitential understandings connecting individuals with broader ecclesiastical and/or social issues. Andrew Jotischky's presentation of thirteenth-century theologians' teaching 'that the sacrament of reconciliation is the path to the deeper reconciliation of Christian society within itself' (p. 83) finds echoes in New Zealand where a murdered European missionary and a Maori chieftain unjustly condemned for his death are both named in contemporary prayer as a way to redress the past and address the future (Davidson, p. 329). Third, over the course of centuries, several of the essays show a growing societal mediation of issues earlier handled within ecclesiastical institutions. Peter Van Rooden, for instance, argues that before the end of the eighteenth century 'general sin was an occasion for collective rituals of repentance. Since then, particular sins have been a motive or justification for projects by the state or for the actions of social movements' (p. 239). Overall, this is a stimulating volume on an important topic, showing how scholarship on the history of penitence is assembling the building blocks for new and expanded syntheses.

LANCASTER THEOLOGICAL SEMINARY

ANNE T. THAYER

The sword of the Lord. Military chaplains from the first to the twenty-first century. Edited by Doris L. Bergen. (Critical Problems in History.) Pp xvi + 298 incl. 23 ills. Notre Dame, IN: University of Notre Dame Press, 2004. \$37.50 (paper). 0 268 02175 9; 0 268 02176 7

JEH (57) 2006; doi:10.1017/S002204690525621X

This volume is based on the proceedings of a conference on military chaplains hosted by the University of Notre Dame in 2000. It traces the history of the military chaplaincy in the western world from the first to the twentieth century and incorporates essays on such formative episodes as the Roman empire, the crusades, the English Civil War, the American Civil War, the First and Second World Wars and the Vietnam war. It also includes the reminiscences of two former military chaplains. The essays embody several themes which are succinctly summarised by Doris Bergen in her fine introduction. These include the historical development of the military chaplaincy over time; the often intense personal relationships between chaplains and the military personnel they minister to; the conflicts implicit in serving both military and theological authorities; and the acute ethical and theological dilemmas involved in the conduct of war. This final theme is a particularly sobering aspect of the book. Whilst some strong-minded military chaplains have sought through the ages to prevent illegitimate acts of war, others have been complicit in war crimes. Not only did chaplains with the German forces in the Soviet Union during the Second World War turn a blind eye to the brutal acts of genocide perpetrated by their soldiers, but also their presence at the sites of mass killings gave succour to the guilty. In Vietnam chaplains did little to stop the military excesses of the US forces and were roundly condemned for their insouciant response to the My Lai massacre. During the 'dirty wars' in South America in the 1970s chaplains were deeply implicated in the murder of civilians by tyrannical military dictatorships. One wonders what moral threshold had to be crossed before these 'men of God' preached defiance. This is an original, informative and thought-provoking volume

that will be of as much interest to scholars in the field of war studies as to those in religious studies.

UNIVERSITY OF EDINBURGH

JEREMY A. CRANG

The Cambridge history of early Christian literature. Edited by Frances Young, Lewis Ayres and Andrew Louth (asst ed. Augustine Casiday). Pp. xxvii + 538 incl. chronological table and map. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2004. £80. 0 521 46083 2
JEH (57) 2006; doi:10.1017/S0022046905266216

It is always difficult to review a book such as this. As the editors comment in their preface: 'This is meant to be a reference work, not necessarily a book to be read consecutively from cover to cover' (p. xiii). I have had to do what the editors advise against and what follows can only be a very brief, and no doubt unsatisfactory, sketch of the book's contents.

The editors are keen to make it plain to their readers that the present volume is not a traditional patrology. At a minor level this difference shows itself in the absence of near comprehensive bibliographies on the works of different patristic writers – there are bibliographies, individual ones for chapters devoted to the discussion of individual authors, and general ones for the more discursive chapters (the latter occur at the beginning of the bibliography of each of the three parts of the volume which can initially be a little confusing as there is no prefatory comment highlighting this particular arrangement) but these are highly selective. Footnotes are also kept to the minimum with some chapters having none at all. At a more significant level the volume distinguishes itself from patrologies by its strong commitment to examining early Christian literature within the wider context of the late antique world; and by its interest in issues of a hermeneutical kind (discussions relating to the manner in which texts from this period are to be interpreted and appropriated in the present time). In this respect it is hoped that the volume will become 'a resource for theological thinking that goes beyond the simple repetition of formulae or the use of past labels for present controversies' (p. xiii).

The volume is divided chronologically. Part I deals with the period running from the New Testament to Irenaeus; part II with the third century; and part III with the period running from roughly 300 to the Council of Chalcedon. Each part divides itself up between a section A, which surveys the literature available, both 'orthodox' and 'heretical', and section B, which concerns itself with the broader contextual and hermeneutical questions referred to in the previous paragraph.

Part IA consists of chapters on the apostolic and sub-apostolic writings (Norris), Gnostic literature (Norris), apocryphal writings and Acts of Martyrs (Norris), the Apologists (Norris) and Irenaeus of Lyons (Norris). In section B there is a chapter on social and historical setting (Behr), on the evolving Christian identity (Norris), on Christian teaching (Young) and a final chapter entitled 'Towards a hermeneutic of second-century texts' (Young). Part IIA (the third century) is made up of chapters on the Alexandrians (Heine), the beginnings of Latin Christian literature (Heine), Hippolytus, Pseudo-Hippolytus and the early canons (Heine), Cyprian and Novatian (Heine), the earliest Syriac literature (Brock) and a concluding chapter by Frances Young reviewing what she terms 'the literary culture of the third century'. Section B

has chapters on the social and historical setting (Torjesen), the evolving identity of Christianity in the period (Heine), Christian teaching (Dawson) and a final chapter on the significance of third-century Christian literature (Young). The longest and final section of the book, that concerned with the period running from 300 to 451, is made up of chapters on Christian literature's relationship to classical culture (Young), Arnobius and Lactantius (Nicholson), Eusebius and the birth of church history (Louth), Athanasius and Didymus (Louth), Cyril of Jerusalem and Epiphanius (Louth), the Cappadocians (Louth), Hilary, Victorinus, Ambrosiaster and Ambrose (Hunter), Jerome and Rufinus (Vessey), Augustine (Chadwick), John Chrysostom and the Antiochene School to Theodoret of Cyrrhus (Louth), hagiography (Louth), Ephrem and the Syriac tradition (Brock), the literature of the monastic movement (Louth), texts by and about women (Harvey) and conciliar records and canons (Louth). Section B again has chapters on social and historical setting (Markus), articulating identity (Ayres), Christian teaching (Young) and a final retrospect entitled 'Interpretation and appropriation' (Young).

This is an excellent volume. As its editors intended it effectively combines the best aspects of an old-fashioned patrology, and in an uncluttered and clear way (Heine's discussion of the Hippolytan problem and Louth's careful exposition of the difficulties pertaining to the ending of Eusebius' *Ecclesiastical history*, are but two examples of helpful technical discussions), with often illuminating and useful discussion of the context, conceived broadly as Christian, pagan and Jewish, in which early Christian literature emerged (in this respect it is a pity that the concern with placing Christian literature in a non-Christian as well as Christian context was not reflected in the chronological table of events at the beginning of the volume – here only matters Christian are referred to). And in doing so, it succeeds, at least in part, in telling a story, in broad terms the story of the growing sophistication of Christian literary expression, at one and the same time increasingly reflective of the literary culture of its broader pagan environment, but also in some senses consistently distinctive, not least in its insistence on the primacy of the Christian Bible over all other literary productions.

Many of the chapters succeed admirably in conveying something of individuality either of the author or the period being discussed. Norris gives an excellent account of Christian identity in the second century, cleverly avoiding an account of the Church at this time as irrevocably diverse, preferring to describe it as embodying a quarrelsome cohesiveness. Karen Torjesen gives an admirable account of developments in the third century, showing how the Church, to a much greater extent than was the case in the previous century, began to reflect aspects of Roman civic and social life, developments which, in her opinion, had a deleterious effect upon the place of women in the Church, particularly within its leadership. R. A. Markus provides a typically lucid piece in which he attempts to show, amongst other things, how it was that the Church of the fourth and fifth centuries sought through the writing of church history and the creation of the cult of the martyrs to come to terms with its new position of wealth and influence. And Ayres presents a very helpful and brilliantly conceived chapter (in part a summary of his most recent book on Nicea and its legacies) on the Trinitarian and Christological controversies of the fourth and fifth centuries, highlighting in particular what he argues was the gradual formation of a pro-Nicene culture. On authors Dawson is strikingly good on Origen, noting that the displacement of culturally authoritative Greek texts by the Christian

Bible, a process in which Origen was intimately involved, was not a struggle between Christian faith and Greek culture but 'instead a contest fought out by members of Greek culture over competing constructions of their identity'. Nicholson is excellent at showing up the change in attitudes to paganism that arrives with Arnobius, and Vessey is stimulating on the way in which Jerome sought to forge a new biblical literary *persona*.

Some might complain that too often in some of the more discursive chapters in section B not enough effort is made to integrate the literature into the account of the broader context. That may be so on occasion. But in the end the combination of literature guides, however sophisticatedly put together, and more contextually based chapters, works. And given the sympathetically critical manner in which all of the contributors write, the point of Frances Young's more hermeneutically based chapters becomes clearer. The Fathers may hail from a world that is partly strange and alien but there is too much of genuine value and fascination within them to allow them to be no more than ancient literary artefacts.

PETERHOUSE,
CAMBRIDGE

JAMES CARLETON PAGET

Friendship. A way of interpreting Christian love. A study of western culture tradition. By Liz Carmichael. Pp. 250. London–New York: T & T Clark, 2004. £14.99 (paper).
o 567 08082 X, o 567 08072 2
JEH (57) 2006; doi:10.1017/S0022046905276212

Liz Carmichael's project in this book is to rehabilitate the category of friendship as the main stage for the acting-out of Christian love. Her method is to set out, for the most part chronologically, as an historical narrative, philosophical and theological expositions of friendship, from Homer to living theologians such as Elisabeth Schüssler Fiorenza. Her intention is to promote friendship as a practical, achievable means of incarnating Jesus' command to love, accessible to all, and able to be manifest in a variety of ways. Discussions of friendship have been more popular at some periods than others. Classical, pagan writers found it a useful concept for reflection. Their texts, such as Plato's *Symposium*, Aristotle's *Eudemian* and *Nicomachean ethics* and Cicero's *De amicitia* set out many of the key points for discussion that recur again and again, such as whether it is necessary to love oneself in order to love another, whether friendship needs to be relational, whether it requires equality, whether it can ever be truly disinterested, and whether being a friend to all can have any meaning. This classical influence was given new life in the Middle Ages, particularly with the 'rediscovery' of Aristotle, and it continues to set parameters for debate. Carmichael takes us through medieval considerations of friendship, which bring grace into the discussions, focusing particularly on Augustine, Aelred of Rievaulx (whose strikingly 'modern' treatises on friendship had little circulation in the Middle Ages and only came to prominence in the later twentieth century) and Thomas Aquinas. From Thomas we move to the Anglican divines, *via* an interesting sermon by John Henry Newman, and finally to a wide range of twentieth-century theologians, encompassing liberation, queer and feminist thinking. One of the difficulties for an English writer on friendship is the scarcity of words that our language has for love. A number of the thinkers that Carmichael quotes are

struggling with translation from Greek (*agape*, *eros* and *philia*) or Latin (*dilectio*, *amor*, *caritas*, *amicitia* and others). In English, 'love' can encompass all of these, making the task of the philosopher precarious. It is not always clear just how much of the debate is the result of different translation choices and understanding of just what 'love' can mean, in Scripture and in life. Carmichael is thus forced, at times, to integrate discussions of love and friendship without it always being evident why one and not the other is preferred. It is not possible to read this compilation of writings on love and not be struck by how many of them were written by celibate men and it is something of a pity that Carmichael does not analyse more closely the status of her writers and correlate them with their views. Of course, no one status can have a monopoly on the theology of love, but just as she notes the lesbian and gay writers who wish to replace marriage with friendship as the fundamental relationship of concern to the Church, so it would be intriguing to have seen whether and how marital and sexual status affects the position of others on questions of love and friendship. Nevertheless, Carmichael's comprehensive and careful survey has given those who follow in her wake the wherewithal to do more, and her book is certain to remind every reader of the pleasures of friendship.

HARRIS MANCHESTER COLLEGE,
OXFORD

LESLEY SMITH

The Church and Mary. Papers read at the 2001 summer meeting and the 2002 winter meeting of the Ecclesiastical History Society. Edited by R. N. Swanson. (Studies in Church History, 39.) Pp. xvi + 376. Woodbridge: Boydell Press (for the Ecclesiastical History Society), 2004. £45. 0 9546809 0 1; 0424 2084
JEH (57) 2006; doi:10.1017/S0022046905286219

The collection of twenty-eight articles presented at a conference of the Ecclesiastical Society contains much interesting material about the cult of the Virgin Mary. It is a collection of articles by twenty-eight scholars, writing from varied perspectives, but nevertheless it makes an unexpectedly cohesive and weighty book, illuminating aspects of devotion to Mary, the mother of Jesus Christ, from late antiquity to the present day. Seven essays concentrate on the veneration shown to Mary in Eastern Orthodoxy, from Dr Cameron's illuminating piece on the cult of the Virgin in late antiquity, to Kallirroe Linardou's presentation of a twelfth-century sermon which depicts Mary as 'the Couch of Solomon'; there are reproductions of the manuscript miniatures to which he refers. This section includes a stimulating paper by Mary Cunningham on use of the Old Testament images in relation to Mary in Byzantine hymnography; Richard Price has examined the depth of continued devotion to Mary in the Nestorian controversy. The remainder of the essays are concerned with devotion to Mary in the west, and begin in the Middle Ages with a lively account by Henry Mayr Harting of the much-discussed subject of the Assumption of Mary. Five more essays look at aspects of the cult of Mary in the Middle Ages. These are followed by five papers about aspects of Marian devotion at the Reformation and the book concludes with nine essays from more recent points of view, the last of which, by Mary Camilla Wright, is about contemporary Ethiopian devotion to Mary. It is inevitable in a review of a book of this kind that one can mention only a few out of this wealth of papers, each of which deserves comment and is well worth reading. These are all scholarly but readable papers which have a wide interdisciplinary as

well as an ecumenical scope, intermingling theology, liturgy, music, gender studies, literature, social anthropology, art and history. The cult of Mary provided an excellent theme for a conference and has made a valuable book, illustrating both the wealth of recent scholarly work on Mary and suggesting the continuing centrality of her cult among Christians.

OXFORD

BENEDICTA WARD

Face to face. Portraits of the divine in early Christianity. By Robin Margaret Jensen.

Pp. xviii + 234 incl. 102 figs. Minneapolis, MN: Fortress Press, 2005(4). \$20 (paper). 0 8006 6092 7; 0 8006 3678 3

JEH (57) 2006; doi:10.1017/S0022046905296215

Until the late 1970s the study of early Christian art was dominated by largely formalist art historians and in particular the students of the specialist German discipline of *christliche Archäologie*. Since the 1980s, this strand of scholarship has been supplemented by the specific contribution of theologians, using the archaeological archive, thinking visually and matching the rich remains of material culture against a deep command of the prolific and complex survivals of patristic writings. I think specially of work by the likes of Mary Charles Murray, Paul Corby Finney, Elizabeth Malbon, L. Michael White, Allen Brent and Robin Jensen – many of whom were trained professionally as theologians before they turned to material culture and most of whom have worked in divinity faculties rather than art history departments. Needless to say, this project has seen a substantive improvement in the field. In her new book, Jensen's second on the theme of early Christian art, she tackles the fundamental question of Christian portraiture – one which has become of special importance recently with the rise of studies of the icon following the spate of recent discoveries (and first publications) of numerous early Christian and medieval icons since the 1970s. The core of Jensen's book is a substantial reading of a wide range of theological texts in chapters iii and iv on issues such as aniconism, idolatry and anthropomorphism in relation to images – pagan, heretical and orthodox, depending on the points of views of the writers. This is followed by an exemplification of the range of image types of Jesus (in chapter v) and the saints (chapter vi). Jensen's summaries of the current position (in numerous vexed topics) are always up to date, though she has not found evidence to prove that a disposition to Arian views (for instance) can ever be certainly detected on the basis of image-choices made by people known or thought to be Arian. One aspect that is particularly successful is Jensen's setting of the context of Christian art in a firmly and widely exemplified Greco-Roman setting, rather than a purely Jewish-Christian one (including such issues as non-Jewish precedents for Christian aniconism). The book is well produced and for the most part well illustrated, though the copyeditor has let the odd loose statement stand: the very first sentence tells us that 'for the most part, existing examples of Christian visual art come from Rome', which is only true if one supplies 'early' to 'Christian'; and it is not true (on p. 36) that the Elder Pliny devoted 'nearly an entire volume of his *Natural History* to the painting of portraits', though this statement could stand if it just said 'to painting'.

CORPUS CHRISTI COLLEGE,
OXFORD

JAS' ELSNER

Leaving the fold. Apostates and defectors in antiquity. By Stephen G. Wilson. Pp. xvii + 158.

Minneapolis, MN: Fortress Press, 2004. £25. 0 8006 3675 9

JEH (57) 2006; doi:10.1017/S002204690530621X

The core of this book consists of chapters on defections from Judaism, Christianity and paganism from (roughly) the first century BCE to the time of the emperor Julian. The chapter on Judaism is the longest, reviewing the evidence of Philo, Josephus and other literary sources for Jewish apostasy, and of inscriptions which refer (though uncertainly in most cases) to Jews who abandoned their faith and assimilated to Greco-Roman religion and culture. Paganism is the subject of the shortest chapter, concerned mostly with defection from philosophical schools rather than with conversion to Judaism or Christianity. The Christian sources considered are mainly the New Testament and early documents such as the *Letter of Barnabas* which adopt a polemical stance towards those they allege to be apostates (who would not necessarily have regarded themselves as such); but Cyprian's *De lapsis*, that much-studied source for Christian apostasy under persecution, is also included. Assimilation to the dominant culture is the key to Wilson's approach, discussed most fully in a conclusion which draws on the work of John Barclay on assimilation among Jews (strictly, assimilation, acculturation and accommodation, which are distinguished), as well as on sociological studies of modern religious apostasy which range more widely over the motives of defectors. Wilson allows that assimilation is less able to account for Christian apostasy, since Christians were seldom as clearly distinguished as Jews from their surrounding culture (pp. 70, 114); but despite this caveat, he comes close on occasions to suggesting that all apostasy – not all of which was voluntary – was a form of assimilation (for example pp. 22, 77), and offers less space than could be desired to intellectual or other more personal motives for leaving a religious group (though see pp. 30–1, 44–8 on doubts about providence in the Jewish evidence, and more generally pp. 128–9). His brief comments on the ex-Christians mentioned by Pliny (pp. 81–2) tacitly assume that these were cases of (re)assimilation to paganism in response to persecution. Older treatments of their possible religious and ethical motives for abandoning their faith (for example. W. Telfer, *The forgiveness of sins: an essay in the history of Christian doctrine and practice*, London 1959, pp. 31–2) seem to me to be more sensitive, which is a pity, for nowhere besides Pliny's letter do we encounter such clear evidence for early Christians who had (apparently without rancour) severed their connections with the Church. None the less *Leaving the fold* is a readable and valuable pioneering study and a useful introductory guide to the sources.

LEYTON

GRAHAM GOULD

The expansion of Christianity. A gazetteer of its first three centuries. By Roderic L. Mullen.

(Supplements to *Vigiliae Christianae*. Texts and Studies of Early Christian Life and Language, 69.) Pp. x + 412 incl. 11 maps. Leiden–Boston: Brill, 2004. €109. 90 04 13135 3; 0920 623X

JEH (57) 2006; doi:10.1017/S0022046905316216

R. L. Mullen has compiled a clear and useful reference book for the historian of the early Church. He has reworked the fourth part of A. Harnack's *Die Mission und Ausbreitung des Christentums in den ersten drei Jahrhunderten* (4th and final edition, 1924),

documenting the literary, inscriptional and archaeological evidence for the geographic diffusion of Christianity down to c. 325 CE. The work is divided into three parts (Christian communities in Asia, Europe and Africa) and each section, in turn, is further subdivided into regions or provinces. After a brief discussion of the evidence for a given region, Mullen provides an alphabetically-arranged list of documentable sites. Site names are printed in bold and receive individual entries in which a variety of evidence for Christian presence is detailed. A list of possible early Christian sites for each region, usually those with documentation for the second and third quarters of the fourth century, rounds out each section. Harnack has indisputably been improved on several accounts. Mullen has not only detailed more extensively the localities where Christian communities can (most likely) be shown to have existed, but he has also taken into consideration the new sources that have come to light in the last eight decades, particularly inscriptions and papyri. While his inventory is not complete (cf. Eusebius, *Proof of the Gospel* 3.2 and 7.2 for additional evidence on Bethlehem), to date this is the fullest list. This *Gazetteer* provides, at the same time, a more static catalogue of early Christianity's geographic presence than Harnack's work. The first three parts of *Mission und Ausbreitung* narrated the factors contributing to and hindering Christianity's expansion in the ancient world and this concern shaped the presentation of material in its fourth part – early Christian sites were not only catalogued, but also located within the unfolding story of Christianity's diffusion in that region. This large and complex narrative of the geographic and demographic expansion of Christianity is only dimly discerned in Mullen's work. The eleven maps at the end of the *Gazetteer* are certainly useful, but only for conveying the state of affairs c. 325. The work closes with an index of sites and an ample bibliography, though I detected some oversights in the latter: Migne's text of Origen's *Commentary on Romans* has been superseded by C. P. Bammel's critical edition; the edition of Eusebius' *Ecclesiastical history* is found in the GCS; and *De vita Gregorii Thaumaturgi* was authored by another Gregory (the bishop of Nyssa). Typographical errors are found at p. 23: 'Jeusalem'; p. 51: 'Ecclesiastical history'; p. 234, 'mosiacs'. Minor blemishes aside, this reference work is highly recommended, an eminently useful and important companion to the *Barrington atlas of the Greek and Roman world*.

UNIVERSITY OF NOTRE DAME

PETER MARTENS

Border lines. The partition of Judaeo-Christianity. By Daniel Boyarin. (Divinations: Rereading Late Ancient Religion.) Pp. xvii + 374. Philadelphia: University of Pennsylvania Press, 2004. \$38.50. 0 8122 3764 1
JEH (57) 2006; doi:10.1017/S0022046905326212

Boyarin lays down a significant challenge to the traditional understanding of the relationship between Judaism and Christianity in the first centuries of the Common Era. In fact, for Boyarin, the very language we use, 'Judaism' and 'Christianity', needs revising, as it implies two clearly defined entities, whereas he claims 'Judeo-Christianity' would more accurately define the religious heritage of these early centuries. His argument is split in to three parts. Firstly he deals with the role of heresiology as the favoured model for both Jews and Christians in their self-definition, beginning in the second century and continuing into the fourth. These 'borders', according to the Boyarin, were imposed on a landscape that naturally defied

being separated. In other words heresiology was not a result of the ‘parting of the ways’ but a factor that produced that parting. Secondly, Boyarin discusses the particular issue of Logos theology and its transformation from a commonly held (by Jews and Christians) doctrine of God to the essence of a theological difference between Jews and Christians. Finally, Boyarin deals with what happens in the two entities (Judaism and Christianity), with Christianity defining itself as a religion and the rabbis choosing the path of ethnicity rather than religion. Throughout the historical discussions Boyarin deals with many important texts, for example, m. *Avoth* 1.1ff., the Javneh traditions of the Talmudim, the prologue to John’s Gospel, Justin Martyr’s *Dialogue*, and provides innovative readings of them. He also seeks to shed fresh light on the age-old question of the relationship between the Targumic *memra* and Logos theology, concluding that they are very similar in content. Boyarin thus posits that binitarian theology was common to all and thus in respect to the doctrine of God there was essentially no difference between the Jews and Christians in the early centuries of the Common Era. Boyarin describes the work as revisionist in nature, and sees rabbinic literature as useful for history, mainly at the point of redaction, explaining rabbinic historiography as ‘mythopoetic’. There is much of interest in *Border lines*, as well as much with which to disagree; and as a result it should promote fresh and lively debate amongst those studying Judaism and Christianity in late antiquity. With this in mind it is a shame that there are mistakes in referencing. From the very small selection of references checked two were wrong (p. 321, n.138, A. Yadin ‘The hammer and the rock’, is in *Jewish Studies Quarterly* x [2003], not ix [2002] as printed; also J. L. Rubenstein ‘Thematization’, is in the *Journal of Jewish Studies* liv [2003], not liii [2002]). There is also inconsistency in referencing for the *Yerushalmi*. Sometimes Boyarin gives the chapter, halacha, page and column (as is customary), whereas on numerous occasions he gives just the page and column reference.

CENTRE FOR HEBREW AND JEWISH STUDIES,
OXFORD

TIMOTHY EDWARDS

The early Christians in Ephesus from Paul to Ignatius. By Paul Trebilco. (Wissenschaftliche Untersuchungen zum Neuen Testament, 166.) Pp. xxiii + 833. Tübingen: Mohr Siebeck, 2004. €149. 3 16 148271 9; 0512 1604
JEH (57) 2006; doi:10.1017/S0022046905336219

In this very long book, Paul Trebilco analyses all the sources pertaining to the history and development of early Christianity in Ephesus. After a helpful introductory chapter in which he presents an account of the history and character of the city, Trebilco goes on to discuss material from Paul’s letters (interestingly, he holds Ephesians not to be relevant to his subject – it is in his opinion pseudonymous and was not originally addressed to the Ephesians), including the Pastorals (pseudonymous but addressed to Ephesian Christians), Acts, the Johannine Epistles, Revelation, in particular the first of the seer’s letters (Revelation ii. 1–7), and Ignatius’ letter to the Ephesians. Trebilco argues that Pauline Christianity was well-established in the city by about CE 55 and early on evinced diversity. A still more diverse picture is seen with the arrival of Johannine Christians of various strains and there is evidence of growing disputation amongst Christians in the Pastorals, the

Johannine Epistles and Revelation. Trebilco rejects the well known thesis that Pauline Christianity was taken over or merged with Johannine Christianity by the end of the century, preferring to see Ephesian Christianity as made up of different groups living together in a fractuous form of unity (given these conclusions, it was a pity that Trebilco did not make more use of Peter Lampe's work on the early Christian community in Rome which, according to the latter, evidenced a similarly loose form of unity).

While there is much useful material in this book, it is overly long, particularly given the lack of any really substantive evidence on the subject under discussion. We cannot be certain what early Christian texts are in fact Ephesian in origin (for instance, many would dispute that the Pastorals and the Johannine Epistles are Ephesian in origin and yet discussion of their content takes up a large part of the book), and what we can in fact deduce from established Ephesian material is by no means clear. Trebilco is sufficiently honest to accept that much of what he has to say is conjectural. Given this and other things, the editor of the WUNT series should have recommended that the book be thoroughly revised before publication (there is a lot of repetition). A final product half the size could have been written to equal effect.

PETERHOUSE,
CAMBRIDGE

JAMES CARLETON PAGET

Papias of Hierapolis, *Esposizione degli oracoli del signore. I frammenti*. Edited by Enrico Norelli. (Lecture Christiane del Primo Millennio, 36.) Pp. 600. Milan: Paoline, 2005. €34. 88 315 2752 5
JEH (57) 2006; doi:10.1017/S0022046905346215

Enrico Norelli of the University of Geneva has published widely on second-century topics; previous works include a history of Greek and Latin Christian literature as well as books on the *Epistle to Diognetus* and the *Ascension of Isaiah*. His newest volume, of nearly 600 pages, represents the most substantial and up-to-date monograph on the fragments of Papias available in any language, surpassing previous studies by U. H. J. Körtner (1983, 1998) and J. Kürzinger (1983). A 170-page introduction outlines the method of identifying the fragments and establishes what can be known of Papias of Hierapolis, his five-volume *Exegesis of the words of the lord* (dated here to c. AD 115) and its significance – as the blurb puts it, ‘an irreplaceable source of information on the practices and doctrines of the earliest Christian circles, whose oral tradition retained a connection with the first generation of believers in Jesus’ (cf. pp. 112, 153). A most helpful bibliography concludes this section. The bulk of the book (about 320 pp.) then proceeds to offer the original text (in transliteration for Syriac, Arabic and Armenian sources), translation (occasionally inaccurate, as in no. 24), introductory notes and commentary for each of twenty-six fragments. While endorsing many of the editorial principles of Körtner and Kürzinger, Norelli deliberately favours the latter’s tendency towards a more generous inventory. He has chosen to present all explicit ancient testimonies, regardless of authenticity or first-hand knowledge of Papias’s work. Two items (nos 21–2 in Syriac from John of Dara) have not been previously included in editions of Papias, while at least two others that were widely accepted by previous scholars are here plausibly shown to have nothing to do with him. Thus for no. 23 (from MS Bodleian 2397) Norelli accepts Lightfoot’s

demonstration that the attribution to 'Papias' in the scribal superscript is not pseudonymous, but designates an eleventh-century Italian lexicographer of that name (pp. 479–81, *pace* Körtner); similarly the Armenian fragment, no. 25, accepted by F. Siegert and Kürzinger, is here reasonably attributed to the fourth-century Alexandrian geographer Pappos. The commentary on these texts is consistently informative and up-to-date; this reviewer found particularly illuminating the extensive treatment of two *loci classici* represented in fragments 1 (Irenaeus, *Haer.* 5.33.3–4) and 5 (Eusebius, *Historia ecclesiastica* 3.39.1–17), as well as the exposition of fragment 12 on Papias's interest in angelology (from Andrew of Caesarea's commentary on Revelation xii.34). Five appendices provide (1) a comparative table of the numbering of fragments in the editions since Routh (1846); (2) a critique of attempts to identify additional fragments, including C. E. Hill (Papias on John and Luke), R. J. Bauckham (the Muratorian fragment as dependent on Papias) and J. Haussleiter (Papias as used by Victorinus of Pettau); (3) the traditions variously attributed by Irenaeus to 'presbyters' along with (4) the identity of the *presbyteroi* in Papias's own account (fragment 5, Eusebius, *HE* 3.39.3–4); and finally (5) the meaning of *herméneia* and cognate terms in Eusebius' passages about Papias (viz., both translation and redaction). The volume concludes with a useful but idiosyncratic collection of indices and (in the best tradition of Romance scholarship) a table of contents at the very end. All in all, Norelli has produced what is clearly a new landmark study for future work on Papias. A translation or, better still, a fresh monograph for an English-speaking readership seems an urgent *desideratum*.

FACULTY OF DIVINITY,
UNIVERSITY OF CAMBRIDGE

M. BOCKMUEHL

The epistle of Barnabas and the Deuteronomic tradition. Polemics, paraenesis, and the legacy of the Golden-Calf incident. By James N. Rhodes. (Wissenschaftliche Untersuchungen zum Neuen Testament. Ser. 2, 188.) Pp. xii + 271. Tübingen: Mohr Siebeck, 2004. €54 (paper). 3 16 148377 4; 0340 9570
JEH (57) 2006; doi:10.1017/S0022046905356211

In this stimulating monograph, James N. Rhodes presents his readers with a genuinely innovative reading of that most curious of early Christian documents, the *Epistle of Barnabas*. In brief his argument runs something like this. Scholars who read *Barnabas* as essentially a polemic against Judaism have misread the epistle. This misreading arises out of a failure to take seriously enough the theological *leitmotiv* behind the work (a radicalised form of Deuteronomism) and its essentially ethical content. '*Barnabas*' damning *exposé* of Israel's failings is intended primarily to exhort his own audience to covenant fidelity and eschatological perseverance.' So, for instance, *Barnabas*'s account of Israel's worship of the Golden Calf in chapter 6, a pivotal chapter of the epistle in Rhodes's view, acts as a warning to his addressees of what might happen to them if they act in a dangerously sinful manner (Rhodes's interpretation is in part dependent upon his own reading of the textually disputed 4.6b–7). In his discussion of this chapter, and more generally, Rhodes makes much of the fact that in his opinion *Barnabas* does not regard the worship of the Golden Calf as leading to the end of the covenant relationship with Israel

and that when the author seems to assert such a thing at 4.8 and 14.4 this is no more than rhetorical hyperbole. The real end of that relationship comes when the Jews kill Christ. Their rejection is clearly manifest in the destruction of the temple in CE 70, an event which, Rhodes argues, plays a greater part in the epistle than people have previously thought and allows Rhodes to attribute to *Barnabas* a form of modified supersessionism. Rhodes's interpretation, which, as he is the first to admit, owes something to the work of A. Oepke, is further supported by an attempt to show that *Barnabas*'s language and theological reasoning are influenced by the book of Deuteronomy which posits the conditionality of the covenant relationship and God's willingness to end it on account of Israel's sin (*Barnabas*'s view is radicalised Deuteronomism because unlike the Deuteronomists, he sees Israel's covenantal relationship as over); by the evidence of such a Deuteronomistic way of thinking in Jewish and Christian writings roughly contemporaneous with *Barnabas*; and by the implications of the opening and closing chapters of the epistle with their strongly ethical content (see especially 1.7 and 21.4). For Rhodes the penning of a document with such Deuteronomistically-oriented intent was occasioned by the decision of Hadrian to build a temple to Jupiter on the site of the Jewish temple (his reading of the much controverted passage of 16.3–4), an event, so Rhodes claims, that 'would have evoked renewed reflection on the fate of Israel and the implications of such events for Christians' (p. 177). Such a reading of *Barnabas* forces us, according to Rhodes, to reappraise the traditional view of him as an unremittingly anti-Jewish writer: 'he did not write to raise a triumphalist cry; he wrote to spare his spiritual sons and daughters a similar fate (to the Jews understood)' (p. 205).

Rhodes has argued his case with great care, clarity and originality. The strengths of his thesis are many: he provides an intriguing solution to one of the major problems in the history of the interpretation of the epistle, namely the relationship between the epistle's ethical opening and ending, and its polemical core; he shows up, in a distinctive way, the covenantal structure of the work and its broadly covenantal concerns, and thereby gives a sufficient place to the author's ethical, and by extension, his eschatological emphasis (in many other readings of the epistle its ethical content is seen as secondary to the purpose of the letter, a kind of compensatory add-on resulting from the letter's harsh attack upon Jewish law); he makes a good case for seeing *Barnabas*'s interpretation of the incident of the Golden Calf as paradigmatic for the relationship of God to Israel rather than the point at which the covenant was lost, and thereby seeks to endorse a more supersessionist understanding of the epistle than has customarily been the case. And finally, of all those scholars who interpret 16.3–4 as referring to a mooted building of Jupiter's temple in Jerusalem by Hadrian, Rhodes's overall understanding of the epistle allows him to present the most integrated account of why that event might have led to the writing of a letter like *Barnabas*.

Inevitably, I have some reservations. While I am certain that Rhodes has made as good an attempt as any interpreter of the epistle to place ethical concerns at the centre of the author's purpose, I wonder whether his thesis takes sufficient account of the author's attack upon Jewish interpretation of circumcision, the food laws, sabbath and sacrifice, particularly in the light of a passage like 3.6 which warns against being 'shipwrecked by becoming proselytes to their law'? A reading of these attacks, as well as an appreciation of the author's strong interest in appropriating covenantal status for the Christians (see especially chapters 13 and 14) against the

Deuteronomistic setting outlined by Rhodes is not always convincing. That is not to say that Rhodes's interpretation does not show up significant weaknesses in the straightforwardly polemical view of the epistle's purpose, but rather that his interpretation does not take account of all aspects of its content, some of which are clearly polemical. Related to this point is the fact that not all of *Barnabas's* positive affirmations about Christians are laced with a corresponding warning to Christians to beware of the negative consequences of sinful behaviour. So, for instance, chapter 6 of *Barnabas* may be said to contrast in content and tone with what we find in Hebrews 3.7–11 and 4.1–11, passages which Rhodes sees as illuminating the background of the epistle (in the latter the warning against the possibility of failing to enter the promised land is far stronger than what we find in *Barnabas* 6). And I still cannot help asking myself why, if 16.3–4 refers to what Rhodes believes it does, the author has not made more of it than he in fact does. Related to this is the fact that the Bar Cochba revolt, insofar as we know, stimulated a number of responses on the part of Christians, but in judging from the work of Justin or the author of the *Apocalypse of Peter*, the latter strangely absent from Rhodes's reflections, that reaction was quite other than the one proposed for *Barnabas* in this monograph.

Much more could be said. But the final note must be one of gratitude to James N. Rhodes for providing an original and challenging interpretation of this problematic and difficult piece of early Christian literature.

PETERHOUSE,
CAMBRIDGE

JAMES CARLETON PAGET

Irenäus als johanneischer Theologe. Studien zur Schriftauslegung bei Irenäus von Lyon. By Bernhard Mutschler. (Studien und Texte zu Antike und Christentum, 21.) Pp. xv + 334 incl. 44 tables and 19 graphs. Tübingen: Mohr Siebeck, 2004. €59 (paper). 3 16 148284 0; 1436 3003
JEH (57) 2006; doi:10.1017/S0022046905366218

Beginning from the strong scholarly tradition which links New Testament and patristic study, this book is a gold-mine of detailed tabulation and discovery. Irenaeus concentrates on the prologue of John (p. 151) and shows evidence of oral Asia Minor tradition which has appropriated Johannine themes. Compared with Clement of Alexandria, there is less Pauline material (p. 101) and little on the important chapter, John xvii (p. 151). While Irenaeus draws heavily on the Pauline Epistles (1 Corinthians, Romans, Ephesians) and the Gospels of Matthew and Luke, John holds the decisive place in his thought. From the Johannine prologue, he draws his Christology, cosmology, doctrine of God and soteriology. John is the 'disciple of the lord' whose writings preserve for the Church the backbone of a theology of saving history: 'das Rückgrat seiner biblisch-heilsgeschichtlichen und anti-gnostischen Theologie' (p. 275). This excellent work could be enlarged with a recognition that Irenaeus takes the shape of his theology from the kerygma which he, in his Demonstration, sets out.

LA TROBE UNIVERSITY

ERIC OSBORN

Making martyrs in late antiquity. By Lucy Grig. Pp. xiii + 207 incl. 6 figs + 10 plates.

London: Duckworth, 2004. £45. 0 7156 3285 X

JEH (57) 2006; doi:10.1017/S0022046905376214

In 1921 Hippolyte Delehaye published *Les Passions des martyrs et les genres littéraires*, a work of fundamental importance that attempted to disentangle the genuine and historically true accounts of martyrdom, such as that of Cyprian of Carthage, from the panegyrics and epic accounts of martyrdom provided by the church Fathers of the late fourth and fifth centuries. The present author, who is lecturer in classics at Edinburgh University, is less ambitious. While not neglecting the problem of the historical truth of the martyrdoms she is more concerned with the effect of the accounts on the development of western Christianity in the fourth century.

A brief history of martyrdom features Perpetua and Felicitas, martyred in March 207 in the amphitheatre of Carthage, and Cyprian executed in the same city on 13 September 258, in the persecution by the Emperor Valerian. Some of these early martyrdoms were public spectacles but in others Christians such as Euplus the deacon of Catania rushed to their deaths carrying the Scriptures and demanded execution. There follows a chapter on martyrs and spectacles in the north African liturgy. Rightly for this reviewer, she regards the *acta* of the Abitinian martyrs as near contemporary with the Great Persecution. The Donatist martyr Bishop Marculus, however, is treated with more reserve. In view of the excavation of the large church and tombs of martyrs dedicated to him at Ksar el Kelb in southern Numidia, this is not necessary, while the discovery of rounded stones bearing the remains of 'martyrs' and the date of their deaths at the foot of the cliff at the Djebel Nif en Nisr (Louis Leschi, *Revue afriaine* [1941], 31–6) suggests that Marculus' 'recorded execution as being thrown over a cliff' was not impossible. Other accounts of famous martyrs in Rome which she features, such as Agnes and Laurence, are less controversial. The *acta* of the martyrs were being read in Augustine's time at Carthage, often to the boredom of youthful audiences. More important for the spread and consolidation of Christianity was the cult of relics and the miracles attributed to them.

The relic symbolised the martyr, representing the resurrection of his body and soul and bestowing the same benefit on any who possessed or touched a relic. Here, perhaps, some discussion of the immensely important cult of martyrdom and martyrs' relics in southern Numidia would have been relevant. Pots containing relics were coated year after year with heavy durable white plaster and eucharists were celebrated around them. But from Rouen to the see of Victricius to Uzalis in proconsular Africa where bishop Evodius, Augustine's friend, celebrated the cult of St Stephen, practices relating to the relics of martyrs spread throughout the west. Vigilantius, the Gallic presbyter, protested in vain.

The late fourth century also intensified the glorification of the heroes of the Great Persecution by Prudentius in his *Peristephanon* where he describes, with exaggerated horror, their trials, tortures and deaths. These, together with representation in the Roman catacombs of executions, kept alive for the Christians the vision of past glories a century after the persecution had ended. At the same time, others such as Paulinus of Nola were emphasising that martyrdom need not imply death. Felix, Paulinus' 'special friend' did not die in the Decian persecution. He served, as the author points out, 'as a constructed saint for a new Christian elite of ascetic man in clerical office'.

This comment is one of the most useful statements in a well-researched and scholarly book. Though there are some gaps in the record, the author has written a valuable account of martyrs and martyrdom in the early Church. Rightly, she has emphasised the importance of suffering in constructing a Christian identity, and the power of the martyrs in developing western Christianity. While not superseding Delehay, her study is a valuable contribution to an important aspect of Christian life in the west during the fourth century.

GONVILLE AND CAIUS COLLEGE,
CAMBRIDGE

†W. H. C. FREND

Nicaea and its legacy. An approach to fourth-century Trinitarian theology. By Lewis Ayres.

Pp. xvi + 475. Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2004. £75. 0 19 875506 6

JEH (57) 2006; doi:10.1017/S0022046905386210

In recent years revisionist scholarship on the fourth-century Trinitarian controversy has largely aimed its critical attention at reductionistic heresiological classifications such as 'Arian' and 'Neo-Arian'. Ayres's *Nicaea and its legacy* furthers these re-readings by demonstrating additional complexities within the fourth-century conflict, including the diversity amidst unity of 'pro-Nicene' theologies and the disputability of commonly assumed distinctions between eastern and western theologies of this period. Section I of Ayres's book narrates the Trinitarian controversy until the year 350. The author commences by reflecting on the most appropriate starting point for this story. Rather than locating it in the historical events surrounding Arius and Alexander of Alexandria – the standard approach, which often assumes a pre-existing consensus challenged by Arius and his devotees – Ayres suggests that the controversy is best understood when one begins with the variety of theological trajectories tensely coexisting in the early fourth-century Church. Then, after delineating four such trajectories, Ayres portrays the events between 325 and 350 as a severe and sustained dispute between these perspectives catalysed by the events surrounding Arius and Alexander. Section II continues the story from the 350s to the end of the century, chronicling the genesis of explicitly anti-Nicene theologies and the subsequent progressive rise and coalescence of various theologies which may be characterised as 'pro-Nicene'. Particularly informative in this section are Ayres's contextualised analyses of the Trinitarian theology of figures seldom addressed in such surveys (for example Ephrem the Syrian and Cyril of Jerusalem). Instead of positing a decisive end to the story with Theodosius' legislation and the Council of Constantinople in 381, Ayres concludes the narrative of section II by highlighting several contexts in which strife continued well into the fifth century. The third and final section of Ayres's study seeks a greater appreciation of pro-Nicene culture through an examination of the shared theological 'strategies' which unite its members. He suggests that the heart of pro-Nicene theology is a shared manner of thinking about divine simplicity and hypostatic distinction, while also demonstrating how common epistemological, cosmological, anthropological, Christological and soteriological emphases both arose from this theological core and contributed to its distinctive shape. These shared pro-Nicene strategies are then employed as a framework in which the respective theologies of Gregory of Nyssa and Augustine are read anew and shown to be in far greater

continuity with one another than scholars have recently maintained. Ayres concludes by addressing the often shallow and biased engagement with pro-Nicene theology on the part of modern systematic theology. He holds responsible certain traits endemic to this discipline, including its fundamental attitude toward pre-modern thought and its penchant for philosophical reconstruction. In conclusion Ayres commends the cultivation of various practices which would enable contemporary theologians to appropriate fourth-century pro-Nicene theology in a more historically accurate and yet relevant manner. Ayres's careful reading of ancient texts, narrational skills and dexterous use of insights from multiple scholarly disciplines render this book worthy to sit alongside the classic studies of early Christian doctrinal formation.

GREYFRIARS HALL,
OXFORD

CHAD TYLER GERBER

Lucifero di Cagliari. Una voce nel conflitto tra chiesa e impero alla metà del IV secolo.

By Giuseppe Corti. (Studia Patristica Mediolanensia, 24.) Pp. xvi + 302. Milan:

Vita e Pensiero, 2004. €25 (paper). 88 343 1989 3

JEH (57) 2006; doi:10.1017/S0022046905396217

Lucifer is largely remembered for his vigorous pamphleteering in support of Athanasius and against the emperor Constantius, for his being exiled in the pro-Nicene cause (355–6 until Julian allowed exiled bishops to return in 361) and for his intervention in the ecclesiastical affairs of Antioch (362). This last was without doubt a ghastly mistake. It produced a perduring schism and marred his merits as a model: Ambrose, for one, disapproved of him. Biographical details being in short supply, a book devoted to solely to Lucifer could be a great deal shorter than this one. Giuseppe Corti fleshes out his main subject with an account of the general church politics of the period beginning with imperial interventions in the 'Arian' question from Constantine to Constantius. Chapters follow on the relations of Constantius with the western Church, and on 'Arianism' in the reign of Julian and the Luciferan schism in Antioch. The last two chapters discuss Lucifer's writings and analyse their theology; there is an appendix on the manuscripts and editions. The precise dates of the writings are impossible to determine, but the order is: *De non conveniendo cum haereticis* and *De regibus apostaticis*. They were followed by the two books on Athanasius. These connect with Hilary's openness to the *similar in substance* party displayed in his *De synodis* and rejected by Lucifer. The last two pieces are *De non parcendo in deum delinquentibus* and *Moriundum esse pro dei filio*. All belong in the late 350s. Lucifer championed the rights of the Church over against Constantius' alleged usurpation of them. The emperor's treatment of him, as of the other exiles was, in Corti's presentation, mild: a process of potential 're-education' by relocation to sees where voices more sympathetic to the official line might prevail with the intransigent. As for Lucifer's intervention in Antioch, it had little to do with doctrine and much with a foolish attempt to solve a local dilemma. The details are well set out in this sensible book which gives as clear an account as is possible of a figure not even his friends could call 'a liberal', and his enemies would stigmatise as a 'fundamentalist'.

SKELMANTHORPE

LIONEL WICKHAM

Passion and paradise. Human and divine emotion in the thought of Gregory of Nyssa. By J. Warren Smith. Pp. x + 294. New York: Crossroad Publishing, 2004. \$39.95 (paper). 0 8245 1944 2
JEH (57) 2006; doi:10.1017/S0022046905406211

Warren Smith's book is a very welcome addition to the literature on Gregory of Nyssa, on which he shows himself to be a masterly commentator, able both to exegete the 'whole cloth' of the Cappadocian's subtle message, and to engage in how this ancient theologian meshed with his contemporary philosophical culture. We have the advantage here, that Smith himself is able to move from a classic study of patristic text into an engaged dialogue with pressing contemporary theological problems, where he offers suggestions that are both sympathetic and pastorally acute. It is a marvellously successful example of going to the ancients for light, and actually emerging with it. The book will thus be of interest to students of patristic thought, ancient metaphysical conceptions of time and embodiment, as well as contemporary systematics. The study focuses on the issue of the divine *apatheia*, or dispassion, as Nyssen conceives it. It thus brings up a whole set of problems as to what the Fathers meant by this strange idea, before considering how moderns have read it. The patristic doctrines of God and salvation have often been quarried for dogmatic propositions (often decontextualised in a crudely reductionist way) but rarely has the central message of patristic theology been 'properly' contextualised, one might say, in its pastoral and soteriological *grundschrift* of ascetical anthropology: the concept and method of God's salvation of a wounded race. Smith's treatment of the Christian philosophical notion of 'passions' does an important task in clearing the ground for this important and widely misunderstood nexus of ancient thought. He demonstrates how Gregory at one and the same time dialogues with ancient metaphysics, but also transforms them in the medium of his distinctively Christian, and biblical, concept of eschatological transfiguration (the movement of creation 'from glory to glory'). Central to the argument are the rich Nyssen texts of *The life of Moses*, *On the making of man*, *On the soul and resurrection* and *The commentary on the Song of songs*. The depiction of the life of progress (*prokope*) through passionate longing, to an experience of endlessly deepening fulfilment in God (*epektasis*) which is the paradox of limitless *stasis* in the divine communion (our eschatological salvation), is the heart and soul of this book; but in making a fine summary of Nyssen's thought, Smith is able to draw a deft word picture of the whole dynamic of patristic soteriology, and give a vivid sense of its deep religious passion, and 'connectedness'. The author is to be complimented on a fine achievement.

COLUMBIA UNIVERSITY

J. A. MCGUCKIN

Christ and the just society in the thought of Augustine. By Robert Dodaro. Pp. viii + 253. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2004. £45. 0 521 84162 3

JEH (57) 2006; doi:10.1017/S0022046905416218

Augustine's 'political thought', as it has, somewhat misleadingly, come to be called, has run into more than its fair share of controversy at the hands of his modern interpreters. Much of this is the consequence of attempts to assess its bearings on modern political discussion. Robert Dodaro keeps clear of any such intention. What he offers is a carefully meditated and very full account of Augustine's thinking on the nature of a just society, rigorously confined within the

conceptual horizons of Augustine's thought. His exposition is dominated by the contrast with Cicero's treatment of the same theme, as, of course, is Augustine's own discussion, especially in his *City of god*. The guiding thread of his debate with Cicero is the insistence that true justice is not to be had without knowledge and worship of the true God, in a community whose members are healed from the effects of original sin. The truly just society is a community created and living by divine grace. True virtue cannot be acquired through the teaching and examples of human virtue or taught by the rhetoric of the great statesman; only through Christ, its perfect embodiment. Augustine, however, did ask himself about the way his reflection on true justice could be related to the political realm, which is characterised by its absence, and he devoted some searching thought to the question. For this reason he offered his own revision of Cicero's definition. As Augustine interpreted it, Cicero's formulation implied a perfectionism satisfied only in the one fully just society, the heavenly community united in the worship of God; it left no foothold for speech about societies here on earth. A formula which did not require such perfection was needed to allow discussion of earthly politics; and this is what Augustine set out to provide in his alternative definition. Dodaro mentions this only to dismiss it, for, as he says, this kind of discussion has tended to eclipse Augustine's primary concerns. Although he knows Augustine too well to endorse some of the hastier judgements often made to the effect that Augustine refused to admit the possibility that non-Christians could possess a less than perfect virtue, he is not interested in pursuing this line of thinking. He is thus led altogether to bypass an important, if admittedly secondary, part of Augustine's reflection on human society. While giving full weight to the thread of continuity in Augustine's thought, he rightly emphasises the growing part that his opposition to Pelagianism played in it. Although he makes no attempt to assess Augustine's position within the spectrum of previous and contemporary Christian reflection on Roman society, the book is a marvellously full account of Augustine's thought on the heavenly City, though achieved at the cost of almost total exclusion of its earthly counterpart.

NOTTINGHAM

R. A. MARKUS

Ausone et Paulin de Nole. Correspondance. Introduction, texte latin, traduction et notes. By David Amherdt. (Sapheneia. Beiträge zur Klassischen Philologie, 9.) Pp. vii + 250. Bern: Peter Lang, 2004. £19. 3 03910 247 8; 1421 7899
JEH (57) 2006; doi:10.1017/S0022046905426214

Ausonius (Decimus Magnus Ausonius) and Paulinus of Nola (Meropius Pontius Paulinus) represent contrasting aspects of Gallo-Roman Christianity. Both hailed from near Bordeaux (Burdigala), both were aristocrats owning extensive estates and both embarked at one time on a career in the imperial service. But there the similarities end. Ausonius, born *c.* 310, became a professor of rhetoric, was summoned to the imperial court to teach the young emperor, Gratian, and then moved on to become praetorian prefect of the Gauls in 377–8, praetorian prefect of the Gauls, Italy and Africa in 378–9 and consul in 379. He was a Christian who in retirement enjoyed the services in his village church, but otherwise was imbued with the classics and love for Rome and its traditions. Paulinus, born *c.* 355, was his pupil

who became *consul suffectus* in 378, and owed his appointment as *consularis* of Campania in 381 to Ausonius. But, under the influence of the martyr Felix of Nola, Paulinus experienced a religious conversion. He returned to Gaul, but married a Spaniard, Therasia, and gradually rid himself of his properties, eventually to migrate to Nola and serve the shrine of Felix until his death in 431.

The exchanges of letters ably edited with a French translation by Amherdt, a lecturer in classics at Berne and Neuchâtel universities, show the gradual but ultimately complete breakdown between the two men. The first letter (Ausonius, *ep.* xvii) is devoted to a piece of literary criticism exchanged between two aristocratic friends. A second, (*ep.* xviii) congratulates Paulinus on his appointment as *consul suffectus*. Two others (*ep.* ix, xx), written partly in prose and partly in verse, thank Paulinus for presents not least edibles, and grain he has sent Ausonia. These letters date between 383 and 389 before Paulinus migrated to Spain and married Therasia. Then there is a change. There follow four letters, two of which (*ep.* xxi, xxii) are reproduced, in which Ausonius complains bitterly at the silence of his friend and blames his wife, whom he identifies with Tanaquil, the evil wife of the Latin king, Tarquinius Priscus. Eventually Paulinus replies in a long poem (*carmen* x), affirms his friendship for Ausonius but defends his move to Spain, compares his wife to the chaste Lucretia and reveals that he is now completely dedicated to Christ's service. A final letter from Ausonius (*ep.* xxiv) upbraids Paulinus for having cast aside the ideals of Gallo-Roman society and points out the economic disaster of the sale of his lands and their acquisition by a host of smallholders and bailiffs, thus breaking the relationship between patron and *colonus* which guaranteed the stability of rural society. The correspondence ends in 394 with mutual incomprehension.

The editor skilfully follows and details each stage in the relationship. His footnotes explain the numerous mythological allusions in the texts, and the translations of the often involved verses move easily. If there is a criticism it is that the chance of comparing Paulinus' conversion with that of Augustine at almost the same time has been missed, for the religious outlook of the two men before either entered the priesthood is strikingly similar, and Paulinus became a keen correspondent of Augustine between 395 and 413. None the less the editor has provided a valuable account of how the attitude of some prominent Gallo-Roman aristocrats towards Christianity was gradually intensifying during the last quarter of the fourth century and of the tensions caused by their rejection of the classical past.

GONVILLE AND CAIUS COLLEGE,
CAMBRIDGE

†W. H. C. FREND

Women of Byzantium. By Carolyn L. Connor. Pp. xvii + 396 incl. 2 maps and 46 figs + 20 colour plates. New Haven–London: Yale University Press, 2004. £27.50.
0 300 09957 6

JEH (57) 2006; doi:10.1017/S0022046905436210

The study of women in Byzantine society is hindered by the paucity of sources devoted explicitly to women as individuals or groups, or to their relationships with men. Previous works in this field have tended to concentrate on members of the elite or on remarkable, saintly, women whose hagiographies survive, and few serious attempts have been made to survey women across the sweep of Byzantine history.

Anna Comnena receives her due from Carolyn Connor, together with other privileged women of talent and character, such as Galla Placidia. But we are also offered an examination of the roles and, wherever feasible, the outlooks of and options available to women at other levels of what remained a largely patriarchal society. Particular strengths are the author's expertise as an art historian and close attention to the geographical and social contexts in which images of the Mother of God and women saints occur, rural locations as well as the better-known churches in towns and large monasteries. Connor is also alert to the problem that so much of our material is prescriptive or idealised. Broad themes are addressed by way of case studies of individuals about whom a fair amount of source material is available, and the book is divided into four main chronological sections covering late antiquity, early Byzantium, post-iconoclast Byzantium and the last centuries. Connor notes that the positive valuation placed by Christians on the ascetic life and enshrined in the fourth-century *Life* of St Macrina brought 'new personal freedom' to those sufficiently devoted to enter nunneries, practise 'house asceticism' or go on pilgrimages, and not all of these women were wealthy or of high status. Light on the condition of women trying to make a living as innkeepers in sixth-century Galatia is shed by the *Life* of St Theodore of Sykeon. Connor argues for the plausibility of this unpretentious work's portrayal of the lack of choices available to unprivileged women in agrarian communities. The Middle Byzantine period is not particularly rich in documentation about the way of life of the peasant population. But through analysis of the mosaics in the monastery of Hosios Loukas and the wall-paintings in small family churches in the Troodos Mountains of Cyprus, Connor shows that a substantial number of women saints featured in them. Empress Helena paired with her son Constantine seems to have been ubiquitous, perhaps a measure of how deeply the idea of holy empire was instilled in male and female sensibilities alike. The territorial empire was, undeniably, shrunken in the thirteenth and fourteenth centuries, but our documentation becomes somewhat fuller and seems to betoken increasing financial activity and pious initiatives on the part of women, rather than merely better source-survival. Women founded religious houses and much of the final part of the book concerns Theodora Synadene's regulations for her monastic foundation in Constantinople. The surviving manuscript, known as the Lincoln College *Typikon*, served as a working document throughout the fourteenth century, yet it contains a series of illuminations, including portrayals of Theodora and her daughter and a group portrait of the nuns. Connor cites passages from Theodora's *Typikon* to show how closely interwoven were text, images and the actual deportment expected of the nuns. Theodora hoped that the nuns themselves would resemble painters, modelling 'their own images after the original character' of the abbess. From her examination of this 'utilitarian and at times makeshift' manuscript, Connor concludes that every effort was made by Theodora's successors to maintain practices in their sizable house in line with her intentions. This study shows how well art history can illuminate aspects of Byzantine society about which narratives, including hagiographies, are reticent or narrow in scope. The lucid style and clear signposting – for example, select lists of further reading at the end of each chapter – should make this fine work readily accessible to students and the general reader.

Gratia et certamen. The relationship between grace and free will in the discussion of Augustine with the so-called Semipelagians. By D. Ogliari. (Bibliotheca Ephemeridum Theologicarum Lovaniensium, 169.) Pp. lvii + 476. Leuven: Leuven University Press/Peeters, 2003. €75 (paper). 90 5867 357 X; 90 429 1351 7; 2 87723 741 9
JEH (57) 2006; doi:10.1017/S0022046905446217

This is a first-rate book which seems destined to become the standard study for a generation and more to come for English readers of Augustine's debate with the Massilian theologians of Provence in the last years of his life. Ogliari has read exhaustively in the original source material and supporting documentation, and modern studies; has drawn balanced and judicious conclusions without prejudice to either party; and expressed them in a clear and readable English style, which is the more impressive for not being his mother-tongue. The work falls into four chapters: the opposition in 427 of the African monks of Hadrumetum to Augustine's predestinarian theology; the more serious resistance of the Massilian divines of southern Gaul, commonly and inaccurately called Semi-Pelagians, John Cassian to Faustus of Riez, and down to the Council of Orange of 529; the theological issues of the debate over grace and free will; and the concept of predestination in Christian tradition and the influence of Augustine's reasoning on later western theology, which Ogliari rightly thinks to have been decisive. He contrasts the 'optimistic' view of the economy of salvation of the Massilians, who looked to the monastic teaching of the Egyptian and Judean deserts and the Greek Fathers, with the 'sombre and pessimistic' conclusions elaborated by Augustine, after his intellectual conversion when writing in reply to the queries of Simplicianus of Milan about 396, which persuaded him of the primacy of God's absolute decree over all other considerations, including his love for humanity, so often and so eloquently described by Augustine. 'The incarnation of the Word of God, viz. the gratuitous assumption of humanity by the Godhead in Christ, remains at the centre of Augustine's doctrine of grace' (p. 302); yet 'Augustine was not able to integrate divine justice into a sociological perspective. In his eyes, God's justice has nothing to do with His willingness to extend the promise of salvation to all, but in punishing those deserving of it' (p. 409). Against this, 'the question of universal salvation became the Massilians' *pièce maitresse* against Augustine's doctrine of predestination' (p. 383). Ogliari's discussion of the historical theology of grace and free will and the '*vexata quaestio* of predestination' are impressive in their comprehensiveness – he has an admirable section on the concept of deification, so often neglected by western historians of dogma and misrepresented by eastern controversialists (pp. 196–225) and its relation to human free will, 'a mark of man's likeness to God', which meant that the relationship between grace and freedom was not a central issue, in the sense of a 'debated' one, in Greek theology. He also concludes that 'while Augustine never speaks of a praedestinatio gemina, his doctrine of predestination contains, implicitly and unintentionally, a de facto indication of it' (p. 374). Altogether, the book is a notable contribution to the study of the theology of the Pelagian Controversy as a whole, and not simply to the Massilian phase. It deserves to be read, marked, learned and inwardly digested by any student of the development of Christian theology.

The apostolic age in patristic thought. Edited by A. Hilhorst. (Supplements to *Vigiliae Christianae*. Texts and Studies of Early Christian Life and Language, 70.) Pp. xiii + 257 incl. 6 figs and 3 tables. Leiden–Boston: Brill, 2004. £96. 90 04 12611 2; 0920 623X

JEH (57) 2006; doi:10.1017/S0022046905456213

The first three of these sixteen essays belie the title of the volume. Korteweg on Paul's belief in his heavenly commission, Ysebaert on the separation of eucharist and love-feast and Hilhorst on the gilding of the apostolic era in the memory of the next generation cite no text written after the closure of the New Testament canon. Van Deun pursues a longer thread in his survey of the vicissitudes of the term *apostolikos* in patristic usage, while Den Boeft explores the recrudescence of miracles in the age of Augustine and Martin of Tours. Rouwhurst shows that the Easter controversy was clouded from the outset by competing appeals to apostolic precedent. In Roukema's view, it was not so much a shared canon as a common understanding of the apostolic deposit that united the Church of Origen's day. Benjamins notes, however, that where Irenaeus returns to the Apostles through a chain of witnesses, Origen relies on divination from the text; Ledegang demonstrates that his divining-rod is the spiritual perfection of the reader. Gnostics appealed instead to mediators who, as Luttikhuisen argues, were created to outflank the teaching of the twelve disciples. Van Oort rehearses the claims of Mani, paraclete of a new *aetas apostolica*. Provoost's statistics indicate that as Christianity prospered it became more hospitable to profane motifs in iconography. Bartelink discovers in monasticism a conscious resurrection of the charismatic ardour and communal life of the earliest Christians, while Eusebius puzzles Davids by baptising the Therapeutae of Philo before there were any cenobitic monks. Dehandschutter re-examines the perplexities of fourth-century churchmen wrestling with the primitive nomenclature of ecclesiastical office. Seekers of novelty must be content with Bastiaansen's thesis that the fears which caused Augustine to neglect the Song of Songs induced him also to shun the image of Jerusalem as God's bride.

CHRIST CHURCH,
OXFORD

M. J. EDWARDS

Local saints and local churches in the early medieval west. Edited by Alan Thacker and Richard Sharpe. Pp. xiii + 581 incl. 39 ill. Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2002. £85. 0 19 820394 2

JEH (57) 2006; doi:10.1017/S002204690546621X

There is little parochial about this book, despite a double emphasis on the local in its title. In fact, its editors might be upbraided for misleading their audience, were it not for the rich results of their insistence on the local and the obscure. Their perspective offers the perfect point from which to observe and understand the diverse cultural forms that saints and churches could take in the early medieval west. Some of the book's fourteen weighty chapters could, with little alteration, stand alone as short monographs. Collected together here, they present the reader with an invaluable work of reference and comparative history. Contributors survey the operation of saints' cults in the local landscape across a range of micro-Christendoms stretching from Ireland to Rome, via Celtic Britain, England and Gaul, and from the fourth to

the eleventh century. Together they find remarkably varied answers to questions concerned with how saints were made, how their remains were given particular settings in architecture and on the landscape, how their lives were commemorated, and their posthumous presence made tangible, how the places and the objects they touched and how their spiritual, institutional and biological associates claimed and enjoyed social and political influence through them. It would be invidious in the space available to single out particular contributions for detailed consideration. Every author handles his or her evidence – material artefacts, architectural, toponymic, etymological, archaeological and documentary – with tremendous precision and skill, explaining the limitations of their sources and the interpretive possibilities they offer, guiding the reader through its problems and challenges, keeping alternative readings open, but presenting clear and compelling arguments. A very helpful introductory synthesis by Alan Thacker of the scholarship collected here emphasises equally the interconnectedness of these regional patterns and the variations in their evolution. Factors influencing these variations included: different (and in some cases the absence of) Roman inheritances; the timing and character of regional conversions to Christianity; the criss-crossed lines and modes of transmission of different cult practices; the historical contingencies influencing local access to and selection of different combinations of martyrs, confessors, universal and native saints, and the ongoing reception and creative reinterpretation of imported practices to fit local political and social contexts. We learn of the relative importance of bells, croziers and books as secondary relics in Celtic regions (Nancy Edwards), of the evidence for itinerant ecclesiastical families carrying the stories of saints around Ireland with them (Pádraig Ó Riain), of the enduring enthusiasm in Cornwall for uniquely local saints (O. J. Padel), and the likelihood of a lost English landscape of minster-based saints and their stories that proliferated from the eighth to the eleventh century, and thus for the closer resemblance between the Brittonic and English Churches than has traditionally been noticed (John Blair). The result leaves one aware of the frequently palimpsestic qualities of available evidence, of the layers of chronology lost from view by later accretions and of the forensic skills required to tease out the partially obliterated layers. In its conception, quality and scale – not to mention in the invaluable handlist of Anglo-Saxon saints provided by John Blair – this book points the way for future researchers of other micro-Christendoms in the early medieval west.

UNIVERSITY OF BIRMINGHAM

SIMON YARROW

Ritual, text and law. Studies in medieval canon law and liturgy presented to Roger E. Reynolds.

Edited by Kathleen G. Cushing and Richard F. Gyug. (Church, Faith and Culture in the Medieval West.) Pp. xiv + 326 incl. frontispiece, 4 tables and 14 plates + erratum. Aldershot, 2004. £50. 0 7546 3869 3

JEH (57) 2006; doi:10.1017/S0022046905476216

The eighteen studies that make up this collection concentrate fittingly on the central concerns of Roger Reynolds's scholarly interests. They cover a range in time from the fourth to the sixteenth centuries and in space from Sardica to Copenhagen, while the topics they deal with focus on three subjects that have predominated in Reynolds's scholarship over the past thirty-six years: the history of liturgy, textual

studies and the history of canon law. The first seven chapters deal with the history of the Christian liturgy. These include, among others, Paul De Clerck's study of the 'angel of peace', Herbert Schneider's analysis of a Beneventan manuscript of a Visigothic synodal *ordo*, Eric Palazzo's account of the use of hyssop in the dedication of churches, Timothy Thibodeau's reflections on lessons to be learned from medieval liturgy and Virginia Brown's report on a sixteenth-century Neapolitan manuscript in the Beneventan script. The eleven remaining chapters centre mainly on canon law texts from the period before Gratian. Particularly noteworthy in this group are the study by Peter Landau of the sources of the Collection in Seven Books, Martin Brett's appraisal of manuscripts of pre-Gratian canonical collections, their readers and their editors, Robert Somerville's report on the traces of Cardinal Deusdedit's collection in Beneventan sources and Linda Fowler-Magerl's description of a Barcelona manuscript of the *Collectio Caesaraugustana*. The closing chapter, by Uta-Renate Blumenthal on the Saint Victor collection, neatly brings together the themes of liturgy and canon law.

UNIVERSITY OF KANSAS

JAMES A. BRUNDAGE

Landscapes of monastic foundations. The establishment of religious houses in East Anglia, c. 650–1200. By Tim Pestell. Pp. xvi + 279 incl. frontispiece, 11 plates, 50 ills and 3 tables. Woodbridge: Boydell Press, 2004. £50. 1 84383 062 0
JEH (57) 2006; doi:10.1017/S0022046905486212

Tim Pestell's aim is to study patterns of monastic foundation in the landscape of one area, East Anglia, and to consider the wider landscape setting of monastic houses. Using documentary and archaeological evidence he breaks across the usual chronological divide in monastic studies (1066) to look at an area that – despite having a wealth of Anglo-Saxon and post-Conquest foundations – has been understudied in terms of its monastic history. As Pestell shows this is rich and varied. He opens with a discussion of monasticism in Middle Anglo-Saxon East Anglia, and in so doing enters the debate on what constituted *monasteria*, and the extent of their interaction with – or isolation from – the 'outside world'. He argues that the evidence suggests a close connection between monastic and secular sites, and the 'embedded nature of the Church in secular society' (p. 64). East Anglia is an area which invites the question of the consequences of the coming of the Vikings for the Church. Pestell's sources suggest that the First Viking Age did not result in a 'crushing blow' to the spiritual life of East Anglia, but rather a continuity of pre-Viking institutions, and an awareness of local religious traditions. Pestell suggests, however, that the Viking Age was to lead to a recognition of the need to codify religious life, and laid a fertile ground for the monastic reforms of the tenth century. His arguments, that there was a political dimension to the spread of Benedictine reform from Wessex and that the landscape was important in the siting of houses, are compelling; he demonstrates cogently that these sites reflect and indeed were intended to reinforce the power structure in East Anglia. In the years after the Norman settlement and up to around 1200 seventy-one new monastic foundations were made in the diocese of Norwich. The chronological pattern of settlement in one way seems to call for little comment for, as in other regions, the fashion immediately after the Conquest was for alien houses, followed by the Cluniacs, and the

Augustinian canons. However, what is surprising is the absence – with the exception of Sibton – of the Cistercians. As Pestell points out, this was an area where potential ‘classic’ Cistercian sites, isolated by marsh and fen, might well have proved attractive to the White Monks, but instead they were inhabited by the Gilbertines and the Premonstratensians. His discussion of the location of these religious houses is placed in the context of the land and tenurial patterns, as well as social factors, the identity of the founding families, their resources and connections between them. His constant concern is to place the monastic foundations in their broader landscape context, and to demonstrate not just how features of landscape influenced the choice of site, but how the religious houses of the region were part of a planned landscape, whether they were urban, associated with castles, shared a parish church with parishioners, or were remote. The foundation of a religious house was not just born of religious devotion but of a desire to establish elite landscapes, social control and status and political dominance. This study is a welcome addition to the *corpus* of regional studies of monasticism that help to illuminate broader developments.

UNIVERSITY OF WALES,
LAMPETER

JANET BURTON

The age of the cloister. The story of monastic life in the Middle Ages. By Christopher Brooke. (Trans. of *Die Klöster*, Freiburg-im-Breisgau: Herder, 2001.) Pp. xii + 356 incl. 20 illus + 8 plates. Stroud: Sutton, 2003. £10.99 (paper). 0 7509 3288 0
JEH (57) 2006; doi:10.1017/S0022046905496219

This excellent book is a revised edition, in smaller and more student-friendly format, of *The monastic world*, published in 1974, a more sumptuous volume in which Professor Brooke's text was copiously and magnificently illustrated by the photos of the architectural photographer Wim Swaan. Although this new edition is shorn of all but a handful of the original illustrations, Brooke's frequent asides on, and evocative descriptions of, surviving monastic buildings validate his belief in the value of dialogue between architecture and literary evidence which inspired the earlier volume. Students will be especially grateful for his seventeen-page introduction, which surveys the historiography of his subject in the years since 1974 with the complement of a copious bibliography. The book provides an admirable survey of the many and various forms of religious life in medieval Europe between the sixth and thirteenth centuries, with the addition of a brief chapter on the friars. As always, Brooke's impressive learning, allied to the elegance and vivacity of his style, make him a pleasure to read, even if, very occasionally, his wit is distracting: to call St Dominic 'the apostle of committees' is amusing, but is apt to divert attention from the real significance of the Preachers' constitution: it introduced to the religious life the novel principle of representation. The book is full of humanity, with many sharp pen-portraits. I notice only one conspicuous absentee from Brooke's gallery of saints, scholars and reformers: where is the *moine universitaire*? The entry of the monks into the new scholastic world of the universities and the foundation of monastic colleges might have been a suitable epilogue to the story.

UNIVERSITY OF LONDON

C. H. LAWRENCE

The footsteps of Israel. Understanding Jews in Anglo-Saxon England. By Andrew P. Scheil. Pp. xii + 372 incl. 2 figs. Ann Arbor: University of Michigan Press, 2004. £40.50 (\$60). 0 472 114805 5
JEH (57) 2006; doi:10.1017/S0022046905506213

Andrew P. Scheil has written the first book-length study of 'the Jewish question' in Anglo-Saxon England. It is not strange that into the third millennium CE such a study should at last appear. The 'age of philology' in Anglo-Saxon studies, when it held sway, was not interested overmuch in large issues of this kind, preferring to concentrate on what texts said, not what they meant, and indeed it was sometimes even embarrassed by Christianity. Since Jews, so far as we know, were neither an economic nor a religious nor a social nor a political nor a personal presence in Anglo-Saxon England, other disciplines looked elsewhere for their topics. Certainly Jews were a virtual presence or a textual presence. Scheil accordingly brings together and studies exemplary texts in Latin or the vernacular that demonstrate the sometimes contradictory attitude of Christian writers towards Jews. There are four major parts to the discussion: the works of Bede, the idea of the *Populus Israel*, 'somatic' fiction with special reference to the Blickling and Vercelli (vernacular) manuscripts, and the work of Ælfric of Eynsham with special reference to his *De populo Israel* and his *Maccabees*. Bede is an appropriate beginning for this study, given his large body of work, the subtlety of his thought and style and his debt to patristic tradition and its exegetical methods. Scheil's two chapter titles, 'Bede and hate' and 'Bede and love', encapsulate the direction of his analysis, as does the figure of Tobit who in Bede's exegesis 'symbolizes the faithful and unfaithful, chosen and accursed'. Ælfric, who is a corresponding literary figure at the other end of the Anglo-Saxon period, offers a similar disjunctive view of the Jews, if not more anxious, and perhaps more prophetic of more virulent anti-Judaism to come. Here and there Scheil admits to a perplexity over the illogicality of Christian writers who, so to speak, have it both ways when it comes to Jews: praise and blame. In his conclusion Scheil theorises more about this Christian intellectual-moral position, citing significantly contemporary views of antisemitism, as, for example, Jill Robbins who observes an ambiguity or flaw in the Christian apprehension of Judaism: Christian hermeneutics, in its very inclusion of the Judaic, also excludes it. For many of his texts Scheil ranges widely outside of Anglo-Saxon England. Perhaps the most startling individual selection is John Scottus Eriugena's *Postquam nostra salus*, where a despondent Satan, thrown out of heaven, spews venom and hate as he associates himself with the Jews. The important section on the *populus Israel*, which is most successful in assembling many texts for discussion, is arguably the book at its best. Scheil brings into focus some twelve texts and authors, Bede to *Beowulf*, the latter read as a meditation on the *populus Israel* mythos. Scheil is aware that his provocative inclusion of *Beowulf* is, unlike his other hard evidence for the mythos, an attempt to identify the informing intention behind the poem's design. This suggestion reflects Scheil's deep engagement with the *vestigia Israel*, evident as well in his own meditative moments in the discussion and in his inclusion of a poetic *leitmotif* here and there to reflect perhaps his own contemporary concern. This book gives Anglo-Saxon and early medieval studies an overview that will become the point of departure for future work.

History and memory in the Carolingian world. By Rosamond McKitterick. Pp. xvi + 337. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2004. £50 (cloth), £17.99 (paper).
 o 521 82717 5; o 521 53436 4
JEH (57) 2006; doi:10.1017/S002204690551621X

The author has published on the Carolingians for the past quarter of a century. The bibliography to the work under review lists twenty-six of her titles. In retrospect one discerns a change of emphasis from predominantly political to almost exclusively cultural studies. Even so, the reader encounters a lot of *déjà vu* and *déjà entendus*.

This book builds on the analysis, in highly varied intensity, of 200 manuscripts; it remains unclear which of these the author has not seen in the original. Her general competence in this field is unquestioned even though it should be emphasised that palaeography is ultimately a rather soft discipline.

One of the principal tenets of this study is that written material from this period has hitherto been quarried mostly for factual information which resulted in fairly old-fashioned political narrative (to which McKitterick herself contributed in no small measure). In this respect it is to be noted that the author experienced her 'Damascus' about ten years ago when she discovered (one of the last scholars in the field to do so, it may be said), that the Royal Frankish annals cannot be taken as reliable contemporary sources for the events they report (see p. 136; surprisingly, two articles of hers dealing with exactly that, and in passages repeated verbatim, *TRHS* [1997], 101–29, and *EHR* cxv [2000], 1–20, are not listed in the bibliography). This discovery, however, did not effect a conversion: her overall *opus* remains a seamless garment.

Here is her approach: 'It is of crucial significance for the determination of the particular significance and appreciation of the message of any particular text that its inclusion in composite historical manuscripts be recorded and observed and that the specific circumstances not only of the texts but of each manuscript containing the text, be established as far as this is possible' (p. 58).

Important manuscript material is here re-contextualised: what is investigated is less what such texts contain than in what context, at what time, in which places, they were copied (p. 20). This laudable approach is not, however, as novel as it is claimed (see the scholars from Vienna and especially Reimitz on whom she leans heavily). Overall new and interesting constellations arise. It is all the more regrettable that too many topics central to her work are not dealt with thoroughly (see pp. 11, 13, 41, 71, etc).

In her presentation the results of her work are offered without elaboration of the way and means by which they are reached:

The study of history and memory in the Carolingian world is a study both of the texts in which an elite defines itself and of the extant Carolingian manuscripts which provide the indication of the Franks' understanding of the past (p. 7).

The surviving evidence makes it clear that many people, lay and cleric, male and female, to a considerable way down the social scale, were literate to some degree, had access to literate modes of communication, and deployed them when necessary (p. 32).

The books in Frankish libraries, as part of a past which the Franks had assimilated to themselves, formed part of the Frankish sense of identity (p. 221).

'Taken together the texts and extant manuscripts constitute the self-defining action of an elite and the use of history texts to shape shared memory' (p. 22). 'In

other words, the Franks were not only a textual community in relation to the Bible, as has long been recognised; they were also a textual community in terms of their intellectual and textual inheritance' (p. 26, but almost verbatim at p. 221 and p. 244). (Stock's questionable concept, developed for the twelfth century and for clerics only, here applied to the ninth, is stretched beyond reason.)

The book under review proclaims that the elite of the *Franks* in the ninth century received its ethnic identity from various works of history created on the basis of antique material in the Carolingian period. It is unfortunate that the terms 'Carolingians' and 'Franks' are used rather indiscriminately, and, what makes this even less acceptable, generally with the definite article. This is a huge claim, even more so since it is upheld for a time when politically the Carolingian empire had disintegrated. It would be most interesting to be informed how in such a political world Latin historiography could have acted as a social cohesive in elites beyond political divisions. Here the reader could expect solid evidence, but this is not given. Instead, implicit and exorbitant claims are made for educational levels among the Frankish elite and lower sectors of the community (see p. 32). It would appear to be symptomatic that Pierre Riché, who has studied in more detail than most the realities of education in the Carolingian world, is listed and thus used, not for his truly important monograph *Écoles et enseignement dans le haut moyen âge* (1979), but for one single article; his results are not confronted of course.

The *Annales regni francorum* are the core text of this study. 'What has concerned me ... is the construction of a past, its coherence and consistency, and the degree to which such a construction constitutes the formation of the collective memory of the newly formed Frankish people under Carolingian rule' (p. 118, also pp. 126, 129, 131). The first half of the sentence is acceptable, the second, decisive for her presentation, is not proved, quite apart from the fact that the Frankish people were not newly founded under Carolingian rule. 'The *Annales regni Francorum* ... are a skilfully constructed and highly selective triumphal narrative. They offer a subtly nuanced portrayal of the Carolingian rulers whose success is identified with the Frankish people' (p. 76). This amounts to a squaring of an intellectual circle.

In reading the book, the reviewer has received the distinct impression that the author is no longer in the position to see her material in its historical context. Statements are made that are beyond 'proof' in the traditional sense, such as that of 'the attitude towards the book as sacred text and authority in the Carolingian world' (p. 168). 'The Carolingians wished to exert power over texts and to control both their use and meaning. They were able to exert power through texts by using the written word to organise, control and challenge the world. For them the written word was sacred' (p. 242). One cannot do better than quote McKitterick's *ipsissima verba*: 'As one reads it becomes something close to overkill' (p. 114).

One must single out a particular blindness of the author in matters Irish. She misspells Irish names, medieval and modern, or even mixed Irish-German names (Dagmar Ó Riain-Raedel surfaces as Riain-Raendel, D. O.). She is apparently unaware that annals with incarnation years started in Iona a century at least before the Carolingian annals did, and she dismisses without hard evidence the Irish descent of Virgil of Salzburg (pp. 176–83). Finally, she attributes to Adomnan (*recte* Adomnán) the *Vita Columbanī* (p. 178; the author of that work was Jonas of Susa; Adomnán's work is normally referred to as *Vita Columbae*). Also, an Irish fragment of Eusebius-Rufinus, dated to c. 600, was found in 1983; it would be relevant to pp. 227 ff.

‘A sense of the past was deeply integrated into the sense of identity possessed by the audience for history in the Carolingian world. The Franks defined themselves in terms of their history’ (p. 283). This is McKitterick’s *credo*; it remains a matter of belief which, as is well known, transcends all reason.

The book as a whole has many overlaps and repetitions. It could easily have been shortened by a quarter at least, and there would have been thus room to discuss thoroughly the relevant texts.

KONSTANZ

MICHAEL RICHTER

The Cambridge companion to medieval philosophy. Edited by A. S. McGrade. Pp. xviii + 405. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2003. £45 (cloth), £17.95 (paper).
0 521 80603 8; 0 521 00063 7

JEH (57) 2006; doi:10.1017/S0022046905526216

Almost all volumes in the *Cambridge Companions* series have concerned specific thinkers and have provided detailed examinations of their thought. This volume departs from that model, both in that it surveys a thousand years of philosophy and in that it approaches the subject topically rather than by individual medieval contributors. After a brief introduction by Stephen McGrade, the chapters cover the institutional and political contexts of medieval philosophy (Steven Marrone), the ideas of eternity and hierarchy (John Marenbon and David Luscombe), language and logic (Jennifer Ashworth), Islamic philosophy (Thérèse-Anne Druart), Jewish philosophy (Idit Dobbs-Weinstein), God and ontology (Stephen Menn), creation and nature (Edith Sylla), the problem of universals (Gyula Klima), human nature (Robert Pasnau), ethics (Bonnie Kent), the goal of happiness (James McEvoy), political philosophy (Annabel Brett), Renaissance philosophy (P. J. Fitzpatrick and John Haldane) and finally an essay on the problems of transmission and access to medieval philosophical texts, both during the Middle Ages and today (Thomas Williams). The book includes a timeline of medieval philosophers followed by a list of major events, along with brief biographies of medieval thinkers arranged chronologically. Perhaps in view of its primary audience, the bibliography is for the most part limited to works in English. The quality of these chapters is extremely high and written in a clear, accessible style. Although the book was designed and arranged for use in the classroom and by non-specialists, the chapters abound in new observations and perspectives that will be of interest alike to specialists.

UNIVERSITY OF WISCONSIN-MADISON

WILLIAM J. COURTENAY

Exile in the Middle Ages. Selected proceedings from the International Medieval Congress, University of Leeds, 8–11 July 2002. Edited by Laura Napran and Elizabeth van Houts. (International Medieval Research, 13.) Pp. xii + 249. Turnhout: Brepols, 2004. €60. 2 503 51453 7

JEH (57) 2006; doi:10.1017/S0022046905536212

Exile is briefly definable as ‘the banishment of a person by a higher authority’. Exile may sometimes be voluntary, and it often has a political dimension. The editors have collated the proceedings of the 2002 International Medieval Congress into

two parts, five articles on exile in the secular world, and nine on ecclesiastical exiles. The preface, by Elizabeth van Houts, explains that the volume is meant to answer the question of to what degree exile as a recurrent literary theme was reflected in historical reality during the Middle Ages. The introduction, by Laura Napran, gives a broad discussion of extant literature (mostly monographs) on the wide-ranging dimensions of the topic, from classical times to the present. The first part of the collection covers topics that range from the vocabulary of exile and outlawry as a reflection of political and legal processes in the North Sea area, to other exilic processes and their representation in literature, to the particular problems of exiled women. The articles of the second part combine to give a broad overview of the role of exiled bishops and other church dignitaries in the era c. 1000–1300, with the names of Thomas Becket, Anselm, Bernard of Clairvaux and John of Salisbury recurring relatively frequently, either as source or as protagonist. Political and economic implications of exile in the lives of individuals are recurrent themes, as is the concept of exile and pilgrimage as a spiritual as well as a physical journey. The geographical provenance of individual exiles ranged from Scandinavia to Wales to Spain and Italy. A twelve-page index of names facilitates reference. This is complemented by a three-page subject index and a three-page list of abbreviations. There is no consistent bibliography at the end of the volume, but individual texts are cited and referenced in extensive footnotes throughout. Beside secondary literature, sources are Greek and Latin texts, various vernaculars and all the major genres of medieval narrative and documentary texts. Latin quotations are not translated. In some few cases paraphrasing of the Latin (particularly on pp. 85–7) is inadequate, indicating a misunderstanding of its purport (for example Cicero *De legibus* II. 12, 40 is interpreted as referring to ‘the relationship between journeying and giving the city to philosophy’, whereas Cicero in fact says that his friend Cato has ‘as it were awarded citizenship to philosophy, which had formerly been a visitor in Rome’). This particular article (pp. 83–94) traces the meaning of the word *peregrinatio* in Augustine without reference to its all-importance as a Roman legal concept, with its own idiosyncratic set of laws, which would have been so understood by all Augustine’s readers. This renders the particular article less useful. In general, however, the volume is a valuable source for any reader wishing to explore exile as a political or spiritual reality in the Middle Ages.

UNIVERSITY OF STELLENBOSCH

JO-MARIE CLAASSEN

Queenship and sanctity. The Lives of Mathilda and the Epitaph of Adelheid. Translated, with intro. and notes, by Sean Gilsdorf. (Medieval Texts in Translation.) Pp. xvii + 221 incl. 3 maps and 2 genealogical tables. Washington, DC: Catholic University of America Press, 2004. \$24.95 (paper). o 8132 1374 6

JEH (57) 2006; doi:10.1017/S0022046905546219

The two *Lives* of Mathilda [†968], wife of Henry I, and the *Epitaph* of the Empress Adelheid [†999] are remarkable works. All three are examples of ‘sacred biography’ concerned with the sanctity of secular women. In the case of Mathilda they may also have been written by women, probably at the nunnery of Nordhausen. For Gilsdorf the pastoral of marriage, which the *Later Life* of Mathilda appears to contain, need not indicate episcopal authorship given the importance of Saxon nunneries as places

where unmarried noble women as well as nuns were trained. Gilsdorf provides the first English translation of the *Older* and *Later Lives* of Mathilda. Although Warner has already produced an excellent translation of the *Epitaph* it is good to have it here alongside the *Lives* of Adelheid's mother-in-law, and Gilsdorf makes available the fruits of much recent German and French work to an English-reading public. His translation is sensitive, attempting, for example, to retain something of the 'mannerist' style of the original Latin, refusing anachronistic 'feudal' terminology and preserving the Latin 'domina' throughout. His perceptive remarks on the difference between 'domina', with its morphological equivalence to 'dominus' and clear derivation from 'dominare', and modern English 'lady', relationally defined by reference to the normative 'lord', and with a semantic field influenced by all the later notions of chivalry and *politesse*, should be obligatory reading for historians of medieval women and power. 'Dominae' are precisely what his women are. Adelheid, in particular, became in the hands of her biographer, Odilo of Cluny, a 'holy ruler'. The *Epitaph* was shaped by Cluniac spirituality. Unlike Jerome's *Epitaph of Paula*, which inspired it, it gives us not a secular woman who proceeds to sanctity through the renunciation of her aristocratic life, but one whose progress is through a series of political crises from each of which she emerges as an ever more powerful, divinely sanctioned, ruler. Adelheid is much less of a female saint than Mathilda, though Mathilda too is a ruler. Her life in retirement was full of public dealings, so much so that it was often her servants who washed the poor or distributed food for her. But Gilsdorf's emphasis on Mathilda's dynastic sanctity is surely correct. She is a saint who prophesied the accession of her descendants, one remodelled as the crown passed among them; a saint who is wife and mother, surrounded by family, providing the 'only image in medieval sacred biography of the saint as doting grandmother'. The model of queenly sanctity in Fortunatus' ascetic *Life* of Radegund had to be radically reshaped to fit. The Mathilda of the *Lives* speaks not merely of dynastic needs, however, but of the close involvement of the Saxon nunneries with royal and aristocratic families. In life, in death and in *Epitaph* Adelheid spoke to wider constituencies. Buried in Alsace, her *Life* written by an abbot of Cluny and addressed to San Salvatore, Pavia, the Europe-wide familial links of tenth-century hegemonic politics had delivered power to Adelheid on this broader stage. The lives and *Lives* of these women have much to contribute to the history of sanctity, of queenship and of tenth- and early eleventh-century European politics.

UNIVERSITY OF LIVERPOOL

PAULINE STAFFORD

Wulfstan, archbishop of York. The proceedings of the second Alcuin conference. Edited by Matthew Townend. (Studies in the Early Middle Ages, 10.) Pp. xiii + 553 incl. 36 ill. Turnhout: Brepols, 2004. €85. 2 503 52224 6

JEH (57) 2006; doi:10.1017/S0022046905556215

Bishop of London 996–1002, bishop of Worcester 1002–16 and archbishop of York (initially in plurality) 1002–23, Wulfstan 'the homilist' was the author of a body of sermons in Latin and Old English, of laws for both King Æthelræd and King Cnut and of other tracts. Notwithstanding his important place in the English Church and State during this tumultuous period, Wulfstan has not hitherto been the subject of an essay collection: this present volume, based on a conference held at the University of

York in 2002, is appropriately weighty. The twenty contributions range authoritatively across Wulfstan's language, imagery and eschatology, his literary relations with the homilist Ælfric, his activities – both practical and liturgical – as a churchman, his contribution to the late Anglo-Saxon state and to 'political theology' more generally and the implications of his writings for broader questions such as the nature of late Anglo-Saxon/Anglo-Scandinavian heathenism, and the status of widows. In addition, a valiant effort is made to give some impression of York Minster in Wulfstan's day; there is a highly speculative attempt to relate the art of a Canterbury gospel-book that happened to come into Wulfstan's possession to his personality; and there is a fascinating account of his tomb at Ely. Although several authors exploit in different ways Wulfstan's autograph additions to particular manuscripts, a coherent overview of the work written in his own hand is the most obvious *lacuna* in the collection. If at first sight the findings of the individual contributors seem to lead in different directions, collectively they none the less present a credible picture of a recognisable type of high-ranking ecclesiastic. A capable administrator, an obsessive moralist depressed by the failings of contemporary society, an effective orator with a limited vocabulary and heavily dependent upon a 'ghost-writer' (Ælfric), Wulfstan emerges as worthy and important, with a clear if limited vision, but ultimately rather dull – lacking the verve of an Æthelwold, the learning even of an Ælfric and the humanity of his namesake, St Wulfstan of Worcester. If we knew all this in outline before, now we can perceive it in more detail.

UNIVERSITY OF KENT,
CANTERBURY

RICHARD GAMESON

Anselm of Canterbury. The beauty of theology. By David S. Hogg. (Great Theologians.)

Pp. x + 207. Aldershot: Ashgate, 2004. £16.99. 0 7546 3218 0; 0 7546 3232 6

JEH (57) 2006; doi:10.1017/S0022046905566211

'Beauty' is a word which has been downgraded in the modern world from the *pulchritudo* of God to a superficial apprehension of prettiness, but even in this climate of negation, beauty could still be seen by Solzhenitzyn as the one remaining pillar in support of all creation, when truth and honour have disappeared. Since Hans Urs Von Balthasar wrote about the beauty implicit in theology, the older sense of beauty has become once more a theme of importance in theological discussion. The work of David Hogg which places Anselm's works within this area is therefore of great contemporary interest. Like many authors recently who have begun to include in their assessment of Anselm serious commentary on his Prayers and Meditations, Hogg sees them as a vital source for comprehending Anselm's 'faith seeking understanding' both in method and in content. He begins with a most interesting analysis of the Prayers and Meditations and then connects their theological basis with other works of Anselm to show the same apprehension of beauty as the basis of them all. This study shows that Anselm's theology of beauty was not just a part of aesthetics but an apprehension of the beauty of God in the worst of situations, a true understanding of the cross that is fundamental not only to Anselm but to Christianity itself.

After an introductory survey chapter, Hogg analyses some of the Prayers and Meditations of Anselm, texts which he uses as a basis for his discussion of beauty,

seeing them, very properly, as ‘expressions of theological depth laden with divine truth’ (p. 41). He then links these early works with the *De grammatico*, offering a useful view of Anselm and the beauty of words. In the next chapter he turns to the *Monologion* and above all the *Proslogion*, perhaps the paradigm for Anselm’s approach to the glory of God, setting the famous ‘ontological argument’ in its proper context of a long prayer of desire for God. Chapter v continues the idea of beauty and theology through the minor treatises, and the last masterful chapter presents Anselm as a theologian of beauty most of all in *Cur Deus Homo* and in his theology of the cross.

While David Hogg has offered a sensitive and positive approach to the works of Anselm, it seems a pity that a small shadow of thesis-writing should hang over his book; it is surely not necessary to point out how previous writers have not done what he is doing. To see what they have done and take that further seems to me the truly Anselmian approach. It is surely not his intention to give the impression that Anselm’s apprehension of the ‘beauty of theology’ was unknown to previous modern writers especially those concerned with the Prayers and Meditations and the *Proslogion*. Anselm’s sense of the beauty of God was there for them all; the words used were different but the content the same. This should have provided a solid foundation for building this new brick into the existing edifice. This study is an accessible introduction to Anselm’s theology by means of a new emphasis on its basis in ‘beauty’, that is, the extension of longing and desire for the ultimate beauty of God, an approach with which Anselm would have agreed.

OXFORD

BENEDICTA WARD

Anima mea. Prières privées et textes de dévotion du moyen âge latin. Autour des Prières ou Méditations attribuées à saint Anselme de Cantorbéry (XIe–XIIe siècle). By Jean-François Cottier. (Recherches sur les Rhétoriques Religieuses, 3.) Pp. clxx + 326. Turnhout: Brepols, 2001. €84 (paper). 2 503 51214 3

JEH (57) 2006; doi:10.1017/S0022046905576218

Jean-François Cottier has made a valuable contribution to the literature of medieval devotion by publishing the first critical edition (with a French translation) of the Anselmian collections of prayers composed after the ‘Anselmian revolution’. In a detailed introduction he gives an account of the political and religious context of these collections and the earlier development of the literature of devotion. In particular he examines its sources, its relation to the abridged psalters in use from the seventh century and its rhetoric. Anselm’s collection of prayers and meditations was both faithful to the tradition and radically new. Owing to Anselm’s high reputation as a spiritual teacher his prayer collections were widely circulated during his lifetime, and accretions rapidly gathered round the original twenty-three genuinely Anselmian pieces. The genuine collections have already been published and a number of scholars have worked on the accretions. Cottier’s achievement is to have edited the prayers and meditations added chiefly in the twelfth century, distinguishing carefully, as Anselm himself did, between the prayers that had a dialectical dimension and the meditations that often took the form of a monologue. In addition he has looked carefully at the way in which the intensely personal devotion of Anselm and his passionate introspection influenced the language in which he conveyed his spirituality to the reader. The earliest and most homogenous

of the additions in the apocryphal collections here printed is that attributed to 'Ralph the monk', probably of Battle. These bring out strongly both the debt to Anselm and the differences from his genuine work. For example, though Ralph wrote in his meditations with great feeling of the tenderness of God revealed in his Son, they were more like sermons and his style was often heavy and clumsy. Moreover, they made much greater direct use of the Psalms and other earlier prayers. Such characteristics were more marked in other later additions; among the accretions were some prayers of Archbishop Maurilius of Rouen, some based on the writings of John of Fécamp and even a celebrated *confessio peccatorum* of Alcuin. There were only a few prayers to the saints, notably to St Andrew and St Anne who were not included in the genuine works of Anselm. These new prayers were especially popular in England, as was that to the Holy Cross, which continued the Anglo-Saxon tradition of meditations on the Rood. Cottier's editing, based on extensive knowledge of original manuscripts, is exemplary, and he has built appreciatively but critically on the work of other earlier editors of some of the texts, correcting occasional errors and providing a list of the dates at which individual prayers first appeared in the collections. He has produced a book that makes an important contribution to the history of medieval spirituality.

CLARE HALL,
CAMBRIDGE

MARJORIE CHIBNALL

Body and sacred place in medieval Europe, 1100–1389. By Dawn Marie Hayes. (Medieval History and Culture, 18.) Pp. xxiii + 193 incl. 10 ills. New York–London: Routledge, 2003. £50. 0 415 98838 1
JEH (57) 2006; doi:10.1017/S0022046905586214

This volume contributes to the growing literature on medieval sacred space that emphasises permeability and change in spatial practices. In common with historians including Barbara Rosenwein and Megan Cassidy-Welch, Hayes is concerned with the origins and operation of sacred space. Her focus is on the relationship between the body and the Church, addressing the transferability of both sacredness and pollution. Following Miri Rubin, she addresses the significance of the body as the ultimate medieval metaphor, and the Church in representing the human body, the social body and the body of Christ. Her two case studies are the cathedrals of Chartres and Canterbury in the twelfth and thirteenth centuries; a third general study addresses non-religious activity in sacred places. Chartres is used to explore the relationship between the body, the cult of saints and the marketing strategies of the medieval Church. Hayes argues that the clergy of Chartres compiled the *Miracles of Our Lady of Chartres* as 'a portfolio for a clerical advertising campaign' when funds were needed to rebuild the church after the fire of 1194. The miracle stories developed around the *Sancta Camisia*, the shirt worn by Mary during the Nativity, a unique relic that was believed to have come into contact with the bodies of both Mary and Jesus. Its corporeality resonated in the cult and naming of Chartres, from *caro* or flesh, 'Our Lady of the Flesh'. Canterbury is discussed in relation to the murder of Thomas Becket on 29 December 1170 and the insight into sacred space provided by accounts of the martyrdom. Contemporaries were particularly shocked that the archbishop was murdered in the cathedral church during vespers in the

Christmas festival; this was violation of the sacred person, place and time. Hayes argues convincingly that the significance of Becket's murder, and the ensuing cult status of Canterbury, resulted as much from this injury to sacred space. In a separate chapter, Hayes presents the evidence for non-liturgical uses of sacred space, including the regular employment of cemeteries for sales and fairs that were exempt from taxes, and the adoption of churches and cloisters for taverns, games, legal courts and accommodation for pilgrims. Here, the text demonstrates a lack of familiarity with parallel literature in archaeology and art history (for example Michael Camille's *Image on the edge*). She stresses the anxiety that surrounded the space of the cathedral nave, a space where secular men and women could make visual and physical contact. Morality tales grew up surrounding illicit sex in church, during which the offending couple was stuck miraculously and permanently together, as punishment for their violation of sacred place (discussed in detail by Dyan Elliott in *Fallen bodies*). In a brief conclusion, she extrapolates into the later Middle Ages and beyond, arguing that space became increasing compartmentalised. These wider conclusions are too broad to be meaningful, but should not detract from her strong case studies that explore the conflict between theory and practice in medieval sacred space. While historically well researched, this discussion would benefit from closer engagement with the physical space of churches; for instance, no plans were provided of the buildings discussed, but only a handful of poorly reproduced photographs of architectural details divorced from the text.

UNIVERSITY OF READING

ROBERTA GILCHRIST

The medieval crusade. Edited by Susan J. Ridyard, with an introduction by Jonathan Phillips. (Sewanee Medieval Studies, 14.) Pp. ix + 177. Woodbridge: The Boydell Press, 2004. £35. 1 84383 087 6

JEH (57) 2006; doi:10.1017/S0022046905596210

This volume contains ten essays derived from the 2001 Sewanee Medieval Colloquium. It is not an integrated collection, in that the disparate nature of the contents is held together only by the blanket title. The papers range chronologically from the First Crusade to the unfulfilled crusading plans of Philip the Good, duke of Burgundy, in 1454, and geographically from England in the west to Edessa in the east. There are two papers on the Jewish interpretation of the First Crusade by Robert Chazan, one on Peter the Hermit by Jay Rubenstein, and one on Edessa by Christopher MacEvitt. Thomas Madden and Alfred Andrea present the Fourth Crusade from the perspective of the Venetians and of Innocent III, Jonathan Riley-Smith examines the condition of the Templars and the Hospitallers in the early fourteenth century, and the volume is rounded off with studies of Piers Plowman by William Rogers and Philip the Good by Kelly DeVries. It looks as if the participants were given a brief to challenge conventional opinion. The four papers by the two keynote speakers illustrate this. Robert Chazan examines how the linked Hebrew sources – Solomon bar Simson, Eliezer bar Nathan and the *Mainz Anonymous* – interpret the indisputable Christian success in conquering Jerusalem. Chazan sees the *Mainz Anonymous* as a particularly valuable source, the purpose of which was both to show how Jews should respond in the face of crusading violence and to examine the spiritual significance of this apparent Christian triumph.

Comparison with the *Gesta francorum* is instructive, since there are similarities, most evidently in the representation of heroic self-sacrifice through the exercise of human will. Naturally each has its own perspective on this: for the *Gesta*, God has rewarded crusader bravery despite overwhelming difficulties, whereas for the *Mainz Anonymous*, Jewish heroes are those willing to receive martyrdom, a sacrifice which God will ultimately recognise. In his second paper Chazan demonstrates the continuity of this argument, for the long-term problems of the Christians in the east convinced Jewish scholars that they were correct to deny that the circumstances of 1099 accorded with the beginning of the messianic age. Jonathan Riley-Smith similarly re-evaluates a quite well-known body of documents, that of the depositions made by the Templars during their trial. His starting-point was a study of the order's administrative structure, which is the subject of his second essay, but in the course of this he became convinced that the Temple was suffering from serious internal problems, which would, in a relatively short time, have led to its suppression in any case. His conclusion is that, while some of the accusations can be dismissed, it seems probable that the denial of Christ and the spitting on the cross really did occur in some parts of France, Italy and the Levant. The long-term value of these papers is less the light they throw on the crusades, which in some cases is marginal, but in such reappraisals of the sources. Thus the *Mainz Anonymous* has generally been the least regarded of the three major Hebrew accounts, while few serious historians have suggested that the Templars might have been guilty since Hans Prutz over a century ago. This, then, is a worthwhile exercise if only for the challenges it offers; nevertheless, stimulating as these approaches are, they are not always totally convincing, or indeed, entirely consistent.

UNIVERSITY OF READING

MALCOLM BARBER

Carmel in Britain. Studies on the early history of the Carmelite order, III: The hermits from Mount Carmel. By Richard Copsey. Pp. xii + 514. Faversham: Saint Albert's Press/Rome: Edizioni Carmelitane, 2004. £17.50 (paper). 0 904849 23 6; 88 7288 074 2
JEH (57) 2006; doi:10.1017/S0022046905606215

Scholarly studies of the Carmelites, who, along with the Augustinian hermits, are the 'forgotten cousins' of the more celebrated mendicant families of Franciscans and Dominicans, are always welcome. This collection of essays forms the third volume in the series *Carmel in Britain* (the first two volumes, *People and places*, and *Theology and writings*, Rome 1992, were edited by Patrick Fitzgerald-Lombard), which is devoted to reconstructing and examining the extent, nature and work of the medieval British Carmelite provinces. In contrast to the two earlier volumes, which brought together the work of a number of Carmelite scholars, this volume represents the work of Richard Copsey alone. Of the thirteen essays, nine have already appeared elsewhere – most in specialist Carmelite publications, though 'Simon Stock and the scapular vision' was first published in this *JOURNAL* 1 (1999), 652–83. The collection demonstrates the widening of Copsey's scholarly concerns, from the medieval documentation of the English and Scottish provinces ('The Scottish Carmelite province and its provincials', 'The foundation dates of the Scottish Carmelite houses', 'The Carmelites in Aberdeen, 1273–1560', 'The visit of the

prior-general, Peter Terrasse, to England in 1504–5', 'The English Carmelites at the Dissolution'), to issues of broader Carmelite history and identity ('Establishment, identity and papal approval: the Carmelite order's creation of its legendary history', 'Two letters from the Holy Land', 'The *Ignea sagitta* and its readership', 'Simon Stock and the scapular vision'). At the root of Copsey's research lies close textual analysis of surviving sources and of the modes of dissemination of a Carmelite narrative through often incomplete or partially recovered texts. In this vein are his studies of John Bale's work ('The wandering doctoral student: an analysis of MS Harley 1819, John Bale's notebook of his visit to France and Italy in 1526–7', and 'An English Carmelite abroad: John Bale's visit to northern Italy in 1527'), and of one of the texts whose survival depends on Bale's copying activities ('An anonymous chronicle from the Carmelite house, Calais'). Bale's importance as a magpie-like collector and curator of texts relating to Carmelite history and hagiography makes these essays particularly enlightening for understanding how early Carmelite history can be recovered. One of the most intractable problems in medieval Carmelite research is that for many of the order's chroniclers, Bale among them, the wish was father to the thought. The Carmelites developed a sophisticated history based on *a priori* assumptions about their antiquity, which, by the fourteenth century, they were tracing back to the prophet Elijah. The process of elision from documented history to legend can be better understood through Copsey's detailed reconstructions of Bale's notebooks. The reasons for Carmelite historical appropriations and confections relate to the circumstances of the order's settlement, and these Copsey explains in the first essay in the collection. One can see the need for a general introduction of this kind, but this essay, written for the International Medieval Conference at Leeds in 1999, is the weakest in the collection. A howler in the second line (Acre was not recaptured by 'Louis of France') sets the tone for what is essentially a survey of material already known from other scholars such as Cicconetti, Egan and Smet. This is unfortunate, but it should not deter readers from the richer pickings in Copsey's specialist studies of Carmelite documents and textual traditions.

LANCASTER UNIVERSITY

ANDREW JOTISCHKY

The Norman frontier in the twelfth and early thirteenth centuries. By Daniel Power. (Cambridge Studies in Medieval Life and Thought, 4th Ser., 62.) Pp. xiii + 634 incl. frontispiece, 9 maps, 3 tables. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2004. £80. 0 521 57172 3
 JEH (57) 2006; doi:10.1017/S0022046905616211

If this work had its origins in challenging the thesis of Maurice Powicke's *The loss of Normandy* (Manchester 1913, repr. 1961), it has developed into something of wider significance. *The loss of Normandy* has stood for so long as a classic largely because as a work of scholarship on the Angevin administration of Normandy it is so monumental that it has not been seriously contested in print, until now. In explaining the 'loss of Normandy' in 1204, Powicke branded the Norman aristocracy cowards and traitors for their failure to defend the duchy of Normandy against the Capetian invasion of 1204. But Powicke was not justified in treating 'the Norman aristocracy' as a homogeneous group, all of whom owed allegiance to the duke, by sentiment or by custom. The important distinction identified by Daniel

Power is between those aristocrats whose landholdings were in the heart of ducal Normandy and those on the periphery, the frontier. Power has taken a prosopographical approach to his study of the aristocracy of the Norman frontier, examining the case histories of particular families and individuals. As one would expect, individuals and family groups can be seen to be motivated by their own particular interests and concerns, relationships of blood and marriage and land tenure, rather than some abstract principle such as 'loyalty to the duke of Normandy'. One preliminary question, indeed, is about contemporary perceptions of 'Normandy'. Where did the duchy begin and end? What constituted the frontier? Hence *The Norman frontier* is at once a completely thoroughgoing and precise answer to Powicke on the 1204 question, and a major contribution to the historiography on medieval frontiers in general. A separate chapter considers the political relationship between the duchy of Normandy and the coterminous ecclesiastical province of Rouen. On close inspection, Power identifies numerous exceptions to the rule that all the territory of all seven Norman dioceses came under ducal authority. Despite the Angevin kings' jealous control of the appointment of bishops in Normandy, Power concludes that, 'just as often the Church arranged its affairs in spite of, not as a result of, the demands of the secular world' (p. 142). A more detailed discussion of the ecclesiastical history may be found in Daniel Power's article 'The Norman Church and the Angevin and Capetian kings', this JOURNAL lvi (2005), 205–34.

FITZWILLIAM COLLEGE,
CAMBRIDGE

JUDITH EVERARD

Liturgies in honour of Thomas Becket. By Kay Brainerd Slocum. Pp. xii + 379 incl. frontispiece and 6 ills. Toronto–Buffalo–London: University of Toronto Press, 2004. £42 (\$75). 0 8020 3650 3
JEH (57) 2006; doi:10.1017/S0022046905626218

Since the pioneering days of Bradshaw and Bishop, liturgical studies have tended to become the preserve of specialists. With certain honourable exceptions, such specialists have guarded their domain against the intrusion of mere historians by erecting a formidable barrier of terminological technicalities, reminiscent of the methods by which the most sea-green and incorruptible of archaeologists used to fend off the enquiries of the profane. The barrier between history and liturgy has been raised all the higher because an understanding of the liturgy necessarily involves an understanding of liturgical music, and the language of musicology, particularly of medieval musicology, has become so specialised as to make the liturgical experts, let alone the archaeologists, seem the most demotic of populists. How refreshing it is, therefore, to read a book on liturgical practice that does its best to be comprehensible to historians. Slocum's book is based upon an eminently sensible idea, albeit one already explored in studies of the Becket liturgies by D. Stevens, Andrew Hughes and Sherry Reames: that the audience reached by the liturgy was far wider than that reached by other literary forms, and that as a result it was chiefly through the liturgy that the legends both of Becket's martyrdom and of Henry II's tyranny were established and for the next four and a half centuries maintained. Becket himself was no stranger to the use of liturgical drama, as at Vézelay or during his last Christmas at Canterbury, and after his death his disciples

composed an elaborate and often beautiful series of antiphons and lessons in his honour. The thirteenth-century Peterborough chronicler Robert of Swaffham informs us that the principal rhymed liturgical office for Becket, *Studens livor*, was written by Benedict, monk of Canterbury, later abbot of Peterborough. Slocum, however, in common with previous commentators, argues that Benedict based the office not only upon his own *passio* of Thomas – which Slocum seeks, somewhat rashly, to identify with the text printed in the *Patrologia*, cxc.323–8 – but upon the short *vita* by John of Salisbury. The way in which phrases from the lections are mirrored and re-emphasised in the sung antiphons and responses suggests to Slocum that one person – Benedict – wrote the lessons, the sung texts and probably also the music: a thesis which is unlikely to command universal agreement. More significantly, the form of the lessons used at the Augustinian monastery of Klosterneuberg, dated here to c. 1200, suggests to Slocum that the secular, Sarum lessons were adapted, with only minor revision, from lessons composed for earlier monastic use: a thesis which has profound significance for the history of the entire Sarum liturgy, and which to some extent has recently been confirmed by Anne Duggan's discovery of an office from the imperial monastery of Stavelot which combines an eclectic selection of antiphons drawn from *Studens livor* with the first ten of what were to become the Sarum lessons, at Stavelot divided into a most peculiar eight. The Stavelot office is probably even earlier than Klosterneuberg, since the latter applies the distinctively thirteenth-century qualification *christianissimus* to the king of France. In common with Sarum, both Stavelot and Klosterneuberg refer to prayers for heretics, schismatics and 'the perfidious Jews' (p. 214), a reference which Slocum fails to explore but which would merit further investigation, since it might suggest a later date for the composition of these lessons than is generally accepted. The office for the feast of Becket's translation, devised after 1220, is attributed by Slocum, conjecturally but in common with other commentators, to Stephen Langton, and is shown to contain important references to the resettlement of England following the war of 1215–17. All of this is most interesting. None the less problems remain. The first 120 pages of Slocum's book – a retelling of Becket's life, with few new insights – might have been drastically and profitably condensed. Thereafter, Slocum supplies an edition of various of the offices and has interesting things to say about the ways in which they were adapted to particular uses. At York, for example, the lessons were chosen so as to minimise the role of Henry II in Becket's sufferings, to attribute the breach between Becket and the king to the wiles of the devil ('the spiteful enemy') rather than to any wider issue of Church and State and deliberately to tone down the emphasis, so deliberately played up at Canterbury, upon Becket's posthumous miracles. In the monastic use of Hyde Abbey, which were accompanied by the common antiphons for saints rather than the text and music of *Studens livor*, the lections and prayers emphasise Becket's humble birth: 'parentum mediocrum proles illustris', here translated (pp. 234, 238), with not entirely felicitous echoes of *Common worship*, as 'the illustrious son of middle-class parents'. Elsewhere, Slocum's translations are marred by a series of errors, some minor, some more serious, as, for example, at p. 229 where 'in preiudicium iuris ecclesiastici usurpata' can hardly be rendered as 'usurped into the precedent of ecclesiastical law'. Slocum admits to concentrating upon the offices of Matins and Lauds at the expense of any consideration of the Mass of St Thomas. But even here, her survey is more selective than might be expected, since she has nothing to say of the Exeter lections (*Ordinale*

Exon III, ed. J. N. Dalton, 74). These include details, not otherwise found in Sarum, of the feelings experienced by Becket's murderers after the martyrdom, apparently confessed by one of the murderers to Bishop Bartholomew of Exeter and thence recorded in the *vita* by Herbert of Bosham. By basing her edition of the Matins music upon a single fourteenth-century manuscript from Lewes, Slocum tacitly assumes that these are the same as the original, twelfth-century musical settings. Likewise, she has virtually nothing to say of performance practice which, at twelfth-century Canterbury or thirteenth-century Salisbury, may have differed significantly from the elaborate settings favoured later at Cluniac Lewes. All of these are questions which Slocum may care to ponder. None the less, used with caution, this remains an interesting and approachable study, providing a rare opportunity for historians to come to grips with a subject too often dismissed as unrewardingly arcane.

UNIVERSITY OF EAST ANGLIA

NICHOLAS VINCENT

Juden, Christen und Muslime. Religionsdialoge im Mittelalter. Edited by Matthias Lutz-Bachmann and Alexander Fidora. Pp. 240. Darmstadt: Wissenschaftliche Buchgesellschaft, 2004. €54. 3 534 17533 6
JEH (57) 2006; doi:10.1017/S0022046905636214

This volume brings together papers that were produced in connection with a colloquium and a research project at the Institut für Religionsphilosophische Forschung of the Johann Wolfgang Goethe University of Frankfurt-am-Main. The authors of the papers are philologists, theologians and philosophers of religion from Frankfurt, Tübingen, British Columbia and Barcelona. The essays concern the medieval dialogue of religions and the avowed purpose of the volume is to draw ideas and inspiration from the medieval past in order to find a way to promote a rational discussion of religion in our modern western secular culture. Recent world events have, according to the editors, raised the question whether religion can be a private affair and what the possibilities are for the public face of religion. And fundamentalist violence has raised the stakes of the discussion. The essays cover the relationship between Abraham Ibn Daud and Dominicus Gundissalinus in twelfth-century Spain, Latin translations of the Koran including the one in the so-called Toledan collection, Abelard's well-known dialogue between a Philosopher and a Jew and a Philosopher and a Christian, Thomas Aquinas's *Summa contra gentiles*, Ramon Llull's famous *Ars* (his universally applicable rational key to all truth), medieval Muslim responses to Christianity, Nicholas of Cusa's ideas about one religion in his *Peace of faith* and Thomas More's remarkable description of attitudes towards religion in Utopia. Although many of these pieces are very interesting in themselves – the article on Aquinas by Mattias Lutz-Bachmann is, for example, particularly enjoyable – quite a few of them do not seem to offer a great deal of startling new insights. Certainly to someone engaged in the medieval Jewish–Christian debate they seem at times unaware of the plethora of material published on that subject. Also there are issues which demand further consideration. To give just one example, the fact that Ramon Llull's *Ars* in the end served Christianity and the fact that Llull's goal was to convert Muslims (and Jews) to Christianity should have been considered in much greater detail. What implications does this have for Ramon's rules for engagement in interfaith dialogue by which

participants have to accept the views of their opponents as possible? More important in the context of this volume, how might this affect the potential usefulness of reason in religious dialogue in the present day? An essay that engages more fully with such problems is Hermann Schrödter's article on Nicholas of Cusa in which he points out that Nicholas's assumption that his 'one religion' was best represented by Christianity can obviously have no place in modern discussions of religion. His reference to Thomas More's words on religious toleration in *Utopia* is intriguing. It is a pity that no indication is given of how these ideas would have meshed with More's own actions against heretics.

LUCY CAVENDISH COLLEGE,
CAMBRIDGE

ANNA SAPIR ABULAFIA

Innocent III and the crown of Aragon. The limits of papal authority. By Damian J. Smith. (Church, Faith and Culture in the Medieval West.) Pp. xiii + 339. Aldershot: Ashgate, 2004. £50. 0 7546 3492 2
JEH (57) 2006; doi:10.1017/S0022046905646210

This study traces the history of the relations between Pope Innocent III and the crown of Aragon from 1198 to 1216, during the reign of Peter II and the first years of the minority of James I. The first part of the work discusses Peter's coronation by Innocent in 1204, his participation in the struggle with the Almohads and the confrontation with the Albigensian Crusade which led to Peter's death in battle at Muret on 12 September 1213. The rest of the book deals with Innocent's relations with the bishops of Catalonia and Aragon, his role as judge of cases and his attempts to reform religious life in the crown. While the whole book is solidly based on contemporary sources this second part (pp. 173–260) seems to me its most original contribution to research. Throughout Smith draws not only on the Vatican registers, the documents in the *Arxiu de la Corona de Aragon* and the *Archivo Histórico Nacional* but also on ecclesiastical and secular archives in ten other Spanish cities. He is clearly familiar with the proliferating modern bibliography. Although the style of the book might be improved the judgements on Innocent's policies are sensible and moderate. I would merely question the unprovable assertion (p. 178) – derived from Vauchez – that the *Life* of Homobono of Cremona (canonised by Innocent) 'was later to form the basis for Ramon Llull's *Llibre de Evast e Blanquerna*'. While it might be held that it was with the Fourth Crusade to Constantinople that the 'limits of papal authority and competence were most cruelly exposed', Smith is right to say that Muret greatly helped to underline them.

UNIVERSITY OF TORONTO

J. N. HILLGARTH

The Fourth Crusade. Event and content. By Michael Angold. (The Medieval World.) Pp. xxii + 281 incl. 6 maps and 3 plates. Harlow: Pearson, 2003. £14.99 (paper). 0 582 35610 5
JEH (57) 2006; doi:10.1017/S0022046905656217

The 800th anniversary of the Fourth Crusade's conquest of Constantinople (1204) has hardly gone unmarked. Donald Queller's thorough exposition (1977) appeared in

its second edition (1997) as revised by Thomas F. Madden. Both are leading Venetianists, and Madden's own new book on Enrico Dandolo (2003) gives vital new Venetian background. A specialist in the crusades, Jonathan Philips has published his detailed, if discursive, sometimes speculative, narrative, designed for the general reader (2004). In vindicating the 'theory of accidents' – denying any preconceived plan to attack Byzantium – they are now joined by Michael Angold, a distinguished Byzantinist who has written significantly about both sides of 1204. Unlike other writers, Angold is more interested in analysis than narrative. His premise is that our dependence upon the sources surviving to us complicates our understanding of both facts and meaning of past events: these sources 'are not just guides to the unfolding of events, but part of the historical process' (p. 7). After critical scrutiny of our specific sources, Angold dissects the perspectives, interests and motivations of the different parties involved: the Byzantines, the various Frankish crusaders and the Venetians. The chapter he then offers, on the events of the expedition (pp. 75–109) – concise yet quite thorough – focuses on how choices were faced and decisions made. Few new interpretations emerge, though Angold argues that Boniface of Montferrat and the Venetians had agreed to champion the Byzantine prince Alexios Angelos as early as the summer of 1202, well before the gathering in Venice or the rallying at Corfu. But Angold brings new clarity to the complex processes of the expedition. The book's greatest substance, however, is in its later chapters. These explore the aftermath of the Fourth Crusade with an extended probing quite beyond what the other numerous publications on the episode attempt. Tracing the shifting perspectives of various contemporaries, Angold shows that the initial perception of the taking of Constantinople as a contained upheaval evolved only gradually into the idea of a 'crime against humanity'. The consequences of 1204 were quite unforeseeable, he stresses. The futility of the short-lived Latin empire was guaranteed, while the meaning of the event shifted dramatically for the Byzantines as they struggled for vindication and renewal. The disastrous Latin (Venetian) patriarchate of Constantinople and the intransigence of the popes, especially Innocent III, wrecked the hoped-for reunion of the Greek and Latin Churches. Angold argues that the devastation of Constantinople ended its capacity to dominate a centralised world and thereby 'liberated' the Byzantine heritage from its former imperial associations. Thus, Byzantium itself survived only as united around Orthodoxy and Hellenic culture, while Venice assimilated a Byzantine legacy sanitised to serve a republic now facing the economic and institutional challenges of its own new 'empire'. And the new westward flow of relics and art works allowed Europe's full assimilation of Byzantine spiritual and artistic expression, most powerfully to the advantage of the French Capetian dynasty's 'religion of monarchy'. In all, if Angold's book is not the only work readers may want for the story of the Fourth Crusade, its insights and provocations can be ignored by no historian of medieval Christendom in the twelfth–fourteenth centuries.

The poverty of riches. St Francis of Assisi reconsidered. By Kenneth Baxter Wolf. (Oxford Studies in Historical Theology.) Pp. x+165. New York–Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2003. £25. 0 19 515808 3
JEH (57) 2006; doi:10.1017/S0022046905666213

In what is an informed, revisionist brain-storming on the nature of voluntary poverty as reflected by the most popular example of it in history, St Francis of Assisi, Kenneth Wolf concentrates on the ‘ironies and contradictions’ inherent in Francis’s ‘brand’ of poverty, the central theme being the negative effect of Franciscan poverty and mendicancy on the conditions of the real poor. In the first part of the book, with a series of arguments, some rather unhistorical and moralistic, Wolf sets out his criticism of Francis’s poverty as it was described in the early biographies of the saint. Francis’s interaction with the poor and the lepers is seen to confer spiritual benefits only on himself and did not alleviate the burdens of those involuntarily poor (chs i, iii). Francis distinguished himself from these by way of his tunic (ch. ii). To embrace holy poverty, one had to be rich to start with (p. 26, ch. iv). The author’s justification for this anachronistic (as Wolf admits on p. 37) approach seems to be ‘heightening our sensitivity to the distance between his [Francis’s] world and our own’ (p. 38). Wolf’s sources are largely the anecdotes concerning material poverty in the early accounts of the life of Francis. Laudably, the author leaves out the fourteenth-century sources on the life of the saint that are tainted with the later controversies within the order on the issue of poverty. The second part of the book makes a useful and interesting read, as it tries to place Francis’s particular approach to poverty in a historical context, by discussing the poverty of Jesus as the example for Francis (ch. v), pointing to the superiority of the *vita passiva* to the *vita activa* in the tradition of the Christian notion of sanctity (ch. vi), comparing Francis to the saints particularly devoted to the relief of the poor (ch. vii) and reminding us that Francis’s poverty was the production of a society shaped by the urban economy. Wolf’s intention in ‘problematizing this traditionally unproblematic saint’ (p. 5) is no doubt admirable. However, certain pivotal issues remained unmentioned, such as the spiritual alleviation of the real poor through Francis’s exaltation of poverty, and the centrality of the disdain for earthly goods and not of material sacrifice itself in the idea of holy poverty (mentioned very briefly on pp. 84–5). Also, if the author really wishes to make the case that alms to mendicants deprived the ‘real’ poor of those alms, it would have been better to have looked for evidence in the patterns of medieval poor relief or alms-giving. The most essential element of Francis’s poverty, as elaborated in his own writings, was ‘the poverty of the spirit’. Here, the early sources on the life of Francis, with their strong emphasis on material poverty, make things difficult by stressing the depth of the commitment through showing how much is given up. However, this tends to obscure the nature of the commitment itself, overshadowing Francis’s own insistence on poverty of the spirit as a combination of humility, lowliness and obedience. Wolf says that he is investigating Francis’s poverty as the early biographers understood it (p. 7), but then the resulting examination may tell us more about the nature of hagiography than about Francis’s notion of poverty.

Praedicatores, inquisitores, I: The Dominicans and the medieval inquisition. Acts of the first international seminar on the Dominicans and the inquisition, 23–25 February 2002. Edited by Wolfram Hoyer. (Dissertationes Historicae Fasciculus, 29.) Pp. 823 + 1 pull-out colour plate. Rome: Insituto Storico Domenicano, 2004.

JEH (57) 2006; doi:10.1017/S002204690567621X

This volume opens with a quotation from the 1998 Dominican general chapter at Bologna:

The Order of Preachers regretfully remembers the role of some members in the Order in the injustices of the Inquisition. We recommend that the Historical Institute of the Order ... examine the role played by some of its members in the injustices of the past in order to help to purify our memory and to involve the Order in a quest of truth, leaving the judgement of people to God alone.

To fulfil this directive, a group of expert historians were gathered in Rome in 2002 to give papers on Dominican involvement in inquisitorial activity between c. 1228 and 1520. The proceedings of that conference (in fact, the first of a series) are here gathered: twenty-six articles in total, of which eight are in English, seven in Italian, five in German, four in Spanish and three in French. The book opens with a programmatic *tour de force* of an introduction by Grado Merlo who introduces the *praedicatores, inquisitores* wordplay of the title and it ends with an elegant summing-up by Nicole Bériou who brings her expertise with sermons to bear on the theme of the inquisitor and Dominican identity. The contributions in between can largely be grouped into two categories: either general surveys of Dominican-staffed inquisitions in specific areas like Languedoc (Laurent Albaret), Germany (Peter Segl, K. Springer), Poland (Pawel Kraus) and southern Italy (Francesco Aqaranta), or studies of individual inquisitors like Bernard Gui (Peter Biller, Thomas Scharff), Nicholas Emmerich (Jaume de Puig i Oliver, Claudia Heimann), Lanfranco da Bergamo (Marina Benedetti), Henricus Institoris (Walter Senner), Robert Le Bourge (Simon Tugwell), Florio da Vincenza (Richardo Parmeggiani), Raoul de Plassac and Pons de Parnac (Caterina Bruschi) and Lorenzo Solero (Michael Tavuzzi). Falling into neither of these categories is M. Michèle Mulchahey's stimulating piece on education in which she underlines 'the complementarity between manuals the Dominican order produced over the course of the thirteenth century for its confessors and those the order put in the hands of its inquisitors'. Similarly, Augustine Thompson concentrates on an event, a 1299 revolt against a Bolognese inquisitor, and in so doing, firmly grounds heresy and inquisitorial power in a local context of social relations *à la* Montaillou. At over 800 pages, this is a book of many facts and it sometimes reads like 'one damned thing after another'. What saves it from being that is the high quality of many papers and, even more, the transcript of the lively and provocative exchanges after each session between presenters and an audience including scholars such as Alexander Patchovsky and Josep Perarnau who attended the conference. These discussions animate the volume and help bridge the gaps between papers of widely varying subjects and methodology. Naturally, the experts do not provide a single or simple answer to the question about the role of the Dominicans in 'the medieval inquisition' posed by the general chapter, but they have certainly given it (and the reader) much to reflect upon.

Las postrimerías de un obispo alfonsoino. Don Suero Pérez, el de Zamora. By Peter Linehan and José Carlos de Lera Maíllo. Pp. 175 incl. 1 map and 2 ills. Zamora: Editorial Semuret, 2003. €12 (paper). 84 88954 40 9
JEH (57) 2006; doi:10.1017/S0022046905686216

With a few notable exceptions – such as Archbishop Diego Gelmírez of Santiago de Compostela (1100–40), whose prelatore was the subject of detailed and colourful eulogy in the voluminous *Historia Compostellana* – our knowledge of the activities and outlook of the Leonese-Castilian episcopate during the twelfth and thirteenth centuries is limited to say the least. The cathedral archives mostly yield little more than a bare record of the day-to-day dealings of these men: the property transactions they conducted; the *fueros* of rights and obligations they issued to their agricultural estate workers; the wearisome legal disputes in which they became embroiled, and so on. For the most part, the bishops themselves remain overwhelmingly distant, two-dimensional figures. The career of the redoubtable Bishop Suero of Zamora, however, is more illuminating than most. Appointed to the see of Zamora in 1255 by his patron Alfonso X of Castile, in whose chancery he served as notary, Suero was to hold the bishopric for nigh on three decades, until he was ignominiously removed from office at the behest of Sancho IV, probably in 1284. During the latter stages of his career, in all likelihood between 1273 and 1281, Bishop Suero drew up a remarkable *Memorandum*, in which he catalogued his achievements in office and the not inconsiderable sums of money that he had invested in the upkeep and improvement of his see. When Suero and his entourage had first arrived in Zamora, the see was deeply in debt and the only item of any value to be found, according to the bishop's testimony at least, was a mule with a pronounced limp in one leg. Suero claimed to have rebuilt the diocese almost from scratch, lavishing sizeable sums of money from his own pocket on purchasing cups, dishes and spoons for his residence, furnishing the episcopal library with new books, building houses, sponsoring alterations to the fabric of the cathedral and, not least, carrying out numerous improvements to the agricultural estates of his diocese. The *Memorandum* and the bishop's last will and testament, which he had drawn up *in hoc exilio* at his estate at Fermoselle on 11 May 1285, were until recently known only to a small handful of *cognoscenti*, but are now available to a wider public thanks to the labours of Peter Linehan, a seasoned observer of Iberian ecclesiastical politics, and the current archivist of the Archivo Histórico Diocesano of Zamora, José Carlos de Lera Maíllo. Their admirable study comprises two principal chapters. In the first, Linehan offers a characteristically penetrating analysis of Bishop Suero's career, and the circumstances that gave rise to the composition of the *Memorandum*; in the second, Lera Maíllo undertakes a detailed study of the diplomatic of the documents drawn up by the bishop. The rest of the book is given over to a careful edition of the Latin documents themselves, together with a Spanish translation of each. The edition is buttressed by notes, indices, a map and a full bibliography.

The register of Walter Bronescombe, bishop of Exeter, 1258–1280. Vol. 3. Edited by O. F. Robinson. (Canterbury and York Society, 94.) Pp. viii + 126. Woodbridge: Boydell Press (for the Canterbury & York Society), 2003. £25. 0 907239 64 1; 0262 995X

JEH (57) 2006; doi:10.1017/S0022046905696212

This volume completes the re-editing of the register of Walter Bronescombe, bishop of Exeter. It consists of the Latin and French texts of some eighty entries of particular interest translated in volume ii, together with two appendices and the indices. Appendix i contains the Latin texts, with English summaries, of deeds from Bronescombe's time stitched into the register, some of them transcriptions by a sixteenth-century registrar, and Appendix ii gives the Latin text and English summaries of the two sets of cathedral statutes issued by Bronescombe in 1268 and 1275. Given Bronescombe's importance in the medieval history of the cathedral as rebuilders, benefactor and reformer, these are particularly welcome; until now no Exeter statutes have been printed. The indices, which occupy nearly half the volume, are thorough and by listing spelling variants go some way towards answering the concerns raised in the review of volumes i and ii of the register (this *JOURNAL* lii [2002], 151–2). The now complete new edition is to be welcomed for making the register much easier to use than Hingeston-Randolph's 1889 calendared edition. However, Hingeston-Randolph's edition still has some value as it contains the bishop's itinerary, a list of documents in the treasury in his time and some charters from before Bronescombe's time.

UNIVERSITY OF EXETER

DAVID LEPINE

Hugues de Saint-Cher (†1263), bibliste et théologien. Edited by Louis-Jacques Bataillon, Gilbert Dahan and Pierre-Marie Gy. (Bibliothèque d'histoire culturelle du moyen âge, 1.) Pp. 524. Turnhout: Brepols, 2004. €70 (paper). 2 503 51721 8

JEH (57) 2006; doi:10.1017/S0022046905706217

This volume represents part of the fruits of a conference on Hugh of St Cher OP, held at the Centre d'études du Saulchoir in Paris, in March 2000. It is to be followed by a volume of documents relating to Hugh which grew out of the conference and which will supply much of the evidence for these essays; it is eagerly awaited. An unreasonably neglected scholar and administrator from the earliest period of the Dominican school in Paris, Hugh chalked up a series of glittering prizes in his lifetime; reading his works today, it is not hard to see why. It is thus easy to welcome this volume, even while wishing that its invited contributors had been as international as the scholars who made up the St Jacques convent in the thirteenth century. There is, as Carra de Vaux concludes, much still to be done. The contents of this volume are: J. Verger, 'Hugues de Saint-Cher dans le contexte universitaire parisien'; P.-M. Gy, 'Hugues de Saint-Cher dominican'; P. Stürnemann, 'Les Manuscrits de la *Postille*'; B. Carra de Vaux, 'La Constitution du corpus exégétique'; G. Dahan, 'L'Exégèse de Hugues: méthode et herméneutique'; M. Morard, 'Hugues de Saint-Cher, commentateur des Psaumes'; A. Sulavik, 'Hugh of St Cher's *Postill* on the Book of Baruch: the work of a medieval compiler or biblical exegete?'; G. Berceville, 'Les Commentaires évangéliques de Thomas d'Aquin et Hugues de Saint-Cher'; A. Sylwan, 'Pierre le Chantre et Hugues de Saint-Cher: contribution à l'étude de leurs sources'; R. E. Lerner, 'The vocation of

the friars preacher: Hugh of St Cher between Peter the Chanter and Albert the Great'; B. Hodel, 'Les Sermons reportés de Hugues de Saint-Cher'; N. Bériou, 'Frederico Visconti, archevêque de Pise, disciple de Hugues de Saint-Cher'; B. Faes de Mottoni, 'Les Manuscrits du commentaire des *Sentences* de Hugues de Saint-Cher'; R. Quinto, 'Le Commentaire des *Sentences* d'Hugues de Saint-Cher et la littérature théologique de son temps'; C. Trottmann, 'Syndérèse et liberté dans le commentaire des *Sentences* de Hugues de Saint-Cher (éléments de théologie morale)'; C. de Miramon, 'La Place d'Hugues de Saint-Cher dans les débats sur la pluralité des bénéfices'; M. van der Lugt, 'Le Miracle chez Hugues de Saint-Cher: de la théorie à la pratique'; A. Boureau, 'Hugues de Saint-Cher commentateur des *Sentences*: le cas du sacrement du mariage'; M. Albaric, 'Hugues de Saint-Cher et les concordances bibliques latines (XIIIe-XVIIIe siècles)'; M. Paulmier-Foucart, 'A l'Origine du *Speculum maius*: notes sur la relation probable entre Hugues de Saint-Cher et Vincent de Beauvais'; L.-J. Bataillon, 'L'Influence d'Hugues de Saint-Cher'. The essays by Stirnemann, Dahan, Morard, Bériou, Miramon, Boureau and Paulmier-Foucart struck me as particularly fruitful and well-imagined, but the list obviously reflects this reviewer's interests as much as scholarly worth. There is, unfortunately, no gathered bibliography, but this may appear in volume ii.

HARRIS MANCHESTER COLLEGE,
OXFORD

LESLEY SMITH

Mutui e risarcimenti del comune di Treviso (secolo XIII). By Alfredo Michielin. (Fonti per la Storia della Terraferma Veneta, 20.) Pp. cxxviii + 1335 + 12 plates. Rome: Viella, 2003. €110. 88 8334 118 X

JEH (57) 2006; doi:10.1017/S0022046905716213

The material printed here (in full, with Italian summaries) represents a rather curious archival survival. Accompanied by a full introduction and some sixty pages of indices, this is a compilation made in 1275 recording the debts of the commune of Treviso incurred in the period 1236–8. The intention was presumably to achieve belated repayment of these debts of four decades earlier, yet it seems unlikely that this was implemented. Some 96 per cent of the debts relate to 1,594 loans to the commune (totalling over 50,000*l.*). Most of these were probably part of the forced loan imposed in 1238 to finance the sum owed to Ezzelino III da Romano. The sums lent were mainly quite small, though larger ones include 500*l.* provided by the cathedral chapter and one amounting to some 4,700*l.* from the Trevisan Tebaldo de Aynardis. The normal rate of interest on these loans appears to have been 15 per cent, though this remains an academic point in the circumstances of non-repayment. Almost all the remaining debts acknowledged were related to compensation due for losses suffered in war. This usually concerned horses, though the lists of weapons and armour lost are of particular interest since such survivals are rarer. A few subsidiary items were recorded at about the same time, the most notable of which relate to Treviso's arrangements for the defence of Castelfranco, an important frontier fortress. In the years 1262–79 the commune enfeoffed sixteen new tenants at Castelfranco. In each instance these replaced a former tenant. The services due involved castle guard and provided a local body of twenty cavalymen.

LEWES

DANIEL WALEY

Honoring God and the city. Music at the Venetian confraternities, 1260–1807. By Jonathan Glixon. Pp. xvi + 372 incl. 4 figs and 7 tables. Oxford–New York: Oxford University Press, 2003. £65. 0 19 513489 3
JEH (57) 2006; doi:10.1017/S002204690572621X

Jonathan Glixon's Princeton doctoral dissertation of 1983, 'Music at the Venetian "scuole grandi", 1440–1540' was followed by a series of articles and book chapters, and now culminates in a masterly extension of that work to cover the origins of the *scuole* from c. 1260 to their decline and final suppression in 1807. The confraternities known as *scuole grandi* were noted for elaborate musical events associated with Venetian festivals, and for their employment of salaried musicians (some of them famous) over many centuries. Glixon also treats the *scuole piccole*, smaller confraternities usually without a stable body of salaried musicians, but which played an important local role and mounted festivities for which musicians were hired *ad hoc*. This book is essential reading not only for musicologists but for anyone interested in Venetian ceremony, and in the workings of these confraternities and their function within and relationship to the Serenissima. Meticulously researched and documented, it is the fruit of the author's sustained scholarly effort over about twenty-five years. It extracts from this long experience an eminently readable synthesis, daring to provide generalisations and useful comparative tables, not an easy task when the documentation surviving for each institution is so patchy. The labour attested in the long list of archival documents (mostly in the Venice Archivio di Stato) is lightly worn in the interests of a clear narrative. Sometimes the documentation is a little too obliquely hooked to the inferences it underpins; anyone who wanted to revisit the archives in search of material parallel to Glixon's main concerns, or to discriminate between different *scuole* where he has made generalisations, or for whom his findings raise new questions, might have welcomed more annotation of the archival listing. The artistic legacy of the major *scuole* is still visible to tourists; the richness of their silenced musical culture can only be reconstructed with effort, but this book succeeds in that reconstruction as well as the documentation permits: a fine achievement.

ALL SOULS COLLEGE,
 OXFORD

MARGARET BENT

The hanged man. A story of miracle, memory, and colonialism in the Middle Ages. By Robert Bartlett. Pp. xi + 168 incl. 12 figs. Princeton–Oxford: Princeton University Press, 2004. £16.95. 0 691 11719 5
JEH (57) 2006; doi:10.1017/S0022046905736216

In 1289 or 1290 William de Briouze (or Braose), lord of Gower, ordered that two Welshmen, William ap Rhys ('alias dictus' Cragh) and Traharn ap Howel be hanged at Swansea. William fell twice from the gallows and was hoisted again each time. He was pronounced dead and carried away. A few hours later he had what seemed to be a resurrection. The complete story of William's hanging has twice been told by historians recently: once in English (Jussi Hanska, 'The hanging of William Cragh: anatomy of a miracle', *Journal of Medieval History* xxvii [2001], 121–38) and once in Latin (Michael Richter, 'William ap Rhys, William de Braose, and the lordship of Gower, 1289 and 1307', *Studia Celtica* xxxii [1998], 189–209). The Latin

text is found in a dossier of texts concerning the canonisation of Thomas de Cantilupe, bishop of Hereford in Vat. lat. 4015. Richter's transcription occupies pp. 190–209 of his article. It contains the testimony taken from three witnesses deposed in London in July 1307 and another six taken in Hereford. One of the witnesses was William ap Rhys. One may ask whether this event, based on a very limited amount of evidence, merits a book, even if slim. The short answer is no.

The answer would be a emphatic 'yes' if Bartlett had put this dossier of texts into the context of the extraordinary thirty-nine other resurrections attributed to the indefatigable *post mortem* work of the former bishop of Hereford (an important fact that we do not learn until p. 51). Or if he could have answered with other evidence some of the intriguing questions that arise from the testimony of the witnesses. A central problem is why William de Briouze and his wife Maria did what they did. William refused an offer of 100 cattle to free William ap Rhys and Traharn ap Howel. Maria, however, asked that William's life be spared for reasons that are not explained by her or anyone else. After William was declared dead, Maria continued to be interested in his fate and used Bishop Thomas in seeking William's return to the living. The bishop did his job. After his resurrection William de Briouze, Maria and William ap Rhys journeyed together to Hereford where the news of the miracle was presented to the bishop and canons of Hereford. Most peculiarly the inquest of 1307 makes it clear that Maria and the de Briouze family completely lost track of William ap Rhys in the intervening years. After his pilgrimage to Hereford William ap Rhys announced that he would go to the Holy Land. That moment was, for the de Briouze, the end of their interest in the man. Bartlett does not even get around to asking these questions of the material until the end of the book (pp. 102–5) and then provides no more answers or context than Hanska in his short essay.

Bartlett's understanding of the legal procedure of the *ordo iudiciarius* is shaky and misleading. He describes a typical inquest as having a 'ruthlessly interrogatory style' and connects its method and rigour to the 'perceived threat of heresy' in medieval society. His presuppositions colour his interpretations. Although, remarkably, he calls the responses of the witnesses 'a genuine [?] interrogation' in which the 'commissioners <were> positively grilling [?] the witnesses' he does not realise how prosaic their work was. Instead, Bartlett thinks that the men asking the questions are 'condescending' when they observe that Maria de Briouze is not learned in law and that most of her testimony is hearsay. On the contrary this information is important for the judges who in the end would evaluate the material. Bartlett attaches adverbs like 'sharply' or 'blankly' to the responses of witnesses where such adverbs cannot be found in the text. Most of the witnesses spoke French, some spoke English and their answers were recorded in Latin. William ap Rhys spoke only Welsh. Over-interpretation (the curse of Montailou) is a trap into which Bartlett frequently falls. He either does not know or does not explain that the fact-gathering part of the *ordo iudiciarius* that is reflected in the deposition of witnesses for William ap Rhys was far from being 'inquisitorial'. He might have learned much from H. A. Kelly's essays on court procedure and from Lotte Kéry about the beginnings of how and when inquisitorial procedure took its place alongside accusatorial procedure in canonical courts (Pope Innocent III was not its creator). Unfortunately Thomas Wetzstein's detailed *Heilige vor Gericht: das Kanonisationsverfahren im europäischen Spätmittelalter* (2004) (who, unfortunately, repeats Trusen's views on the origins of inquisitorial procedure)

was published too late for him to use. In order to transform his limited material into a book Bartlett resorts to repetition (especially in chapter xxii) and digressions (chapter vii). One of the most striking anomalies in a work that purports to be sensitive to medieval colonialism is that he calls William ap Rhys 'William Cragh' throughout the book. The voices of the past make it clear that 'Cragh' was the name given to him by his French-speaking colonial lords.

Students can hear the voices of William ap Rhys and the other characters in this drama only through the prism of Bartlett's prose. He presents very few of their words in either English or Latin. For students the best introduction to William, Maria and the others remains the Latin text published by Richter. One last complaint illustrates the carelessness of the scholarship. The map on p. 69 shows the lordship of Gower but not its relationship to and distance from Hereford, a very important piece of information for understanding the story. Further the place names of Llanrhidian and Weobley in the text appear as Llachidian and Weabley on the map. Other place names mentioned in the text are not on the map.

THE CATHOLIC UNIVERSITY OF AMERICA

KENNETH PENNINGTON

An historical study with accompanying translations of Dante Alighieri's Monarchia, Guido Vernani's Refutation of the Monarchia composed by Dante, and Pope John XXII's Bull Si fratrum. By Anthony K. Cassell. Pp. xii + 404. Washington, DC: Catholic University of America Press, 2004. \$69.95. 0 8132 1338 X
JEH (57) 2006; doi:10.1017/S0022046905746212

Three important texts are brought together in this valuable study. Dante wrote *Monarchia* in 1318 in response to the dispute between Pope Clement v and the emperor Henry vii. The poet made two claims in the treatise: the world should be ruled by one sovereign and that sovereign should be completely independent of the pope. *Monarchia* has been translated many times into English. Cassell's translation is clear and lucid, but his notes to his translation and introduction are dauntingly copious. They are packed with bibliographical information. In fact they occupy pp. 203–53 as endnotes and make reading the book devilishly difficult sometimes. My old teacher Stephan Kuttner used to comment that when a note became a short essay 'perhaps it should be moved into the text?' Cassell stumbles a few times when he explains medieval law and political theory (p. 212: 'The "decretalists" are the theocratic commentators upon collections of [especially, but not exclusively] pontifical letters containing a *decretum*, rescript, or decision of a date later than Gratian's *Decretum*') and (p. 24: 'Dante passes in silence over ... passages of the *Corpus iuris civilis* that validated kings of the new national states as *de facto* and *de iure* independent of the emperor'). One may forgive him for picking up Dante's prejudice about the decretalists, but decretals do not contain a decretum. Theocratic is hardly the right adjective to describe them as a group. They embraced a wide variety of opinions on the relationship of Church and State. There are no passages in the *Corpus iuris civilis* that recognise the independence of the national states. Pope Innocent iii first brought this idea into the *ius commune* in his famous decretal *Per venerabilem* and canonistic commentaries (by decretalists) established this as a principle in European political thought. The translations of Guido Vernani's little treatise (pp. 174–97) and of Pope John xxii's decretal *Si fratrum* (pp. 198–201) are the

first into English. They too are of high quality. Cassell recognises that many of Guido's sources come from Gratian's *Decretum* but if he had checked the citations to Augustine and others he would have found more than he did (for example n. 70 is actually from C.23 q.1 c.4 and n. 71 is D.1 c.7 [the citation to Isidore is not necessary]). A slight confusion for the reader arises because he translates 'Decreta' as 'Decretals' when Guido cites Gratian. I was slightly amused that Cassell's love of Dante and irritation with his critic surfaces occasionally: (p. 351 n. 103) <Guido indulges in > 'a boasting, childish exaggeration'. It is not an exaggeration to say that this is a fine piece of work.

THE CATHOLIC UNIVERSITY OF AMERICA

KENNETH PENNINGTON

Latin sermon collections from later medieval England. Orthodox preaching in the age of Wyclif. By Siegfried Wenzel. (Cambridge Studies in Medieval Literature, 53.) Pp. xxiv + 715. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2005. £95. 0 521 84182 8 *JEH* (57) 2006; doi:10.1017/S0022046905756219

Siegfried Wenzel offers a *catalogue raisonné* of thirty-eight collections of sermons from the fourteenth and fifteenth centuries, framed by a general account of the sermons' circumstances and the preachers' response to theological controversy. Some twelve testify to the preaching of named individuals, including some familiar to students of the period, such as John Sheppey and Thomas Brinton, both Benedictine monks who became bishops of Rochester, or the Austin friar, John Waldeby, and the Benedictine, Robert Rypon. Many of the collections, unsurprisingly for the period, are anonymous. As is perhaps inevitable in any volume devoted to such slippery categories as 'sermon collection', 'orthodox' or even 'Latin' (terms carefully defined by the author), there are borderline cases and exceptions. Thomas Wimbleton is known as the author of a single influential sermon (which, although translated into more than one Latin version, was perhaps composed in English). John Mirk's *Festial* was composed in English (though Mirk earns his place by his orthodoxy in the 'age of Wyclif'). Richard FitzRalph (admired *by* Wyclif and his followers, but of a generation *before* Wyclif) would not otherwise leap to mind in a survey of orthodoxy. Nevertheless, Wenzel's wish to place his survey within an overview of the general ecclesiastical context justifies the inclusion of seeming anomalies. All preachers, whether overtly or covertly, needed to establish their own position in response to radical opinions, defined in 1382 and 1409, and through ongoing episcopal investigations, as erroneous or heretical. Survey and general chapters are followed by inventories of the component sermons in the 'collections' by incipit and explicit.

Wenzel, author of many well-received studies of Latin sermons, brings great personal authority to this welcome study of the Latin preaching of the late Middle Ages, an area neglected since the two pioneering studies by G. R. Owst.

EXETER COLLEGE,
OXFORD

HELEN LEITH SPENCER

Vita Edwardi Secundi. *The Life of Edward the Second*. Edited by N. Denholm-Young, re-edited with a new intro., apparatus and revised text and trans. by Wendy R. Childs. (Oxford Medieval Texts.) Pp. lx + 270. Oxford: Clarendon, 2005. £70. 0 19 927594 7
 JEH (57) 2006; doi:10.1017/S0022046905766215

Known to us from a single incomplete manuscript that itself was destroyed by fire only eight years after Thomas Hearne had transcribed and published it, the *Vita Edwardi Secundi* is the most significant yet still the most mysterious of the chronicles for Edward II's reign. This new version, which replaces Noel Denholm-Young's classic edition of 1957, is based upon a scrupulous reconsideration of the text itself and is supplied with a revised translation and historical notes that take account of the many new studies of Edward II published in the past fifty years. Ironically, whereas Denholm-Young was prepared to admit a degree of certainty over the date of the *Vita's* composition, which he placed in the mid 1320s, after Boroughbridge but before 1326, and even offered the name of a potential author – John Walwayn DCL, canon of Hereford and St Paul's, royal clerk and briefly the king's treasurer – Childs, having demolished each of these conjectures in turn, leaves us entirely uncertain about the *Vita's* date and authorship. On the whole (pp. xxi–iii), she inclines to Chris Given-Wilson's suggestion that the work is more in the nature of a journal, written up in several stages after c. 1310, than a memoir composed at one sitting in the mid 1320s. Like Denholm-Young and Given-Wilson, she identifies the author as a secular clerk rather than a regular, although she is sensitive to the author's pervasive moralising and the depth of his knowledge of Scripture, noting his citation of at least twenty-three books of the Old Testament and eleven of the New, besides a series of quotations from the litany and from homiletic literature. The title supplied by Hearne, as has long been recognised, gives a wholly misleading impression of the author's intent, which was to write a *historia*, not a *vita* or biography cast in Suetonian or panegyric mode. The model followed is that which had become traditional amongst English historians from the mid twelfth-century onwards: the provision of a theatre of moral examples, concentrating upon the realm rather than the ruler, using the events of Edward II's reign to illustrate the workings of a theocentric universe in which the fortunes of England ebbed and flowed according to the degree to which its leaders either obeyed or defied the will of God. What is most striking here is that the author, although remarkably well informed about historical events, at no point displays any more intimate knowledge of the king or his court. There is nothing, for example, on the physical disposition of the actors, on whether the king or the barons were sitting or standing, suppliant or threatening when they delivered their reported speeches: nothing, in short, of the sort of circumstantial details which confirm that other chroniclers – Roger of Howden or Matthew Paris, to name the most obvious examples – had regularly visited the court and had observed its peculiarities. If the author was a secular, and in particular if he was a wealthy cathedral canon, then he displays a perhaps atypically strident dislike for avarice, simony and above all pluralism. Despite the manuscript's association with Malmesbury Abbey, the author himself reveals no particular geographical loyalty. His richly homiletic tone, however, and his stylistic device of inserting forward comments phrased in the present tense – 'Watch yourself, Piers, for the earl of Lancaster will repay you like for like' (pp. 16–17), 'Alas, land of England. You who ... are now forced to beg' (pp. 120–1), and there are many more in this vein – are reminiscent not so much of contemporary

histories as of the tradition of politico-theological commentary to be found in sources such as the *Song of Leves*: sources which are generally located in the milieu not of the secular clergy but of the friars. On points of detail, Childs's editorial work is exemplary, although I suspect her of a misplaced search for metaphysical profundity behind the remark that Edward II intended to keep Lancaster prisoner, making of him 'a lion after the manner of Lombards' (pp. 212–13): surely nothing more than a reference to the Italian city states and their keeping of caged animals as mascots. A further series of phrases – for example at p. 194, 'subitas enim mutationes odit et miratur natura', or p. 216, 'non quid fiat sed quo animo Deus attendit' should have been identified as borrowed tags. The second of them appears in Abelard, which in turn supports a supposition that author of the *Vita* had extensive knowledge of contemporary penitential literature, further revealed in remarks such as that at p. 190: 'frequenter iuste contingit ut quis puniatur in quo deliquit'. In the same way, the peculiarities of the author's misquotations from Scripture (for example at p. 181 n. 366, and p. 182 n. 372) may one day supply a key, as yet untested, to his true identity. In short, this splendid new edition is likely to reopen rather than to conclude debate on a fascinating and highly significant text.

UNIVERSITY OF EAST ANGLIA

NICHOLAS VINCENT

Rechnungswesen und Buchhaltung des Avignonener Papsttums (1316–1378). Eine Quellenkunde.

By Stefan Weiss. (Monumenta Germaniae Historica. Hilfsmittel, 20.)

Pp. xxv + 254. Hanover: Hahnsche Buchhandlung, 2003. €30. 3 7752 1127 6; 0343-1266

JEH (57) 2006; doi:10.1017/S0022046905776211

The archives of the apostolic chamber (the papacy's department of finance) proliferated during the popes' residence at Avignon. Despite valiant efforts by a select band of scholars who have studied and published these records, there has been a pressing need for a new account of their nature and an inventory of them. Stefan Weiss has now provided these. He concentrates on the *Hauptbücher*, the main series of accounts of income and expenditure, which were arranged either chronologically or by subject. He also gives due weight to the various types of accounts which were preparatory to the *Hauptbücher* and which only survive haphazardly. His mastery of the sources enables him to provide a clear account of how record-keeping in the chamber developed and to correct numerous errors by earlier writers. Equally impressive is the application of the author's expertise to wider questions, for instance the changes in the functions of the chamberlain and the treasurer, double-entry book-keeping or the origins of the Great Schism. His analysis of Clement VI's pontificate is especially perceptive, showing how expenditure and revenue appeared to remain in balance while the pope depleted the massive reserve he had inherited from his predecessor. There is the occasional error of transcription or other lapse (for example, the chamberlain Pierre de Cros [Petrus de Croso] is called 'Petrus de Gros'), but this handbook represents a remarkable achievement. It is to be hoped that it will encourage more scholars to use the extremely rich records of the apostolic chamber in the Vatican Archives.

CORPUS CHRISTI COLLEGE,
CAMBRIDGE

P. N. R. ZUTSHI

Henry of Kirkstede, *Catalogus de libris authenticis et apocrifis*. Edited by Richard H. Rouse and Mary A. Rouse. (Corpus of British Medieval Library Catalogues, 11.) Pp. ccxiv + 597 incl. frontispiece and 8 plates. London: The British Library (with the British Academy), 2004. £90. 0 7123 4837 9
JEH (57) 2006; doi:10.1017/S0022046905786218

Henry of Kirkstead (*Kirkstede*, died in or shortly after 1378), monk of Bury St Edmunds, was librarian, novice master and finally prior, but is best known as a distinguished bibliographer. During his long career at St Edmunds, but especially in the 1350s and 1360s, he studied the monks' book collection, one of the best in England, comprising about 1,500 or 2,000 volumes. Of this collection about 270 survive today, many preserving evidence of Kirkstead's endeavours. He would inscribe St Edmunds's *ex libris* and class-mark in a book, paginate it and often prefix a contents' list. Moreover, he might add notes on authors, their works and so forth in the margins, on flyleaves and in other blank spaces. Much of this labour was preparatory to the compilation of his great catalogue, the *Catalogus de libris authenticis et apocrifis* in which he lists 674 authors in alphabetical order, and, as far as his knowledge permitted, provided biographical information about each author and records what he wrote. Kirkstead knew of about 3,895 works and, if he could, gave the *incipits* and *explicits* of each and indicated, by means of location numbers, where a copy or copies could be found. The *Catalogus* is preceded by a key to the location numbers (St Edmunds itself is '82') which shows that Kirkstead knew of book collections in 195 religious houses throughout England. Some of Kirkstead's annotations reappear in the *Catalogus* which demonstrate their connection with the latter. The ultimate purpose of his labours was to provide preachers and students with reliable texts and, by means of the *Catalogus*, to guide them to appropriate works. The *Catalogus* was in the tradition of Jerome's *De viris illustribus* from which Kirkstead borrowed much information about authors and their works. He also had a number of other models and sources. Especially useful were two early fourteenth-century catalogues: the Franciscan *Registrum Anglie de libris doctorum et auctorum veterum*, a copy of which Kirkstead may have obtained from the friary at Babwell just outside Bury; this not only provided him with the names of sixty-seven authors and their works but also suggested the practice of using location numbers. The other early fourteenth-century catalogue serving both as a source and a model was the *Manipulus florum* compiled in Paris by Thomas Ireland; from it Kirkstead seems to have borrowed the idea of identifying works by their *incipits* and *explicits*. Among his many other sources, many still unidentified, was the *Scriptores ordinis praedicatorum*, a catalogue of Dominican writers. Bearing in mind that Kirkstead did not have at hand the bibliographical reference books available to modern scholars, his *Catalogus* was a remarkable achievement. It provides invaluable evidence as to what books were available to scholars in fourteenth-century England, while, more generally, Kirkstead's career and contacts throw light on the condition of monasticism. Sadly, no medieval copy of the *Catalogus* is known to survive; we only have a copy made in 1694 by Thomas Tanner, now Cambridge University Library MS Add. 3470. Moreover, though the importance of the *Catalogus* was recognised by scholars from the sixteenth century onwards, no one published it in full. Tanner meant to publish his transcript but never did so. David Wilkins used Tanner's transcript and included all material relating to British authors in his *Bibliotheca Britannico-Hibernica* (1748). M. R. James, R. A. B. Mynors and Richard Hunt urged publication of the complete

text in vain and meanwhile most scholars relied on the extracts in the *Bibliotheca*. Now, therefore, we are deeply indebted to Richard Rouse and Mary Rouse for the publication of a superb edition. No editors could be better equipped for the task. Forty years ago Richard Rouse published a ground-breaking article (*Speculum* xli [1966]) on Henry of Kirkstead. Previously scholars had attributed the notes in Bury manuscripts and the *Catalogus* itself to 'Boston of Bury' ('*Bostonus Buriensis*'), the monk of St Edmunds who was actually the scribe of a copy made in Kirkstead's lifetime, but Rouse not only proved that Kirkstead wrote the distinctive notes in Bury manuscripts, but that he was also the author of the *Catalogus*. Then Rouse and his wife Mary, using a text established by Mynors, edited one of Kirkstead's principal sources, the Franciscan *Registrum* (Corpus of British Medieval Catalogues ii, 1991).

The present edition of the *Catalogus* has a long introduction in five chapters. In them the Rouses reconstruct Kirkstead's life and examine his handwriting, illustrating the latter with eight pages of clear, properly captioned plates. (The frontispiece is a reproduction from Tanner's transcript, CUL, MS Add. 3470, p. 126.) The Rouses also discuss in detail Kirkstead's sources and method of compilation and have a fascinating chapter on the history of the text, how after the dissolution two copies came into the hands of John Bale, one of which seems soon to have been lost, but the other descended through the hands of antiquaries and others until it reached Awnsham Churchill, a London bookseller, who in the late seventeenth century commissioned Tanner to transcribe it. That is the last sighting of the manuscript. The Rouses devote chapter iii to an exhaustive discussion of a work composed by an anonymous monk of St Edmunds some time in the first half of the fourteenth century, the *Speculum coenobitarum*; they argue strongly (but stop just short of proving) that Kirkstead was the author of the revised version of the *Speculum* which includes a list of fifty-nine monastic authors (printed by the Rouses in an appendix). With regard to the individual titles in the *Catalogus* itself, the Rouses identify, if possible, the source or sources of Kirkstead's information, give the location number or numbers cited by Kirkstead and indicate whether he derived a particular number from the *Registrum* or acquired the information somehow else. Examination of the unsourced location numbers led the Rouses to speculate that Kirkstead visited twenty-one or even twenty-five libraries personally – and possibly yet another eleven. Thus, they show that he travelled most often to religious houses in East Anglia, but also to Holy Trinity, Aldgate, and St Paul's in London, to Westminster Abbey and to Gloucester College, Oxford.

The Rouses end the edition with an alphabetical list of the houses appearing in the *Catalogus*; an alphabetical list of authors; an index of manuscripts; and a general index. They do not claim to provide a guide to all publications on specific manuscripts and to all relevant manuscript studies, but it may be helpful to mention a few of these omissions to illustrate this shortcoming. The Rouses include many references to BL, MS Cotton Titus A VIII (the *De miraculis Sancti Eadmundi*) and to Bodleian Library, Oxford, MS Bodl. 240 (the Bury version of the *Historia aurea* by John of Tynemouth), both of which figure in the *Catalogus*, but they do not refer to R. M. Thomson's valuable discussion of them in his article, 'Two versions of a saint's Life from St. Edmund's abbey', *Revue bénédictine* lxxxv (1974), 387–97. Moreover, the Rouses rely on the *Memorials of St Edmunds Abbey*, ed. Thomas Arnold (Rolls Series 1890–6) for their references to, and extracts from MS Bodl. 240 and also those from MS Bodl. 297 (the Bury version of the Chronicle of John of Worcester), and not on the

standard edition of the former by Carl Horstman, *Nova legenda Anglie* (Oxford 1901), and of the latter by †R. R. Darlington, Patrick McGurk and †Jennifer Bray (Oxford, vol. 2 1995, vol. 3 1998, vol. 1 forthcoming). They also include many references to BL, MS Cotton Tiberius B II (the *Passio Sancti Eadmundi*) but do not mention that it is discussed and two pages reproduced, one with Kirkstead's note, in 'Abbo of Fleury's *Passio Sancti Eadmundi*', *Revue bénédictine* cv (1995), 65-6 and plates iii, iv. The references to the above manuscripts can be found in the index of manuscripts, but neither it nor the general index help the reader find some other works. The Rouses refer (pp. xlvii-xlviii and n. 77, p. lxxiii and n. 183, p. lxxiv and n. 184) to the abbey's thirteenth-century Customary (the *Traditiones Patrum*) and to the tract on the dedication of churches, chapels and altars at St Edmunds without mentioning that both works are in print: the *Customary of the Benedictine abbey of Bury St Edmunds in Suffolk* (Henry Bradshaw Society xcix, 1973), 1-62, 114-22. Also, the thirteenth-century Bury Chronicle in College of Arms, London, MS Arundel 30, appears (pp. xl n. 47) under the name of John Everisden (*sic.* for Eversden) whose claim to authorship of any part of the chronicle has long been considered more than doubtful: it was first questioned by Felix Lieberman (MGH, SS xxviii [1888], 584 and n. 9) and subsequent research by V. H. Galbraith ('The St Edmundsbury chronicle, 1296-1301', *EHR* lviii [1943], 51-6) and others has done nothing to substantiate Eversden's claim. However, such limitations of the Rouses' work are trivial in contrast to the magnitude of their achievements: this edition is an outstanding contribution to medieval studies and one of lasting value.

OXFORD

ANTONIA GRANSDEN

Shaping the nation. England, 1360-1461. By Gerald Harriss. (The New Oxford History of England.) Pp. xxi + 705 incl. 3 figs, 8 maps and 4 tables + 12 plates. Oxford: Clarendon Press, 2005. £35. 0 19 822816 3
JEH (57) 2006; doi:10.1017/S0022046905796214

As is to be expected of a volume in *The New Oxford History of England*, this is a massive and magisterial book. Cutting across the territory covered in the two volumes in the 'old' history authored by May McKisack and E. F. Jacob (published respectively in 1959 and 1961), Gerald Harriss offers a complex yet authoritative survey of his period, providing expert guidance through the narrative and interpretative shoals. It is a significant achievement, and the book will be used extensively.

The century between the Treaty of Brétigny, which ended the first phase of the Hundred Years War in 1360, and Edward IV's seizure of the English throne in 1461 has attracted a good deal of historiographical attention in recent decades, especially from young researchers working 'after McFarlane'. Any author confronted with the task of producing a synthesis of all this activity faces a daunting prospect. Major (and continuing) debates about the political evolutions of these years have to be surveyed and amalgamated; beyond that the century was also one of considerable economic and social change and disruption, research into which has itself generated a great deal of writing and re-evaluation in recent years. For ecclesiastical historians in particular, appreciation of the period's religious history is made both more challenging and more rewarding by the recent explosion of interest in lay spirituality,

and the ongoing debates about the impact, strengths and weaknesses of Wycliffism and Lollardy.

All of these issues are firmly addressed in the volume. Its sixteen chapters are separated into three distinct groups, to reflect three distinct strands in Harriss's treatment of the period. Part I, 'Political society', deals with England's political structures and relationships. It offers chapters on 'Concepts of government', 'The king and the court', 'Central government', 'The nobility', 'The gentry' and 'The local polity'. Part II, on 'Work and worship', starts off with two chapters of economic and social analysis, successively on 'Agrarian society' and on 'Trade, industry, and towns'. These are followed by two chapters which turn to the religious history, dealing with 'The institutional Church', and then with 'Religion, devotion, and dissent'. Part III, 'Men and events', delivers the narrative history. Here Harriss has to balance England's internal political experience against the need to devote considerable attention to the Hundred Years War and its distinct trajectories. By taking the death of Henry IV in 1413 as the pivotal point, he establishes an appropriate symmetry. Chapter xi, 'England, France, and Christendom, 1360–1413', provides the continental material, balanced by chapter xii on 'Ruling England, 1360–1413'. A relatively short chapter on 'England and her neighbours' gives an opportunity to incorporate a British dimension, with discussion of Ireland, Wales and the Anglo-Scottish border – but as this is firmly a volume on the history of England, the coverage is not particularly detailed, and for Scotland is definitely not concerned with that kingdom's internal politics. The last two chapters in this section provide a mirror image of the first two, for the second half of the period: 'The English in France, 1413–53', and 'Ruling England, 1413–61'.

How effectively the structure actually works to produce an appropriate text will be for individual readers to judge. While the separate chapters clearly constitute a whole, they also function independently, and are usable (and probably will be used) as discrete units. Those on church history skilfully bring together the assorted work of recent decades, necessarily covering a lot of ground in a relatively brief space. The chapter on the institutional Church amalgamates sections on the episcopate, on cathedrals and religious houses, on perpendicular building and on the universities. That on spiritual life starts with sections on parochial structures and religion, public worship and private devotion, before changing tack to look at Wyclif and Wycliffism, and the persecution of Lollardy – discussions which nevertheless seem to gloss over, or at least downplay, the debates about the actual extent of Lollardy and the reality of its threat to the Church. (Unfortunately, in these chapters, Harriss has also slipped a bit in his referencing: there is an annoying blind-spot about the names of editors of some volumes of *Studies in Church History*.)

This is undoubtedly a volume which will last: it is unquestionably destined to be a basic and reliable text for all who work on the period, both a prop for undergraduates, and a spur for researchers. The issues are discussed in depth, often in detail; the complexities of the narrative occasionally approach – but never actually reach – the overwhelming. Harriss is not one to claim too much: he readily acknowledges limitations in current awareness, and gaps in the research base which remain to be filled. Yet, for all its readability, and general accessibility, this is at times a daunting volume. The reader is expected to hit the book running. Insecure undergraduates may feel uneasy when confronted by the presuppositions of the opening sentence of chapter i: 'By 1461 Sir John Fortescue could present France and

England as examples of absolute and mixed monarchy.’ A similar feeling arises about part III, which plunges immediately into the aftermath of the Treaty of Brétigny, with no attempt to summarise ‘the plot so far’ for those lacking the assumed background knowledge. As there is no introduction, a reader is given no opportunity to become acclimatised to the volume and its intentions – there is, for instance, no obvious validation of the terminal dates, to explain why this complex period should be treated as a unity. This absence is to some extent remedied by the conclusion, which sums up the century as ‘marking the development from a feudally structured society to a politically integrated one’ (p. 650). It is this, presumably, which constitutes the ‘shaping of the nation’.

Comprehensive and informative, yet also challenging, this is a worthy addition to an impressive series, and a valuable volume in its own right.

UNIVERSITY OF BIRMINGHAM

R. N. SWANSON

The bede roll of the fraternity of St Nicholas, I: The bede roll; II: Classified index of names.

Edited by N. W. James and V. A. James. (London Record Society Publications, 39.) Pp. xxxvii + 275; v + 283–522 + erratum. London: London Record Society, 2004. £20 + £5 post and packing from LRS, Institute of Historical Research, Senate House, Malet Street, London WC1E 7HU. 90095239 3

JEH (57) 2006; doi:10.1017/S0022046905806219

The parish clerks’ bede roll, to give this document its alternative title (and the one which appears on the spine of these volumes) comprises a list of about 10,000 names of regular and secular clergy, parish clerks and other lay men and women for whom prayers were to be said at the altar of their patron in the London Guildhall chapel by the chaplains of the Fraternity of St Nicholas. In addition to the sheer number of names involved, the bede roll was written up in a sometimes confusing manner, which perhaps explains why scholars have previously not attempted a published edition. The complexities of the document are explained in a lucid and informative introduction, which also provides a brief history of the parish clerks and their fraternity. The particular achievement of the editors, however, is the identification of almost 7,000 of the individuals listed in the roll. Numbered among these are royalty (Edward IV’s name was written in gold and he was recorded as ‘filius et heres illustris principis Ricardi Ebor’ in what, as the editors note, was clearly an astute political move), nobility and high clergy (both Robert Neville, bishop of Durham, and William Worsley, dean of St Paul’s, were members, for example), although there are far greater numbers of less illustrious men and women recorded in the bede roll who probably will be of even greater interest to historians. In addition to numerous London citizens from a remarkably wide range of occupations, these include such fascinating characters as Agnes the schoolmistress (‘doctrix puellarum’), the playwright Henry Medwell and William Long, a ‘text-writer’. There are also a perhaps surprising number of religious recorded in the roll, such as Thomas Lydgold, a sixteenth-century monk from Westminster Abbey. Footnotes throughout volume I, which comprises the roll itself, provide a succinct account of these individuals, and justify the editors’ claim to be contributing to the prosopographical study of late medieval Londoners. Volume II is an index of those named in the bede roll and is an invaluable tool for anyone attempting to trace an individual, although

there are, almost inevitably, some minor oversights in the identification of people. The much-quoted 1442 royal charter would have made a useful appendix, moreover. There is no doubt, however, that this edition of the *bede roll* is a valuable resource for scholars not only of gilds and later medieval London, but for those researching a far wider range of subjects, from royal patronage to the devotional interests of English men and women in the century before the Reformation.

FITZWILLIAM MUSEUM,
CAMBRIDGE

ELIZABETH NEW

Three alternative saints' hymns. Late Middle English stanzaic poems. Edited by Ruth Kennedy. (Early English Text Society, o.s. 321, 2003.) Pp. cix + 120 + frontispiece and 1 plate. Oxford: Oxford University Press (for the Early English Text Society), 2003. £40. 0 19 722324 9

JEH (57) 2006; doi:10.1017/S0022046905816215

This well-executed volume draws together for the first time three Middle English poems that form an obvious group. All three saints' hymns are written in a distinctive fourteen-line alliterative rhymed stanza, and together they represent the only instances of this stanza in the alliterative corpus. Ruth Kennedy identifies Richard Spalding, author of *The alliterative Katherine hymn* (c. 1399), as most likely a Carmelite friar in south Lincolnshire who composed the ornate hymn for a gild event. Spalding's name surfaces in an acrostic. The northern *Alliterative John Evangelist hymn* (c. 1390) survives in a devotional portion of a miscellany redacted by Robert Thornton in Yorkshire, c. 1440, where some other texts bear suggestive associations with the Carthusian house of Mount Grace, north of York. The third poem, *The alliterative John Baptist hymn* (pre-1400), survives in the Wheatley manuscript and seems also to have originated in north Yorkshire. Kennedy notes that the easterly provenance of these hymns 'should help to counterbalance the outdated notion that the alliterative tradition is a pure west Midland phenomenon' (p. lxxv).

Especially well done are the editor's authoritative, up-to-date accounts of each manuscript (Bodleian Library, Oxford, Rolls 22; Lincoln Cathedral Library, MS 91; BL, MS Additional 39574), accompanied by illustrative plates. In the introduction Kennedy describes and adroitly assesses matters of layout, construction, metre, alliteration, language, source and affiliation. Texts are prepared with critical rigour, numbered by line and stanza, and followed by exhaustive notes and glossary. While the poems must ultimately be rated 'naive, provincial' work (p. ix), their authors worked in a metre meant to signal sophistication and high form. Kennedy speculates intriguingly upon what other alliterative works could have inspired these devotional poets, and she detects hints not only in other works on saints (*Saint Erkenwald* and *Joseph of Arimathea*, for example), but also in drama, and especially in the bombast of tyrants (pp. xcii–xciii). Most of all, though, the three alliterative saints' hymns form a category unto themselves. Ruth Kennedy has ably profiled their distinct qualities and their unique position within broader categories of alliterative verse and Middle English devotional practice.

KENT STATE UNIVERSITY

SUSANNA FEIN

The life of St Edmund king and martyr. John Lydgate's illustrated verse life presented to Henry VI. A facsimile of British Library MS Harley 2278. Introduction by A. S. G. Edwards. Pp. v + 23 + 117 plates. London: The British Library, 2004. £50. 0 7123 4871 9
JEH (57) 2006; doi:10.1017/S0022046905826211

Of all the losses occasioned by the Dissolution one of the most grievous was that of the monastery of St Edmund at Bury, which had been a pre-eminent religious and cultural centre in East Anglia since the eleventh century. In the fifteenth century a further stimulus to the arts was provided by the presence in the abbey of the poet John Lydgate. The demand for copies of his works was met in part by local illuminators and text-writers. When, on the occasion of a royal visit in 1433–4, Lydgate was asked by Abbot Curteys to produce a poem dealing with St Edmund and his nebulous relative St Fremund, he worked in close collaboration with Bury artists to produce what is now BL, MS Harleyan 2278. This facsimile will enable a better understanding of its literary and art-historical importance. The introduction, by Tony Edwards, is somewhat meagre. In particular, more could have been made of the art-historical context of this manuscript. His commentary is largely dependent on Kathleen Scott's volume in the Harvey Miller series, and his bibliography omits both of the present reviewer's articles that deal with Harleyan 2278. A fuller discussion of the iconography would have been welcome. For example, although the miniature on fo. 6 incorporates elements of presentation iconography, it is intended to represent Henry VI's enrolment in the confraternity of St Edmund's, referred to in the poem. However, one would not buy this book for the introduction, but for the manuscript itself. The British Library is to be congratulated on producing this facsimile, which enables the reader to experience at a very reasonable price something of the visual and intellectual pleasure that Henry VI must have enjoyed when he received the book in 1439.

SIDNEY SUSSEX COLLEGE,
 CAMBRIDGE

NICHOLAS ROGERS

Monks and markets. Durham Cathedral Priory, 1460–1520. By Miranda Threlfall-Holmes. Pp. x + 253 incl. 19 figs and 16 tables. Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2005. £50. 0 19 925381 1
JEH (57) 2006; doi:10.1017/S0022046905836218

The obedientiary accounts and administrative records of Durham Cathedral Priory are among the finest monastic collections in England. From the late thirteenth century on, the picture that they give of the greatest Benedictine house in the north can only be rivalled in England by our knowledge of Westminster Abbey. The two are usefully compared at many points in this detailed study by Miranda Threlfall-Holmes. The complex internal administrative structure of Durham is exposed by its late medieval accounting system. An overview requires working through the separate records of the bursar, granator, cellarer, sacrist, feretrar (responsible for the shrine of St Cuthbert), chamberlain, communar and hostillar. This study focuses on consumption, complementing the work of others on Durham's estates and their organisation. It poses a series of questions about the management of the internal economy and its supply, about decision-making and purchasing. Durham had an average of sixty-six monks in any one year between 1464 and 1520, with perhaps

forty in residence (the balance at its cells and at Oxford), along with 110 servants. The priory needed considerable supplies, which were obtained in a way that exhibited flexibility and responsiveness to market variation. Unfortunately, we can only look at the consequences of decisions to make purchases, not the mechanisms that had allowed the monks to plan their economy. In the first half of the fourteenth century, the accounts of the granator and the cellarer had calculated averages of the commodities consumed at Durham, but these are not found in later documents. That something like this must have been behind the records of the late medieval obedientiaries is implicit in the provision of standard amounts of ale and bread per person. Although the Westminster records are different, Threlfall-Holmes shows that similar quantities of fish were consumed, but argues that the Durham monks had substantially more meat, making their diet much more like that of secular great households. In obtaining its supplies, the priory had a close relationship with its tenants. Comparatively small amounts of corn were purchased in the market, with the exception of years of exceptional dearth, such as 1482–3, when 531 qr. of barley was bought ‘in southern parts’ by the bursar, three-quarters of the corn he acquired that year. Most corn transactions were made with tenants at preferential, fixed prices. The tenants also supplied nearly 50 per cent of the priory’s needs in meat and fish. The obedientiaries’ accounts are in addition valuable for information on the economy of north-east England, for which there is otherwise a paucity of records. Durham changed its purchasing patterns over the long term, with increasing amounts of business done with Newcastle merchants, at the expense of London and purchasing in fairs. This study will henceforward be a point of reference for these changes and testimony to the importance of the obedientiaries’ documentation.

UNIVERSITY OF SOUTHAMPTON

CHRISTOPHER WOOLGAR

The Cambridge companion to Reformation theology. Edited by David Bagchi and David C. Steinmetz. Pp. x + 289. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2004. £45 (cloth), £16.99 (paper). 0 521 77224 9; 0 521 77662 7
JEH (57) 2006; doi:10.1017/S0022046905846214

This volume in the *Cambridge Companions to Religion* series fills an important gap in the market. Alister McGrath’s surveys of Reformation thought and of its medieval background are useful to students new to the topic, but for those who wish to dig deeper into particular subjects, this volume will prove invaluable. The seventeen articles include detailed analyses of the usual suspects. Scott Hendrix provides a marvellously concise treatment of Luther, wearing his considerable subtlety and precision lightly, although he is perhaps too ready to explain away Luther’s antisemitism and his Faustian pact with the German princes. David C. Steinmetz on Calvin is splendidly clear. Erasmus, Melancthon, Zwingli, Bucer and (rather out of his league in such company) Thomas Cranmer also merit their own articles. We also have some more thematic pieces, considering subjects which are not quite so easily approached from the general literature. Lollard and Hussite theology each merit, or at least receive, a brief chapter. We have articles on the emergence of confessional Lutheranism and Calvinism; on Anabaptism; and Denis R. Janz on the schoolmen, as lucid a brief exposition of their ideas as can be found anywhere.

For all the strengths of this volume, however, it presents one serious flaw and one pervasive oddity.

The flaw is its referencing: there is none. There is merely a bibliographical list for each chapter. This makes it difficult for readers to pursue the scholarly debates alluded to by the authors, or to trace quotations or texts to which they refer. It significantly reduces the value of the book to students.

The oddity is a strangely old-fashioned feel to the book – indeed, perhaps because most of the contributors are senior and well-established scholars, the book is more old-fashioned than its editors seem to have intended. This is both a strength and a weakness. On the credit side, we have unfussy, precise and scholarly discussions of these topics, most of them well-written (with one or two ghastly exceptions). However, the spread of topics is a little peculiar. One article on Anabaptism is not enough. Ten articles on magisterial Protestantism is probably too much: Melancthon and confessional Lutheranism cover much of the same ground, and all three (three!) of the articles on the British Reformations point out that there were no major British Protestant theologians. Meanwhile, the Catholic Reformation receives only three articles (including one on Erasmus): Steinmetz's discussion of Trent is splendid, but we badly miss some mention of the Jesuits or the Carmelite revival. Indeed, issues of culture and gender – which the editors emphasise – are scarcely touched on by the contributors. Moreover, some contributors seem to be defending their subjects as much as analysing them. Richard A. Muller's robust claims for a simple continuity between Calvin and later, systematised, Calvinism may be strictly accurate, but do not acknowledge the change of mood and tempo. If later Calvinists did no more than 'connect the dots' (p. 148), connecting the dots can still produce a startlingly different picture. Moreover, there is usually more than one way of doing it: an approach which, despite the editors' encouragement, few of the contributors to this serious, strait-laced volume have been willing to take.

UNIVERSITY OF BIRMINGHAM

ALEC RYRIE

Literature and politics in the English Reformation. By Tom Betteridge. (Politics, Culture and Society in Early Modern Britain.) Pp. vii + 253. Manchester–New York: Manchester University Press, 2004. £55. 0 7190 6460 0
JEH (57) 2006; doi:10.1017/S0022046905856210

In his study of Tudor politics and culture, Tom Betteridge emphasises the importance of 'confessionalisation', declaring at the outset that works written between 1520 and 1580 are defined not by a presumed 'conflict between Protestantism and Catholicism' but rather by opposition 'between emerging confessional identities' as well as struggles between 'those who embraced the process of confessionalization and those who rejected it' (p. 1). Unfortunately, his definition of the term is vague and somewhat circular: 'Confessionalization is the process of creating and sustaining religious confessions as organized public churches' (p. 1). He also recycles many of the unexamined assumptions behind this influential concept, including notions of a top-down Reformation and of religion as a means of social control, while ignoring recent qualifications of confessionalisation's statism made by one of its proponents, Heinz Schilling. As a consequence, Betteridge sees confessionalisation as a pretty grim process, leading to the degradation of reading

and writing (pp. 32–3), ‘damage ... to English political praxis’ (p. 47) and the ‘breakdown of communication between the elite culture and the wider realm’ (p. 114). There are occasional quixotic opponents like Sir Thomas More, a traditionalist and humanist determined ‘to resist the poetics of confessionalization’ (p. 30). Betteridge reads both the *Dialogue concerning heresies* and *The dialogue of comfort against tribulation* as genuinely dialogic, but finds them less influential than more sectarian contemporary works by Tyndale and Skelton. Sir Thomas Elyot tries to make a case for good counsel in *The governour*, but obedience is the supreme political virtue under Henry VIII (pp. 46–7). Even the edgy tensions of Sir Thomas Wyatt’s poetry are read as part of ‘a particularly Henrician, and indeed confessional fantasy’, probing ‘the inner life of a person’ for the purpose of surveillance and constraint (p. 73). Edward’s reign initially encouraged populist and even radical religious hopes but these were soon disappointed (p. 88) by attacks like *The hurt of sedicion* (p. 101). Under Mary, John Heywood promotes an ‘anti-confessional’ moderation (p. 140), but her reign still marks the ‘emergence of a radical confessional Catholicism’ (p. 163), exemplified by the work of Miles Hogarde. In Hogarde’s case, however, Betteridge concedes ‘the positive possibilities of confessionalisation’ since a confessional identity can impart ‘a sense of purpose, coherence and authority’ that allows criticism and dissent (p. 77). The Tudor Reformation concludes in Betteridge’s account not with a bang but a whimper as Elizabeth promotes a blurring of confessional identities in order to restore ‘Quietness’ to the realm (p. 179). This may be an accurate account of Elizabethan ecclesiastical history, but it requires reading Foxe’s *Acts and monuments* as a retrospective (p. 204) and ‘magisterial’ (p. 209) compendium and Spenser’s *Shepheardes calender* as a ‘celebration of Elizabeth’s queenship’ (p. 221) devoted to ‘decorum and order’ (p. 225) while ignoring each work’s prophetic and critical energies. Betteridge presents far too neat and truncated a view of the fierce conflicts behind the Tudor Reformation.

CITY UNIVERSITY OF NEW YORK

RICHARD MCCOY

Das Basler Domkapitel im Freiburger Exil (1529–1628). Studien zum Selbstverständnis einer reichskirchlichen Institution. By Nicola Eisele (Forschungen zur oberrheinischen Landesgeschichte, 49.) Pp. 287. Freiburg–Munich: Karl Alber, 2004. €30 (paper). 3 495 49949 0

JEH (57) 2006; doi:10.1017/S0022046905866217

The role of Basle as an intellectual centre of Swiss and, indeed, European Protestantism during the sixteenth century has been highlighted by numerous recent studies. However, much less attention has been paid to the fate of the most obvious ‘losers’ in the Basle Reformation: the city’s former Catholic establishment. A first step towards making good this deficiency was taken by Hans Berner, in his study of relations between the city and prince-bishopric of Basle. Now a further gap has been filled by Nicola Eisele’s dissertation on the Basle cathedral chapter, which covers the century from the chapter’s arrival in Freiburg to the death of Bishop Wilhelm Rinck von Baldenstein. Eisele’s principal source is the minutes of the chapter’s meetings, between sixty and one hundred of which took place annually, but she also draws on a range of other archival material from Karlsruhe, Freiburg, Basle and Pruntrut, the

former seat of the prince-bishops of Basle. The first part of the study is concerned with the internal dynamics of the chapter following its expulsion from Basle. Topics discussed include the social profile of the canons, offices and administrative functions, discipline and the role of the liturgy. Part II focuses on the chapter's key external relationships, with the bishops of Basle and with its host city of Freiburg. Eisele distinguishes three phases in the chapter's development. The first, covering the early decades in exile, was characterised by institutional decline and lack of leadership, as the chapter struggled to regain legitimacy and a sense of purpose. The appointment of a resident dean in 1553 ushered in a period of consolidation, which lasted until the end of century. Eisele emphasises the contribution of 'humanist' deans such as Markus Tegginger and Georg Hänlin, who oversaw a revival of the liturgy and significant improvements in the conduct and educational standards of the chapter clergy. From 1600 there was a further change in tone, as the aristocratic element within the chapter recovered its traditional dominance. Although Eisele's approach is sometimes a little mechanical, her monograph is well-researched and provides a useful case study of the way in which institutions of the medieval Church responded to the religious upheavals of the sixteenth century. In particular, it highlights a fundamental tension between the demands of Catholic reform and the priorities of the canons, most of whom were drawn from the lesser nobility of south-western Germany. This meant that, while certain aspects of the Tridentine programme were adopted, others fell by the wayside. The chapter was supportive of attempts by the prince-bishops of Basle to introduce ecclesiastical reforms to their territory, for example, but its members resisted taking on any greater pastoral role themselves. Actual celebration of the liturgy also remained the preserve of chaplains and other subordinate clergy. As Eisele puts it, 'Klerikalisierung' was successful at the level of both canons and chaplains, but 'Kanonikalisierung' affected the chaplains alone (p. 158). The failure of the chapter's senior members to embrace fully the canonical ideal had important long-term implications. During the eighteenth century, the increasing prominence of the canons as administrators, at the expense of their liturgical functions, led to a 'Verlust an Akzeptanz im gesellschaftlichen Konsens der Aufklärung' (p. 258), paving the way for the chapter's dissolution in 1803.

EDINBURGH

MARK TAPLIN

Eucharistic sacrifice and patristic tradition in the theology of Martin Bucer, 1534–1546. By Nicholas Thompson. (Studies in the History of Christian Traditions, 119.) Pp. xv + 321. Leiden–Boston: Brill, 2005. €109. 90 04 14138 3; 1573 5664 JEH (57) 2006; doi:10.1017/S0022046905876213

Nicholas Thompson presents a careful consideration of the development of Bucer's eucharistic theology in his Strasbourg and Cologne periods and, in particular, traces the reformer's efforts to reach an agreement with his Catholic opponents on the doctrines of the real presence and the sacrifice of the mass. Where Melancthon established that sacrament and sacrifice were mutually exclusive, Bucer held that testament, covenant, sacrament and sacrifice all belonged to a broader class of ceremony, and actively sought to achieve a *consensus historiae* as a 'blueprint for a single German church' (p. 5).

Thompson provides a helpful analysis of the background to the eucharistic controversy (chapters ii–iv) before engaging with Bucer's own works. Chapter v documents Bucer's – and Strasbourg's – transition from a short-lived 'German mass' in 1524 to an outright rejection of the theology of the mass in 1527. Where Bucer's *Grund und Ursach* (1524) merely defended recent changes in liturgical practise and outlined future reforms, his *Das die Messs die schwerist gottisschmach ... sey* (1527) marked the end of traditional liturgical expressions of the eucharist in Strasbourg. In the light of accusations of theological innovation, Bucer took great pains to root his hermeneutics both in Scripture as well as the writings of the Fathers.

In the 1530s, a period that saw German theologians actively lobbying for a council to hear the *causa Lutheri*, Bucer played an increasingly central part in the negotiations between evangelicals and Catholics (chapter vi). His 1530 *Epistola apologetica*, a resounding defence of his views against Erasmus, was followed by the more conciliatory *Furbereytung zum Concilio* three years later. Both works set out Bucer's views on the eucharist in some detail. More important, they demonstrate that while Bucer continued to make use of patristic interpretation as a key theological tool, ultimately Scripture became the final norm by which any doctrine was tested and 'the validity of any re-union between the churches of Christ was to be judged' (p. 133). From 1539 to 1541, the debate was continued through a series of colloquies, at Leipzig (1539), Worms (1540) and Regensburg (1541). Thompson analyses the significant role Bucer played in these deliberations at some length in chapter viii.

Bucer's call to Bonn (1542) and his reforms in the archdiocese of Cologne gave rise to a wealth of literature on the eucharist, considered in the closing chapters of the work (chapters ix–x). Thompson devotes a whole chapter to the analysis of Bucer's reflection on the eucharistic sacrifice in *Constans defensio* (1543) and *De vera et falsa caena Dominicae administratione* (1546) which, arguably, form Bucer's central exposition on the subject matter, and show off the reformer's readiness to seek a sense of eucharistic *rapprochement* with his Catholic counterparts (chapter x).

Thompson's study is a considered contribution to the debate and makes available a wealth of continental sources to an English-speaking readership. The author's constant reference to catholic *Kontroverstheologen* (most extensively in chapter vii) grounds the work well within its wider historical context. Some minor flaws, such as the large number of typographical errors, could have been avoided by more careful proof-reading, but do not detract from the overall value of the work.

GREAT ST MARY'S,
CAMBRIDGE

ANDREAS LOEWE

Robert Southwell, and the mission of literature, 1561–1595. Writing reconciliation. By Scott R. Pilarz. Pp. xxxi + 300 incl. frontispiece and 10 ills. Aldershot: Ashgate, 2004. £47.50. 0 7546 3380 2
JEH (57) 2006; doi:10.1017/S002204690588621X

'[W]e never read him without wondering why we do not read him more' (p. x). In 1944 C. S. Lewis made that remark about Robert Southwell sj, the Elizabethan poet, Roman Catholic devotional writer and apologist and canonised (1970) martyr. In his monograph, Scott Pilarz sj, president of the University of Scranton, Pennsylvania, attempts to reintroduce Southwell's literary qualities to contemporary scholars and

readers. With a thorough reading of Southwell's poetic and prose works, a critical evaluation of the reception of those works over the past 400 years and a knowledge of the contemporary historiography of early modern martyrdom and the English Reformation – the last especially reliant upon Brad Gregory's *Salvation at stake* and the works of Christopher Haigh and Eamon Duffy – Pilarz succeeds admirably. According to him, Southwell was unique among his clerical and Jesuit peers in using his literary skills to advance reconciliation between 'church papists' and recusants, between English Catholics and Protestants and even between Queen Elizabeth I and Roman Catholicism as represented by seminary priests and Jesuits ordained in exile and secretly entering her realm. While other Jesuits of exceptional literary talents, such as Robert Persons and Edmund Campion, were not above direct or indirect political involvement in hopes of restoring the Catholic Church to ascendancy or at least some form of toleration in England, Southwell seems to have largely kept to 'writing reconciliation', as well as pastoral work on a personal level. Although his activity (1586–91) on the 'English mission' before capture was brief, it was more protracted than that of Persons and Campion, and Southwell was also given the important role of initially sheltering and advising the growing number of priests clandestinely arriving in England; it is probably these experiences of the predicaments of English Catholics which chiefly led the young priest to write in a conciliatory rather than strident vein. Pilarz also traces the origins of the Jesuit's placatory style of writing and ministry to the conflicted nature of his family's religious practice, of the internal politics of the English College in Rome where he was an administrator, and perhaps of his own sexuality, the last of which the author treats with particular sensitivity. Although his last work and most elegant piece of prose, *An humble supplication to her maiestie*, was suppressed by his Jesuit superior and close friend, Henry Garnet, for its apparently intense devotion to Elizabeth, Southwell was not appeasement- or ecumenically-minded. He was a conscious child and martyr of the Protestant and Catholic Reformations. Nevertheless, Southwell approached his literary subjects with an 'intellectual energy' (p. 223) and nuance often lacking in the works of his contemporaries, Catholic or Protestant. For this reason alone Robert Southwell's religious poetry and devotional and apologetic prose are worthy of careful consideration, and Pilarz offers a critical yet sensitive introduction to his artistry.

CORPUS CHRISTI CHURCH,
NEW YORK

WILLIAM WIZEMAN

Centered on the Word. Literature, Scripture, and the Tudor-Stuart middle way. Edited by Daniel W. Doerksen and Christopher Hodgkins. Pp. 367. Newark: University of Delaware Press, 2004. £43.95. 0 87413 843 4
JEH (57) 2006; doi:10.1017/S0022046905896216

This is a first-class collection of essays by a mixture of well-established and younger scholars: the knowledge of theology and history displayed across the collection is authoritative and profound, and shown to be important for a powerful reading of early modern texts. The title demonstrates the editors' fondness for the necessarily inexact term 'the middle way', although some of the contributors, such as Robert

Whalen, try to problematise the concept of the *via media*. As charted in various essays here, the term seems to encompass Donne's idea of 'mediocrity', Milton's early anticlericalism and an outright Laudian gloss on a Catholic manuscript – one wonders how happily these three authors would have trodden any 'middle way' together. The editors' introduction, however, seems to offer a Calvinist conformity as the referent for the 'middle way', tying the phrase finally to an idea of Word-centred piety. This will not quite do: it would be difficult to find any early Stuart brand of piety that was not Word-centred, except perhaps some of the Catholic devotion taking place in Henrietta Maria's court, and the separatists who are firmly located by the editors as the opposite pole from which the 'middle way' is to be calculated were nothing if not 'Centered on the Word'. Nevertheless, this collection, which sees itself as transferring critical interest from radical religion to something rather more representative of the majority of religious authors in the first half of the seventeenth century, does a real service in charting some of the various textual practices in use within the Church of England, although it might have done better to stress their variety rather than attempt to claim uniformity. Some of the authors treated here would certainly not have been categorised by their contemporaries as moderate.

Thus Daniel Doerksen's essay on Donne's *Devotions* problematises over-rigid distinctions between Arminians and Calvinists, using historical material about the use of bells at Puritan-inclined St Martin-in-the-Fields. Yet his quotations from the *Devotions* tend to confirm a reader's instinct that this kind of Word-centred devotion is very different from that of many conformist members of the Church of England. Doerksen worries that critics do not appreciate Donne's wit – but surely it is that very wit, treating the sacred texts with some of the more outrageous figures of speech, making new meanings out of biblical commonplaces, which Donne himself worried about, and which other authors treated here, such as Sibbes and Herbert, eschewed. Jeanne Shami employs her impressive knowledge of Donne's biography to present a subtle and complex version of the 'middle way' which is dominated by the concern to avoid 'squint-eyed', or 'left-handed', interpretation. She offers several detailed studies of Donne's rhetorical procedure in various sermons, and the charting of his careful exposition is invaluable: nevertheless, the version of predestination which Donne decides on in his sermon for 4 March 1625 is certainly not 'moderate' by any contemporary criteria. The same is true of Paul Dyck's attempt to shift the significance of the physical building of the Church from 'metaphor' to 'master-form' in Herbert's *The temple*, a move which affirms the importance of the external structure, and which he supports with material from contemporary church consecrations which refer to the building as a 'temple'. It is probably important to point out that there is no evidence that Herbert himself chose this title, and that in the 1630s the use of the Old Testament temple as a model for Arminian church ordering became notorious. In that political climate, to use church architecture merely as a metaphor for the health of the soul is probably positive enough about external buildings for any moderate.

Any writer truly in the 'middle way', especially one centred on the Bible, will necessarily share tropes and content with many others. This is a problem with Liam Semler's designation of the 1650s poet, 'Eliza', as 'Sibbesian'. Richard Sibbes's writing has a real claim to mainstream status in the Church of England, so much so that without verbal parallels (which Semler has charted elsewhere)

a claim of direct influence is unconvincing. Far more authoritative is his demonstration of the use 'Eliza' makes of Herbert which, as Semler shows, is an assertively feminised one. Susanne Woods concludes that the Protestant doctrine of unmediated faith enabled many women writers. She pursues a fruitful comparison between a male and a female poet, contrasting Aemilia Lanyer's treatment of St Peter's repentance with Robert Southwell's. The 'soliloquy', a common if neglected seventeenth-century genre, is given a useful treatment by Kate Narvesen. She assigns it to those she calls 'contented conformists' rather than Puritans – presumably she means the less happy, more extreme ones – whom she correctly surmises as being reluctant to set down their own words for others to follow in their communion with God. Christopher Hodgkins reconstructs the events and attitudes that prevailed in 1642 at the time of the order banning plays, demonstrating convincingly that mere antitheatricity was not the cause of this measure.

One of the best essays in this volume is John N. King's survey of anticlericalism in Milton's early poetry. As one might expect, it combines a superb understanding of the context in which Milton was writing with a lively re-reading of the canonical texts. David Evett casts light on one of Shakespeare's most famous plays by charting the field of discourse surrounding the Prayer Book phrase 'whose service is perfect freedom'. Having demonstrated the scope of what Shakespeare's audience would have understood by this phrase, Evett performs an impassioned and utterly convincing reading of *The tempest* that is deliberately in opposition to some twentieth-century criticism which he considers anachronistic.

This volume shows historicist scholarship at its best: not just impressive for the depth of its research, but genuinely illuminating of early modern texts. There is not a weak article here, although not all the contributions achieve the ideal historicist combination of original historical research and exciting literary readings. The very best essays demonstrate clearly that a profound understanding of Tudor–Stuart religion is a stimulus to excellent literary criticism of the period's key texts.

OXFORD

ELIZABETH CLARKE

On the parish? The micro-politics of poor relief in rural England, c. 1550–1750. By Steve Hindle. (Oxford Studies in Social History.) Pp. xii + 521. Oxford: Clarendon, 2004. £65. 0 19 927132 1
JEH (57) 2006; doi:10.1017/S0022046905906210

In this volume, Steve Hindle seeks to build upon earlier studies of the poor law, notably Paul Slack's *Poverty and policy in Tudor and Stuart England* (1988). However, Hindle's impressive body of research adds several vital new dimensions to it by focusing on unofficial giving, formal and informal parish charities, parish apprenticeship and the mechanisms for determining and contesting entitlement. His exhaustive analysis of each of these areas demonstrates that the payment of parish pensions to the deserving poor was merely one of a number of strategies adopted by the parish (and the poor) to deal with the problem of poverty in this period. In this respect, as the author acknowledges, the study buttresses and enriches the existing historical paradigm about the Elizabethan poor law, rather than defining

it anew. Hindle's major achievement is to prove beyond doubt that 'parish relief was, therefore, a *process* – indeed, an often protracted process – of which the audited overseers' disbursement is only the final record', and definitely not the whole story. The work contains a number of overlapping conclusions. Hindle shows how compulsory monetary poor relief often only became the dominant mode of provision for the poor in the mid-seventeenth century (and often much later in the upland north). He argues that historians have under-estimated the continuing significance of personal charity, the extent of the contribution made by formal parochial charities and doles, and the importance of the provisions for pauper apprenticeship. Yet, while he emphasises the multi-faceted nature of the old poor law, he also continues to stress its coercive elements. Charity was always conditional on good behaviour, pauper families were broken up by the overseers' relief decisions and parishes maintained eternal vigilance over the economic, behavioural and geographic thresholds of entitlement. Hindle emphasises that parish officers were in a constant power struggle with the poor and the magistracy to maintain their control over the criteria of eligibility for relief, and to ensure that the poor never possessed it as an unquestioned right. He depicts the old poor law as a series of expedients rather than a comprehensive 'system', and one based in practice more on grudging necessity than ideals of community or charity. These trends are illustrated in unprecedented detail, and build up a more complete and complex picture of poor relief and the 'politics' of poverty than is provided in the existing literature. The only question is whether this work marks the limit of the survey approach to this subject. Its impressive and wide-ranging examples amass a vast array of different experiences of charity, work, relief and exclusion, but rarely give an indication of how these aspects interacted in particular locations, or how these interactions changed over time. Parochial sources are often highly intractable about such issues, but such questions may in future be answered by comparative parish studies. Nevertheless, they can only be posed as a result of this impressive research. If Paul Slack provided the definitive study of the emergence of the poor law and the operation of formal relief, it is clear that Steve Hindle has now added definitive research into the machinery, practices and social context of the wider relief system in early modern England.

UNIVERSITY OF EXETER

H. R. FRENCH

The middling sort and the politics of social reformation. Colchester, 1570–1640. By Richard Dean Smith. (Renaissance and Baroque Studies and Texts, 25.) Pp. xiii + 313 incl. 35 tables. New York–Bern: Peter Lang, 2004. £42.70. 0 8204 03972 X; 0897 7836

JEH (57) 2006; doi:10.1017/S0022046905916217

Putting a face on the English Reformation and its accompanying social changes has been a goal of historians for some time now. The problem is that Elizabethan England had many faces – aristocratic and commons, rural and urban, north and south, London and periphery. Now Richard Dean Smith has shown us yet another face – the role of the 'middling sort' of Colchester in social reformation. Using surviving secular and ecclesiastical records for the town, in his first chapter Smith has created a working definition of middling sort which is based on financial records and

occupations and allows for comparison with other local studies. He proceeds to trace this group through officeholding and wills and provides a detailed quantitative analysis of social reformation in a substantial urban area. Colchester is revealed as an increasingly divided community in which the middling sort were steadily becoming unhappy with the nature and speed of social and religious change. Two of Smith's chapters detail the officeholding characteristics of the middling sort. They served as subconstables, jurors, churchwardens and sidesmen and are clearly shown to have been a distinct social group from the town elite above them and the poor below them. The history of religious disputes in Colchester also shows that the middling sort played a large role in promoting advanced Protestantism. Colchester's Reformation was not imposed from above. Smith's study also reveals that efforts to control sexual and social behaviour reached their peak during the years 1600–9. It is also revealed that sexual offences had become associated with the poor while the bad acts of the middling sort were non-sexual in their nature. Sinning had its social classes too. Smith's picture of Colchester is solidly based on quantitative analyses derived from a large range of primary sources. His many tables amply bear out his clearly presented conclusions. The middling sort of Colchester were the foundation of local government and its social stability and the seekers after a further Reformed England.

UNIVERSITY OF CENTRAL ARKANSAS

RONALD H. FRITZE

The indigenous and the foreign in Christian Ethiopian art. On Portuguese–Ethiopian contacts in the 16th–17th centuries. Papers from the fifth international conference on the history of Ethiopian art (Arrábida, 26–30 November 1999). Edited by Manuel João Ramos and Isabel Boavida. Pp. xxx + 181 incl. 1 map, 6 plans and 53 ills + 14 colour plates. Aldershot: Ashgate, 2004. £45. 0 7546 5037 5
JEH (57) 2006; doi:10.1017/S0022046905926213

Ethiopia has fascinated Europeans for centuries, ever since the late Middle Ages when it became identified with the Christian empire ruled by the mythical Prester John. The Portuguese were the first western visitors, and their books about the country were widely acquired and read. In Oxford there are early editions in college libraries as well as in the Bodleian. The present book is also the consequence of Portuguese enterprise, a conference held in Arrábida in 1999, though all the articles are in English. Studying Ethiopia has never been easy. The editors, both Portuguese, complain, with unusual candour, that many of the contributions for which they had hoped had to be rejected, mostly because they were submitted late. And the difficulties do not end there. Publication of the book, with its numerous illustrations, colour and black-and-white, has been financed by two Portuguese institutions, the Calouste Gulbenkian Foundation and the Fundação Oriente. But many of the authors are described as independent researchers who, one presumes, did their work without official support. All the more credit to them, for they and, for that matter, the scholars with institutional backing must have encountered almost insuperable problems. The Jesuit mission which followed the first Portuguese travellers to Ethiopia came to a disastrous and bloody end in the 1630s, and many of the buildings which they had helped to put up were abandoned or destroyed. Nearly four centuries of neglect, sometimes wilful, have not made it easier to interpret

architectural sites in which there may have been interaction between European and Ethiopian traditions of building. The nature of that interaction is made all the more complex because the Jesuits imported craftsmen from India to execute their designs. It is hardly surprising, then, that there are marked differences of opinion between the contributors about the extent of European influence, even in the great castle of Gondar which still survives in something like its original seventeenth-century form. There are linguistic hurdles to be got over, too. Most of the contributors quote Portuguese sources, but it is not always clear how widely they have read in them. No one seems to have noticed that while he was in Ethiopia in the 1520s Francisco Álvares records how he met and saw the work of a Venetian painter, Nicolau Brancaleão (Brancaloneo?), who had lived in the country for more than thirty years. This is surely an interesting line worth pursuing. There is little detailed reference to texts in Ge'ez or the other languages of Ethiopia. But no one should underestimate the achievement of the editors in getting their book together. Besides architecture, it covers icon and mural paintings, and the decorative arts. The team of contributors, which includes Ethiopian scholars, is broadly based. It is a courageous step into a fascinating area.

OXFORD

T. F. EARLE

Nuns' chronicles and convent culture in Renaissance and Counter-Reformation Italy. By K. J. P. Lowe. Pp. xvi + 437 incl. 42 ills. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2003. £60. 0 521 62191 7
 JEH (57) 2006; doi:10.1017/S002204690593621X

The study of nuns and convents has come a long way as a field in recent years, and Kate Lowe makes an important and richly nuanced contribution to it in this exploration of nuns' cultural lives and activities. The three different chronicles she analyses – that of Santa Maria delle Vergini in Venice (1523), Santa Maria Annunziata in Florence (1598) and Santi Cosma e Damiano in Rome (1607) – provide a history of the women in these convents, as one would expect. But through them Lowe can explore how sixteenth-century nuns made sense of their own lives and engaged with their institutions. Her study is welcome on several counts. First, because it stresses nuns' agency, identity and self-expression during a period for which 'enclosure' and 'confinement' are the usual historiographical bywords. Second, because it takes as its focus the records generated by the convents themselves, as opposed to those of the organs seeking to regulate them. Third, because it adopts a comparative approach, by comparing three very different female religious institutions, and by doing this with reference to the experiences of three different cities – Venice, Florence and Rome – in a part of the world generally known for localistic histories. Finally, the book makes an important contribution to our knowledge of the chronicle genre itself, at a time when nuns were the only female historians. As regards this last point, Lowe looks in particular at the chroniclers' vision of the past, their sense of time and causation, and rhetorical strategies; the role of the chronicles in the construction and preservation of the convents' identities and traditions; and the light they shed on the sorts of role models the convents wished to provide within the context of their host city. In the process, Lowe has succeeded in

making the chroniclers' authors, and the convents to which they dedicated their lives, come alive.

UNIVERSITY OF LEICESTER

DAVID GENTILCORE

A paradise inhabited by devils. The Jesuits' civilizing mission in early modern Naples. By Jennifer D. Selwyn. (Catholic Christendom, 1300–1700/Bibliotheca Instituti Historici Societis Iesu, 57.) Pp. xiv + 278. Aldershot: Ashgate/Rome: Institutum Historicum Societatis Iesu, 2004. £50. 88 7041 357 8
JEH (57) 2006; doi:10.1017/S0022046905946216

This study of early modern Catholicism in southern Italy is a fine book, exploring a variety of issues with candour, depth and facility. Jennifer Selwyn's expertise in handling a daunting array of documents – Jesuit mission instructions, letters, directives, testimonies and, finally, contemporary criticisms – is impressive, as is the readable style of the volume. The subject is complex: Selwyn studies the methods by which the Society of Jesus employed its experience in teaching, theatre and diplomacy to 'civilise' the Kingdom of Naples, referred to by members of the Society as the 'Indies down here' because of the perceived problems with religious practice in the *mezzogiorno*. The city of Naples, the 'Paradise inhabited by devils' of the title, was a cultural centre on a European, not just Italian, scale; yet it was equally known for its teeming masses of urban poor and the violence which most observers associated with them. The Jesuits, and the hierarchy of the Roman Catholic Church as a whole, believed that a more educated and devout Christianity would result in less violence, immorality, greed and other forms of bad behaviour. As a result, they applied the lessons learned in the 'New World' missions – lessons which Selwyn treats in surprising depth for a European specialist – to Naples. This was a deliberate plan, not only because many Jesuits expressed a sincere desire to evangelise the Indies, perhaps in order to become martyred, but also because influential members of the Society, notably General Acquaviva, encouraged the connections and indeed the understanding of the evangelising and civilising mission as universal. All Jesuits on missions should be educated and enthusiastic evangelists, carefully creating and maintaining 'cordial relationships with clergy and secular elites' in their efforts to stamp out violence, idolatry, prostitution, local revolts, concubinage, family disputes and other immoral behaviours. In fact, the order even worked to improve prison conditions, although Selwyn notes that its motives may not have been as altruistic as they sound: Jesuits were known to harangue prisoners in order to extract confessions which would pave the way for the much-desired 'good death'. The Jesuits used a great many means to effect their ends, including theatre; but in many cases they also used techniques or practices which they had criticised the secular world for employing. In the end, it was this perceived hypocrisy, as well as the famous Enlightenment anticlericalism, which led to accusations that the Society of Jesus was, in fact, preventing the Neapolitans from becoming civilised in the eighteenth century. Selwyn's clear prose, deft weaving of sources into a narrative and well-supported conclusions make for a readable as well as valuable work, which ought to be of considerable use for scholars of early modern Latin America as well as Europe.

GEORGIA SOUTHERN UNIVERSITY

KATHLEEN M. COMERFORD

The Mercurian project. Forming Jesuit culture, 1573–1580. Edited by Thomas McCoog. (The Institute of Jesuit Sources. Ser. III. Original Studies Composed in English, 18/Biblioteca Instituti Historici Societatis Iesu, 55.) Pp. xxx + 992 + colour frontispiece and 48 black-and-white and colour plates. Rome: Institutum Historicum Societatis Iesu/St Louis, MO: The Institute of Jesuit Sources, 2004. \$80 (cloth), \$60 (paper). 1 880810 53 0; 1 880810 54 9/88 7041 355 1; 88 7041 355 7
JEH (57) 2006; doi:10.1017/S0022046905956212

Despite increased interest in the Society of Jesus in recent years, the Society remains one of the more shadowy shaping forces of the early modern period. Quite possibly the most shadowy period of its history, and certainly one of the least studied, is the generalate of Everard Mercurian (1573–80). While the lives and times of Mercurian's predecessors, Ignatius Loyola, Diego Lainez and Francis Borgia, and those of his successor, Claudio Aquaviva, are perhaps more spectacular, they are also much better known and documented and thus this massive volume, encompassing nearly 1,000 pages, aims to redress this historical imbalance by filling in a gap in our knowledge of the linear development of the Society's 'way of proceeding'.

Mercurian presided over a period of sustained and considerable growth and this volume's main aim was to focus throughout on what formed Jesuit culture during his generalate and on his difficulties in securing unanimous consent on the Society's 'way of proceeding' and in standardising its often uneven growth. Hence there is much of value on the sinews of Jesuit organisation in the 1570s, especially on the processes of decision-making, fundraising and problem resolution. Considerable attention is also given to the mechanics and politics of college establishment. Relations with the papacy, the Curia, the other orders and secular interests loom large throughout and are superbly brought into focus in the account of Mercurian's election (pp. 19–25).

The internationalism that characterised Mercurian's society is well reflected in this volume's ambitious scale and scope: thirty essays by twenty-nine scholars representing eleven countries and writing in six languages. Each author develops a topic according to his or her particular expertise and the result is a volume which offers a not quite complete cross-section of Jesuit culture and European religious life during Mercurian's generalate, dealing with themes, to name but a few, ranging from art patronage, missionary activity, education, science, spirituality and the Society's interactions with the older religious orders.

One of the volume's chief attainments was the positive response to McCoog's call in his preface that his contributors follow in the spirit of Francesco Sacchini who argued that historians of religion 'must observe the essential laws with the greatest strictness and scrupulosity that truth may be preserved and defended' and move away from the hagiographical, apologetical and triumphalist polemic that have often plagued Jesuit historiography. All contributions answered this call with Philippe Lécirvain's and A. Lynn Martin's essays providing especially good examples of the warts-and-all treatment McCoog requested, while Fois's biographical article on Mercurian hardly shies away from his subject's failings. The volume has clearly sought to build upon the professionalisation of Jesuit history begun in recent years under the aegis of John W. O'Malley SJ, and this volume also further advances the historiographical *désenclavement* that O'Malley has also sought to promote. Much less

attention than is normal is given to Jesuit political activities or theories and with this shift in emphasis comes the implicit recognition that the defining characteristics of the Society of Jesus' culture and their chief legacy must be sought in the realm of culture and not that of politics. A final debt to O'Malley is discharged in that each essay sustains his contention that Jesuit culture was still in formation during and beyond the first two generalates and indeed during and beyond that of Mercurian.

Despite such admirable methodologies a number of major problems emerged. Thematically it was perhaps an omission that there was no essay specifically devoted to Jesuit political thought, especially when one considers that Mercurian presided over one of the most tumultuous periods of the European wars of religion. There were also some technical problems. The maps especially are a major disappointment, inaccessible and unrevealing. One might fairly suggest that more illuminating tables might have been utilised. Notwithstanding the division of each article into entitled subsections the book is at times inaccessible with flow having been sacrificed to breadth.

The editor's instructions that those articles with a geographical focus include material 'regarding tenures of rectors and provincials, the foundations of individual colleges, the state of the province at the beginning and at the close of Mercurian's administration and any specific problem that troubled it' may have been a necessary organising principle but it seems to have stymied the creative impulse of some contributors, and some of the articles are almost prosopographical, uninspired, and suffer from being too heavily weighted towards description rather than analysis, which makes for tedious reading at times. Its sheer scale complicates comprehension of wider trends and patterns and in the editor's allusion to the difficulties he encountered in standardising this collection one gets a sense of the difficulties under which Mercurian himself laboured. To my mind the book's greatest flaw, and one which many edited collections suffer, is that it lacks a conclusion, which, however difficult that might have been to synthesise, would certainly have made the volume more relevant. For these reasons then *The Mercurian project* does not, one thinks, mark a major advance in early modern religious historiography. Its most enduring legacy will probably be the fine collation of primary and secondary sources it brings together at the end of each essay.

None the less, to give Thomas McCoog and his collaborators their due, the book does make a much more significant contribution to Jesuit historiography and their aim of producing 'a well-researched, dependable volume on the state of the Society of Jesus under a Father General whose importance ... had been underestimated' has certainly been attained. *The Mercurian project* also throws additional light upon the whole ethos of the Catholic renewal which formed and sustained Jesuit culture and upon our appreciation of the Jesuits' expansion within the European intellectual milieu and beyond the frontiers of the Old World and will be essential reading for anyone engaged in advanced study of the early Jesuit movement.

SELWYN COLLEGE,
CAMBRIDGE

DAVID FINNEGAN

On the beliefs of the Greeks. *Leo Allatius and popular orthodoxy*. By Karen Hartnup. (The Medieval Mediterranean. Peoples, Economies and Cultures, 400–1500, 54.) Pp. xvi + 273 incl. 5 figs. Leiden–Boston: Brill, 2004. €108. 90 04 13180 9; 0928 5520

JEH (57) 2006; doi:10.1017/S0022046905966219

Leo Allatius (1586–1669) was born on Chios and raised in the Orthodox Church. At the age of nine he moved to Italy, where he eventually studied at the Greek College at Rome, qualified as a doctor and made a private confession of the Catholic faith. He wrote *De graecorum hodie quorundam opinionibus* (1645), in the form of a letter to a fellow doctor, Paolo Zacchias. This work examined Greek Orthodox folk beliefs in vampires, child-stealing demons and spirits of place. Folklorists have long raided this work to document the continuity of Greek culture. In this very welcome study Karen Hartnup situates the *De opinionibus* as the product of Allatius's guiding intellectual interests: antiquarianism, ecumenism and medicine (p. 64). She shows that Allatius was not the inside ethnographer of Greek culture that one might have assumed. He only visited Chios once after settling in Italy. The bulk of his information derived from textual sources to which he had unfettered access as a scribe at the Vatican Library. His study on the local beliefs of the Greeks was informed by his ecumenical position that Orthodoxy and Catholicism were fundamentally the same. In his eagerness to document this he did not always do a good job of understanding local beliefs in cultural context. For example, he viewed the Orthodox delay in baptising infants with critical incomprehension. Granted the danger posed by the demon *gello* to mother and child alike, the obvious solution in Allatius's opinion was immediate baptism, which provided a seal of protection against just such 'unclean spirits' (p. 110). Orthodoxy should fall into line with Catholicism. What Allatius failed to see was that exorcisms of the *gello*, such as the one he printed in the *De opinionibus*, were entirely consistent with baptism and would have served as provisional early baptisms in cases of danger. The putative 'superstition' was actually consistent with the logic of his ideal ecumenical practice. In his concern to show Greek beliefs in vampires to be consistent with the Catholic idea of souls in purgatory, Allatius erroneously conflated the *vrykolakas* with another type of vampire known as *tympaniaios*, because the bloated body was taut like a drum. In the Orthodox world under the Ottomans, the ultimate sanction the Church could deliver was excommunication. Those excommunicated remained undissolved after death and became *tympaniaioi* and the Church wanted to retain control over this threat. *Vrykolakes* were an alternative folk category of revenants produced, in popular opinion, by violent death, unrescinded (secular) curses, suicide or lack of burial rites. The popular treatment was to burn the corpse of a *vrykolakas*, while a rite of absolution and sprinkling with holy water quelled *tympaniaioi*. Hartnup skilfully disentangles and explicates these interesting byways of seventeenth-century Orthodox folk religion. In correcting and amplifying Allatius's account she draws upon available sources to provide a fascinating picture of popular beliefs in demons during this period. She admirably fulfils her objective: 'to investigate the *De opinionibus* ... and to offer a multi-layered or "thick" description of its contents' (p. 4).

UNIVERSITY COLLEGE,
LONDON

CHARLES STEWART

Römische Mikropolitik unter Papst Paul V. Borghese (1605–1621) zwischen Spanien, Neapel, Mailand und Genua. Edited by Wolfgang Reinhard. Pp. xiv + 790. Tübingen: Max Niemeyer, 2004. €116. 3 484 82107 8; 0070 4156
JEH (57) 2006; doi:10.1017/S0022046905976215

This monumental volume exhibits the best thoroughness of German historical scholarship. It represents, to date, a climax in the ‘Mikropolitik’ project associated with Wolfgang Reinhard and his associates and disciples. That project seeks to trace, for early modern Italy, the personal, family and patronage links which lay beneath the evolution of public policy, in a way which might be described in Anglo-Saxon terms as *Namierite*. The papacy is naturally central to the project, or rather the pontificates of individual popes, with their nephews, not least that of Paul V and his spectacularly voracious nephew, Scipio Borghese. For obvious reasons of political geography, where related volumes have previously investigated connections between Rome and such places as Bologna, Perugia and Turin, the present publication extends not only from Rome to Spanish-ruled mainland Italy, both Naples and Milan, and to the Spanish-linked republic of Genoa, but also beyond, to the Spanish court of Philip III and Lerma. The triangular relations, both political and dynastic, between Borghese Rome, the Spanish possessions in Italy and Spain itself lend themselves admirably to such analysis, while Genoa provides a logical extension, forming part of its own triangle with both Rome on the one hand and Naples, Sicily and Spain on the other. After the editor’s introduction, Hillard von Thiesen investigates the Spanish court in the relevant period, from Spanish as well as other sources, and demonstrates the personalities and mechanisms involved in the pursuit of Roman interests there, as well as the equivalent channels through which Spanish interests were promoted at Rome. A similarly convincing two-way anatomy, for Naples with, again, Spain itself in relation to Rome, is then provided by Guido Metzler. Spain and the politics of its royal court are not forgotten in the next two chapters, both by Julia Zunckel. But their main argument is that, for a crucial part of those years of the Milanese archiepiscopate of Cardinal Federico Borromeo which coincided with the Borghese pontificate, papal dynastic ambitions created in the person of the provost of the Milanese royal peculiar, Santa Maria della Scala, an antagonist of the archbishop so authoritative as to merit the neologism ‘quasi-nuncio’. That Federico passionately opposed Giulio della Torre is undoubted, but the problem between the two men was arguably rather more structural than merely personal, since the triangular links which forced interaction between archiepiscopal jurisdiction at Milan and the double office more importantly held by the provost as both ducal and simultaneously apostolic *econom* in Lombardy were not peculiar to the Borghese papacy. The possible disproportion which the ‘Mikropolitik’ approach can occasionally display is again suggested in the final contribution on Genoa by Jan-Christoph Kitzler. This otherwise engaging discussion mentions only briefly, and in passing, the potentially most serious conflict, at the beginning of the pontificate, between the pope and that other maritime republic.

Michael Moore, c. 1639–1726. *Provost of Trinity, Rector of Paris*. By Liam Chambers.

Pp. 160. Dublin: Four Courts Press, 2005. €45. 1 85182 809 5

JEH (57) 2006; doi:10.1017/S0022046905986211

The significance of the Irish diaspora in early modern Europe has long been recognised, but only recently has it become the subject of sustained research. The crucial impetus has been provided by Thomas O'Connor's 'Irish in Europe' project, based in the History Department of NUI Maynooth, and this well-produced volume is published under its aegis. It is a revised and rewritten version of a doctoral thesis, including most of the material in the original dissertation (except for the discussion and inventory of Moore's library, which has been published separately in *Archivium Hibernicum* lviii [2004]). In many respects Michael Moore was a typical Irish *émigré*, who followed the traditional Irish Catholic educational path to France, where he embarked on an academic career, serving as Professor of Philosophy at the Collège des Grassins in Paris from 1665 and taking charge of a seminary in Italy in 1695, before returning to Paris in 1701, where he was elected Rector of the university – 'a remarkable achievement for an obscure Irish clerical migrant' (p. 134) – served as Professor of Philosophy at the Collège de France, and was entrusted with the task of thoroughly reforming the curriculum and discipline of the prestigious Collège Royal de Navarre. Chambers provides us with a clear account not only of Moore's rise to prominence but also of his intellectual development, particularly his defence of Aristotelianism against the newfangled Cartesianism in his *De existentia dei* (1692), and raises the interesting but unproveable possibility that Moore's essential conservatism may have been a reaction against the unsettling experience of dispossession and exile. This in itself is a useful contribution to the study of French higher education, but Moore was more than just an Irish exile making his way on the continent. He maintained close links with Ireland and with the Pale community into which he had been born, and, crucially, was afforded the opportunity of returning in the 1680s when the accession of James II briefly offered the possibility of restoring Irish Catholicism to power and influence. Moore came back to Ireland in 1686, and established his one obvious claim to fame – becoming in 1689 the only Roman Catholic provost of Trinity College, Dublin, during the first four hundred years of its history. But the prospect of power exposed serious rifts amongst the Catholics, not just between secular and regular priests, but also between James and his clergy, as they quarrelled over whether the king or the papacy had the right of presentation to Irish benefices. Moore strenuously defended the Church's entitlement, and was banished for his pains, returning to France in 1691. Studying the Irish in Europe is always challenging, linguistically as well as historically. This study is a model of its kind, thoroughly researched, ranging across manuscript sources in Ireland, England, France and Italy, demonstrating a sure touch in handling political as well as intellectual history. Above all, Chambers demonstrates the way in which the history of Catholic Ireland is now inescapably a Europe-wide enterprise, demanding a grasp of a wide range of disciplines in an effort to capture the 'doubleness' of Irish emigrants, always looking back to Ireland whilst also seeking to integrate themselves in their adopted countries.

Commonwealth principles. Republican writing of the English Revolution. By Jonathan Scott.

Pp. xii + 402. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2004. £45.

0 521 84375 8

JEH (57) 2006; doi:10.1017/S0022046905216238

Jonathan Scott has established himself as a leading scholar of English classical republicanism – a learned interpreter of the sources and discourses of its early modern exponents and a perceptive critic of the output of its modern historians. In a book published in 2000, he offered the provocative observation that ‘moral principles’ appeared to merit an inferior place in scholarly treatments of early modern republicanism; the historiographical ascendancy lay, instead, with ‘constitutional forms’ (*England’s troubles*, 295–6). The book under review here resoundingly articulates its author’s sense of the priority of principles. Anti-formalists almost to a man, Scott’s republicans were fired by the imperatives of a practical religiosity that would issue in disciplined souls and virtuous, public-minded citizens. Empowered by opportunities raised by war and interregnum, the English republicans of the mid-seventeenth century were dedicated more to the moral project of the ‘reformation of manners’ than to the formal one of the construction of constitutions. Determined to cultivate the virtuous fruits of reason and liberty, they were sensitive to the ‘remains of divine light’ through which ‘virtue’ acquired its lodging in the scale of higher values, insisting that ‘moral virtues are ripened and heightened by a superinduction of divine knowledge’ (*Commonwealth principles*, 60). Republicans lived providential lives, and thirsted for the divine grace that would enable the fulfilment of their capacity for virtuous action. The pursuit of principle in preference to form drives a rethinking of the place of James Harrington – a rethinking that Scott has undertaken, in respectful dissent from the views of J. G. A. Pocock, over a number of years. Scott’s Harrington – the premier constitutional formalist among English republicans – is noteworthy on various fronts for his atypicality. Harrington, indeed, is the formalist and materialist foil to Scott’s proponents of moral agency. Harringtonian forms are deadly: they will suffocate rather than consolidate republican principles; they will repress rather than facilitate the human capacity for responsible self-governance and civic participation. Harrington abandons the divinely inspired pursuit of personal virtue that was fundamental to the republican moral vision. At the heart of *Commonwealth principles* is an impressive cluster of chapters designed to analyse the ideological commitments of Nedham, Milton, Vane, Sreater, Sidney and Neville – the principal anti-formalist republicans of the mid-seventeenth century. The book is divided into three parts. In part I, entitled ‘contexts’, Scott treats in general terms of the ideological constituents of republicanism and of the material, commercial and governmental environment with which it contended. The six chapters of the second part devote themselves to the ‘analysis’ of republican principles. The product is almost a morphology of the republican heart and intellect, though Scott is far too attuned to his republicans’ specific concerns and differing uses of classical and Renaissance sources to carve up his erudition into too rigid an arrangement of components. The discussions of principles and protagonists are satisfyingly porous, enabling Scott to explore the fertility of republican discourse by bringing to his analyses the nuances and contrasts – as well as the continuities – that engage the reader of sophisticated intellectual history. Chock-full of republican testaments of indebtedness to Greek and Roman sources, as well as to Machiavelli and Grotius

and other moderns, these analytical chapters explicate the main strands of a complex body of writing. Scott begins part II by addressing the republican idioms of resistance theory and constitutionality. The commitment to liberty and to its 'most important consequence', virtue, occupies the central chapters of the book, where Scott enters the rich ideological territory of the means and ends of the government of self and society. The religious thread is followed through this core group of chapters, though the reader might wish for a treatment of 'Puritanism' designed to clarify the sense(s) in which classical republicans can be described as 'Puritans'. In a section on the 'rhetoric of Puritan magistracy' (pp. 184–90), for example, Plato and Aristotle appear as recurrent authorities but we are offered neither an analysis of the category of 'Puritanism' nor an accounting for the specifically 'Puritan' dimensions of the rhetoric under discussion. 'Chronology' succeeds 'analysis' in part III, as Scott narrates the story and aftermath of England's republican experiment. The chronological chapters seek to marry matters of principle to a narrative focus, and offer some interesting commentary on the location of republican writings in specific circumstances of time and place – particularly worthy of note are the explications of Nedham and Harrington. However, these chapters range over the entire seventeenth century before touching briefly on the early eighteenth, and Scott struggles to do justice to his wide-ranging concerns within the allocated space. It is difficult to avoid the impression that the final part has a stitched-on quality, as though a different book has been added at p. 231. *Commonwealth principles* is a study that tries to do too much, that at times deals too thinly with its multiple foci. But it deserves to command the attention of a wide readership of early modern historians, and will assuredly stimulate further research into the ideological composition of seventeenth-century republicanism.

MELBOURNE

DAVID PARNHAM

Gangraena and the struggle for the English revolution. By Ann Hughes. Pp. xii + 482 incl. 6 ills. Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2004. £60. 0 19 925192 4

JEH (57) 2006; doi:10.1017/S0022046905226234

Long-awaited, this is a work of major importance. Thomas Edwards's *Gangraena*, a sprawling, intemperate attack on the sectarians of the 1640s, has long been a quarry for historians exploring radical religion and the fears it aroused. Ann Hughes approaches it from a different perspective, as text rather than source, and probes the role it played in the fraught religious and political climate of 1646–7. This is the 'new history of the book' at its most illuminating. *Gangraena* certainly does not exemplify the 'death of the author'; Edwards's personality was all-pervasive, his intent unmistakable. But, perhaps more than any other work of the age, *Gangraena* was a collaborative production, with Edwards drawing heavily on what he picked up in bookshops, at the Exchange or in the street, and on alarmist letters from like-minded Presbyterians in the provinces. Its confused structure reflected the process of composition, with sections despatched to the printer as soon as penned, and supplementary passages added as further material came to hand. Edwards was writing with a very specific and immediate purpose, to alert his readers to the scale of the sectarian threat, and galvanise them into action that would make Parliament confront the danger before it was too late. Otherwise heresy and blasphemy would

overrun the land, provoking divine wrath and subverting all moral, social and political order. As Hughes demonstrates, *Gangraena* was primarily a Londoner's book. Edwards devoted most space to the most combative London radicals, and when he looked outwards he focused on London emissaries 'infecting' the provinces. His stories were sometimes third- or fourth-hand, but his main sin lay in deliberately misrepresenting his opponents, by misleading selection and by blurring the differences between Independents and radicals, all tarred with the same brush of fanaticism. Paradoxically, though he wanted to see the radicals suppressed, Edwards was eager to provoke a public debate, a debate he was confident he and his friends could win. And he enjoyed plenty of support, for as Hughes argues persuasively, he stood for something close to the original parliamentarian dream of 1642, godly reformation within a limited monarchy. But although his book helped inspire a campaign that eventually bore some fruit in the Blasphemy Ordinance of 1648, his crusade ended in failure. Londoners proved ultimately unable or unwilling to take on Parliament and army, and his book may have served to galvanise his opponents as much as his friends. Despite his preoccupation with the present moment, Edwards also predicted gloomily that the unfettered multiplication of religions would eventually lead to the ruin of them all. He would have taken little pleasure in seeing his prophecy in part fulfilled, nor in Hughes's concluding observation that his book shows 'how lively, populist, dynamic and seductive prose can serve a bad cause'.

UNIVERSITY OF WARWICK

BERNARD CAPP

Reformation pastors. Richard Baxter and the ideal of the reformed pastor. By J. William Black. (Studies in Evangelical History and Thought.) Pp. xxi + 315. Carlisle: Paternoster, 2004. £24.99 (paper). 1 84227 190 3

Peace, toleration and decay. The ecclesiology of later Stuart dissent. By Martin Sutherland. (Studies in Evangelical History and Thought.) Pp. xxii + 223. Carlisle: Paternoster, 2003. £19.99 (paper). 1 84227 152 0
JEH (57) 2006; doi:10.1017/S0022046905236230

Richard Baxter, who was remarkably prominent in English religious and political life between the early 1650s and his death in 1691, left several hundred letters, well over a hundred publications – some of them enduring spiritual classics – and a manuscript autobiography which was edited and published by Matthew Sylvester in 1696 and was quarried again by Edmund Calamy in 1702. The cumulative effect has been for Baxter to dominate subsequent views of late seventeenth-century Dissent. This is unfortunate. Touchy, self-righteous, prone to rush into print without due consideration and to intervene in politics without due preparation, Baxter pursued an idiosyncratic line in theology and churchmanship. That there are dangers in taking Baxter at his own estimation, or seeing the seventeenth century through his eyes, is amply borne out by two works, which appear in a series of *Studies in Evangelical History and Thought*. William Black's book argues that we have got Baxter out of focus, while the second, Martin Sutherland's study of John Howe, suggests that Baxter's reputation has overshadowed the significance of his friend and colleague Howe.

Black directs our attention to Baxter's only sustained experience as a parish clergyman, his ministry at Kidderminster in the 1650s. Baxter portrayed these years

as personally fulfilling and a rip-roaring pastoral success. Ever the self-publicist, he noisily recommended his methods to his clerical brethren and set up the Worcestershire Association to disseminate them. Baxter and his assistants regularly visited parishioners at home to instruct, catechise and counsel them. When parishioners were judged ready to receive the sacrament, they were required to profess their faith publicly, acknowledge Baxter's spiritual oversight and subscribe to a written covenant. Those who erred were admonished privately and then, if necessary, by a monthly meeting of ministers and lay members of the church which had the power to excommunicate offenders. Black fleshes out this fairly familiar story with considerable detail drawn from the unpublished Baxter correspondence. He devotes a chapter to the Worcestershire Association and establishes its debt to earlier 'combination lectures'. He explores the important role of the ministers' assistant and describes the long career of Thomas Doolittle, a local boy trained by Baxter. He shrewdly analyses the complex evidence, especially that provided by Samuel Clarke, for seventeenth-century pastoral practice. All this is welcome and pertinent. Less convincing is the claim that Baxter resuscitated an 'evangelical' pastoral agenda first enunciated by Martin Bucer and repudiated the 'puritan' dead end of institutional reform and 'puritan pulpitocracy' (p. 49). Baxter is said to have aimed at an evangelical reformation, 'local, pastoral and practical' (p. 73), based on the conversion of all those who professed the Christian faith. However helpful it may be to certain forms of modern churchmanship, this reclassification of Baxter as an 'evangelical' in contradistinction to a 'puritan' is historically neither necessary nor justified. Even the author is worried by the complete absence of any evidence that Baxter's pastoral thinking was influenced by Bucer. Yet the mere 'consonance' between the two models is enough to set him wondering and that possibility has a tendency to harden into something a little more definite. Moreover, all this could be irrelevant, as we never learn whether Bucer's model was a *voluntary* discipline as was Baxter's. Indeed, Black persistently glosses over the inconvenient fact that Baxter could only ever interest a minority of the good folk of Kidderminster in submitting to his discipline. Just as unsettling is Black's unwillingness to recognise that others before Baxter had used these pastoral methods: he allows George Herbert as the exception that proves the rule; but it is only an insistence that all Baxter's predecessors were trapped in a pulpit-centred 'puritan' cul-de-sac that allows him to discount Richard Greenham. Black's argument also requires that he play down Baxter's commitment to preaching as an evangelical tool, that he ignores Baxter's flexibility over church government and that he skirts around the spiritual status of the parish. Black is surely correct to identify conversion as a key issue and to remark on how little we know of Baxter's sense of that process, but why did he not explore the implications of Baxter's 'Arminian' soteriology for this subject?

Parochial discipline and pastoral authority were of little concern to the theologian John Howe (1630–1705). Howe was preoccupied with the direct effect of God on the soul, the intuitive encounter, the ineffable 'heart religion', the 'effusion of the Spirit' that would create love, peace and holiness among Christians. Sutherland's careful consideration of his theology concludes that it 'depended upon his bias to the invisible, the transcendent, the spiritual arena' (p. 158). In large part an intellectual biography, Sutherland's book discloses Howe's philosophical influences, such as his early exposure to Platonism and mitigated scepticism, and his scriptural preferences – he based his eschatology on Ezekiel rather than Daniel or Revelations.

Sutherland weaves succinct discussions of each of Howe's writings with accounts of the arguments of his adversaries, such as Stillingfleet and Locke, and demonstrates Howe's underlying theological consistency. No great claims are made for Howe's originality – at times the author appears underwhelmed by his subject's prose or political nous – but a persuasive case is made for Howe as the exponent of a significant strand of Nonconformist thinking. Significant in that this was a coherent and attractive option, an irenic theology of charity and mutual tolerance based on what Sutherland calls an 'invisibilist' ecclesiology that rendered irrelevant the denominational labels drawn from models of church government. Significant in that Howe was a respected and influential figure in Nonconformist circles. And perhaps most significant because it shaped Calamy's platform of 'Moderate Nonconformity': long seen as a repackaging of Baxter's principles, Calamy's agenda may – on Sutherland's evidence – owe as much to Howe as it does to Baxter. In this way Sutherland helps to revise the terms of debate over late Stuart Dissent. Yet, as he readily admits, Howe's position contained the seeds of its own destruction. Such tolerance, such an emphasis on the spiritual, rather than doctrinal or organisational, unity of the Church, provided no real rebuttal of the pretensions of the established Church or firm grounds for denominational cohesion in the face of the disputes of the early eighteenth century. The virtue of Sutherland's welcome book is to introduce us to the mind and hopes of a man who has been too long obscured by his brethren's quarrelsome ways and Richard Baxter's long shadow.

UNIVERSITY OF SWANSEA

JOHN SPURR

The works of Thomas Traherne, I: Inducements to retirednes; A sober view of Dr Twiss's his considerations; Seeds of eternity or the nature of the soul; The kingdom of God. Edited by Jan Ross. Pp. xxiv + 571 incl. 5 plates. Cambridge: D. S. Brewer, 2005. £75. 1 84384 037 5

JEH (57) 2006; doi:10.1017/S0022046905246237

Rescued from book barrows, from mild neglect and anonymity, or from a burning rubbish heap, the manuscripts of the seventeenth-century theologian and poet Thomas Traherne have seemed to trickle into the twenty-first century almost by chance. Similarly incomplete has been the critique of Traherne as an over-optimistic nature-loving mystic, or as a rather awkward late metaphysical poet, or even as a Pre-Romantic, linked with Blake and Wordsworth. In this volume the most recent Traherne discovery, the Lambeth Palace Manuscript, appears entire for the first time. The manuscript is considerable in size and weighty in content. It will make a lasting impression on the canon – not only does it tilt the balance of Traherne's corpus in the direction of prose rather than poetry, but it also offers important new insights into Traherne as a serious seventeenth-century theologian.

The Lambeth Palace Manuscript contains four and a fragmentary fifth mainly prose works that range in style and theme from practical advice on ministry, and explorations into the capacity of the human soul, to a detailed tracking of the Calvinist/Arminian debate; and the highly ambitious forty two-chapter *The kingdom of God*, a work of philosophical theology in which Traherne alternates between scholastic analysis and wondering contemplation as he considers God and his creation. Traherne begins with God as creator, then the creation as an expression of

himself (his body, as it were). *The kingdom of God* is about divine goodness extending and seeking reciprocity; and here, indebted to St John Chrysostom, Richard Hooker and George Herbert, amongst many others, in *The kingdom of God*, as elsewhere, what Traherne seeks to find and to convey is an unfolding of the mystery of divine abundance and divine longing. The short fragment *Love* frames the love of God for the soul on the model of human love.

The themes in this volume echo those in Traherne's previously known works: freedom, choice, infinity, felicity, the beauty of nature, the essential goodness of creation. The Traherne we see here is familiar; what is new is the distinctly serious theological voice and a more thorough working out of ideas. Throughout the manuscript Traherne is deeply engaged with the intellectual events of his day; and in *The kingdom of God*, the volume's most highly developed work, we see him fascinated by the new sciences, from early atomic theory to Harvey's circulation of the blood, and keen to witness observations of the telescope and the microscope that were making the world suddenly 'both ways infinite'.

A complete works has never before been attempted, and Boydell & Brewer have shown discernment in starting one with this most recent manuscript, hitherto read by only a handful of scholars. It is a welcome chapter in a story famous for its narrow escapes, misattribution and long delays. This volume will certainly open the way for strong new readings of Traherne; we owe a debt of gratitude to the publishers and to the editor Jan Ross for her dedicated work in making it available.

ELY

DENISE INGE

Basler Missionare in Brasilien. Auswanderung, Erweckung und Kirchenwerdung im 19. Jahrhundert. By Marlon Ronald Fluck. (Basler und Berner Studien zur historischen und systematischen Theologie, 72.) Pp. 424. Bern: Peter Lang, 2004. £43 (paper). 3 03910 205 2; 0171 6840

Philipp Segesser SJ (1689–1762). By Heiko Schmuck. (Mainzer Studien zur Neueren Geschichte, 11.) Pp. 398 incl. 8 maps and 13 ills. Frankfurt-am-Main: Peter Lang, 2003. £38 (paper). 3 631 52321 1; 1437 1219

Mission und Sprache. Interdisziplinäre Erkundungen zum Orden Colonial in Iberoamerika. Edited by Matthias Vollet and Felipe Castañeda. (FASK. Publikationen des Fachbereichs Angewandte Sprach- und Kulturwissenschaft der Johannes Gutenberg-Universität Mainz in Gernersheim. Reihe A, 39.) Pp. viii + 253. Frankfurt-am-Main: Peter Lang, 2004. £27 (paper). 3 631 50384 9; 0941 9543
JEH (57) 2006; doi:10.1017/S0022046905256233

These three books reflect on the missionary system in colonial Latin America, but they handle the topic in different ways, methodologically and in quality. The books by Fluck and Schmuck are both doctoral dissertations, the first accepted by the faculty of theology at the University of Basle and the second by the faculty of history at the University of Mainz. Though it is usual in Germany and Switzerland to publish a thesis more or less as handed in to the faculty, Fluck should have taken time to revise the draft version, in particular the language. Apart from a mistake in the list of contents (the *curriculum vitae* is still listed) the author was ill-advised to use expressions that have in German today a negative connotation (for instance, the term 'Eingeborene' has for many decades had pejorative connotations – worse than

the term 'primitive' in English – and should not be used to describe indigenous people). But even within the third book, a compilation of papers of a conference about language and mission, some authors use terms such as 'Indios' that have a very pejorative connotation in Latin America today and indicate an ongoing colonial attitude towards indigenous people – not a sign of a self-reflective, post-colonial change in the humanities. Though Fluck can be excused for growing up in a different language (he is Brazilian) and therefore being unfamiliar with current debates, most of the contributors to the third book cannot. It would have been wise if the editors had examined Schmuck's book, because the author of this monograph demonstrates how to deal with such old-fashioned terms. Moreover the editors of the compilation have neglected their duty to revise the articles, which are arranged in a very simple way (in chronological order), without a good introduction. Some of the chapters are still written in the style of oral papers (for example, Pelizaeus, Janik and Castañeda), others present few new ideas (for example Vollet) or use evolutionist terms such as 'Hochkultur' (high culture) without challenging them. Nevertheless some chapters are excellent and offer interesting interpretations of historical texts. For instance, Langebaek's comparison of two different descriptions of the same event, the destruction of an indigenous temple in the Sierra Nevada de Santa Marta, is a good example of the contextualisation of historical materials. Schäfer interprets Las Casas's sense of justice based on Aristotle's philosophy; Roggenhofer gives an interesting explanation of the high number of miracles during the colonisation and Aymoré discusses Jesuit missionaries and their different use of languages and rituals during their mission.

The authors of the two dissertations present the result of meticulous research in various archives (Fluck in Germany, Switzerland and Brazil, Schmuck in Germany, Spain, Switzerland, Mexico and the USA) which makes the monographs a rich source for further studies in this field. In particular Schmuck's book is an excellent case study of Philipp Segesser, a Jesuit from Lucerne who was sent to Nueva España to tend to indigenous groups in the area of Sonora, today divided into the Mexican state of Sonora and the southern part of the US state of Arizona. The author succeeds in presenting an interesting biography of Segesser combined with insight into the daily practice of missionary work during colonial times. Schmuck starts by introducing his method (chapter i), his subject (chapter ii) and the region (chapter iii), before continuing with Segesser, his family and his educational background (chapter iv) and daily practice on the mission station (chapter v). Segesser is, as Schmuck writes, one of the main colonial chroniclers of indigenous people in Sonora (with his Jesuit colleague Ignaz Pfefferkorn). As the ethnohistorian Frank Salomon insists, ethnohistory should not focus only on the extraction of facts about indigenous people from colonial texts but should investigate how those texts were created. The understanding of the creation process can change our interpretation of the colonial reality. Schmuck presents, with his microstudy of an important author of colonial descriptions of indigenous people, a degree of insight which will help further anthropological studies in this area. At the end he deconstructs an ongoing legend: despite Segesser's image as a lonely man, a missionary hero, Schmuck demonstrates that a missionary like him survived and was – for a little while – even successful in his job only with the support of the Spanish government and the Spanish army. As Schmuck writes, Segesser was not an exceptional man but he had, when compared with other missionaries, unusually good connections with the Spanish

elite, and quite a lot of influence on local government. In sum, Schmuck offers a detailed study of a middle European missionary and a thorough analysis of the colonial period.

Unfortunately, the other dissertation is of a lesser academic standard. Though the author provides a lot of interesting details about the Basler mission and the creation of a Protestant Church in Brazil, his book is just a compilation of facts and offers little in the way of academic interpretation. It has neither introduction nor conclusion (though every chapter has them), no discussion of methodology and the main academic aim of the book remains unclear. Even worse, the book contains grave mistakes. Some may be the result of linguistic problems (for example on p. 18 n. 2, the author used the term 'vorkolumbianische Gottesdienste' which indicates, literally translated, the existence of a Christian service before Columbus). His distinction between Spanish and Portuguese history is superficial. He tends to make sweeping statements, in particular about Spanish history, based on literature from the middle of the twentieth-century (mainly Mackay [1952] and Castro [1948]) without contextualising them (for example on p. 22 he uses a text from 1606 in the same way as a textbook from the twentieth century). This leads to a simple characterisation of 'the Spaniards', 'the Jews' or 'the Primitives' (for example, p. 23). In addition Fluck ignores other interpretations of colonial texts such as, for example, Monika Wehrheim-Peuker's excellent study of colonial French Americana where she investigates the failure of the Huguenots in Brazil and Florida (*Die gescheiterte Eroberung*, Tübingen 1998). In sum, the author presents an overview of material about the Basler missionary in Brazil which can be helpful in further investigations, but the material will have to be re-examined.

UNIVERSITY OF OXFORD

BETTINA SCHMIDT

Begeisterung und Ernüchterung in christlicher Vollkommenheit. Pietistische Selbst- und Weltwahrnehmungen im ausgehenden 17. Jahrhundert. By Ryoko Mori. (Hallesche Forschungen, 14.) Pp. xi + 320. Tübingen: Max Niemeyer, 2004. €52 (paper). 3 484 84014 5; 3 931479 52 8; 0949 0086
Francke in Glaucha. Kehrseiten eines Klischees (1692–1704). By Veronika Albrecht-Birkner. (Hallesche Forschungen, 15.) Pp. ix + 148. Tübingen: Max Niemeyer, 2004. €26 (paper). 3 484 84015 3; 3 931479 57 9; 0949 0086
JEH (57) 2006; doi:10.1017/S002204690526623X

One of the most instantly rewarding investments West Germany ever made in the former DDR was in the rescue of the old Francke foundations at Halle. Buildings which were on the point of collapse are now in fine order, the archive is now more accessible than it ever was, even in pre-Hitlerite days, and high-grade research based on it is pouring forth. These two monographs are numbers 14 and 15 in the *Hallesche Forschungen*, and an untold number have appeared elsewhere. Ryoko Mori's volume is the more conventional of the two, and despite his apology for writing in what is not his first language, his German is also entirely conventional and lucid. What he shows by careful application to the Francke archive is that a great deal remains to be learned about things which were thought to be well-known already. He begins from the familiar point of the disappointing end of Spener's *collegium pietatis* in Frankfurt, and the equally disappointing result of his programmatic writing, the *Pia desideria* (1675). Spener had hoped to produce a consensus in favour of church reform; what

he got was plenty of sympathy but no action. Where the action came (as both monographs make clear) was anywhere where August Hermann Francke was involved. Mori's theme is carefully to map what happened to Francke and his associates when they were turned out of Leipzig; at the very moment when Spener was giving up (but not forswearing) his *collegia* Francke and his friends were spreading the institution all across north Germany. Moreover the objects of this phase of the movement were different from those which Spener had set himself. Francke does not mention the Church in his *Lebenslauf*, and certainly had no prospect of an ecclesiastical career after the troubles in Leipzig. His religious problem prior to his conversion was with the authority or truth of the Scriptures, and, like many of his friends, he was taken up with the configuration of the Christian life which did not seem to be made clear by the Churches in possession. The successful tract in this phase, by Francke's friend Johann Caspar Schade, was entitled *What do I still lack?* (1690–1); it defined no less than sixty-nine characteristics of the essential Christian life, and commenced in heavy type, 'Knowledge is good ... **Action is still better ... One thing I still lack. Action.**' Thus, from the start, Christian perfection as advocated by Francke's group involved walking a tight-rope; on the one side it was easy to fall off into activism and pharisaism (as Francke himself did), on the other side the summons to Christian perfection attracted many, including the innumerable servant-girls with visions who so vexed Spener, and had no doubt that God had called them to this and that, and when the going got hard, were convinced that a Second Coming was not merely imminent, but required to sort out the mess. This was indeed the apocalyptic meaning of the constant reports of sweating blood or weeping bloody tears. At Halle Christ indeed appeared to a sempstress (though somewhat obscured by a blinding light). All this was potentially subversive of established institutions in Church and State which Spener had hoped to reform, and immediately contrary to the battle he had fought with Lutheran Orthodoxy to put off the apocalypse to the middle distance. It was not long before it became clear to Francke that his survival in Halle depended on the support of the Elector, and the Elector, magnanimous as he was, would not tolerate the subversion of existing institutions. Francke made his choice and became a great institutional organiser.

Mori's great service is to chart a brief but crucial transition in great detail; Frau Albrecht-Birkner does what it was inevitable someone would do sooner or later, namely to turn Francke's archive (and many of the other archives in Halle-Glauchau) against the reputation of the great man himself. This would not matter very much, since there is not much question of Francke's eminence, were it not that she confirms in (literally) parochial detail one of the implications of Mori's story. What gets under her skin is the Pietist legend that Glaucha, the parish just outside the gates of Halle, which the Elector found for Francke, was a sink of sin, in which almost every other house was a pot-house; that he rescued the parish from its degradation and made it an international beacon by creating one of the biggest buildings in Europe there for his charitable foundations. The truth actually was that Glaucha was originally an agricultural parish without enough land to support its population; the inhabitants therefore had recourse to industrial employment, in their case brandy-distilling. There being no Rathaus (and hence no Rathauskeller) the trade was carried on from home, and as guests required hospitality throughout the week it was abnormally difficult for the inhabitants to satisfy Francke's requirements of Sabbath observance.

His response was to exclude parishioners from confession and communion in alarming numbers, while making sure that they did not make off into Halle to the more compliant Orthodox clergy there. Much trouble might have been avoided had there been a Ratskeller, and the parishioners set out to have one by building the Golden Eagle. However, one of Francke's worst disputes with his parish arose from the fact that he moved first and built his Orphan House on the site! But there was a constant running battle between him and his parishioners because he was determined to enforce the full Pietist programme as sketched out by Schade, whether they liked it or not, whether it was feasible in their circumstances or not, and whether or not it accorded with the Lutheran tradition as understood in Halle. Francke's doctrinaire attitude made him absolutely dependent on royal favour; and Spener was always cautioning him from Berlin to go steady in case he lost it. Yet after losing a good many arguments he won the day, and turned Glaucha from a town of pot-houses to a sort of primitive Edinburgh which made a more or less honest living out of education.

PETERSFIELD

W. R. WARD

Hallischer Pietismus und Judenmission. Johann Heinrich Callenbergs Institutum Judaicum und dessen Freudenkreis (1728–1736). By Christoph Rymatzki. (Hallesche Forschungen, 11.) Pp. xiv + 554. Tübingen: Verlag der Franckeschen Stiftungen Halle im Max Niemeyer, 2004. €78 (paper). 3 484 84011 0; 3 931479 4; 0949 0086
JEH (57) 2006; doi:10.1017/S0022046905276236

Reading this blockbuster is refreshing in its way as it is exactly the sort of scholarly work which British publishers these days are loathe to undertake, lavishly provided as it is with footnotes in their right place and taking up half of almost every page, a huge bibliography and a comprehensive index. For those minded to battle with the feast it is also rewarding, and a great monument to what can be done now that the Halle archives are properly open to public access. Rymatzki leaves no document unturned, no pamphlet unread, almost no subscriber untraced. The result of his labour is to cast a great deal of light on the religious situation in the Protestant world at three different levels. The first is that of the old Protestant Orthodox expectation of the conversion of the Jews as a harbinger of the end-time, an expectation now ebbing but renewed by Spener. The pressure exerted on Jews in Poland in the mid-seventeenth century by severe pogroms, which had led to mass conversions to both Catholicism and Islam, was now eased, but it had resulted in revived messianic expectations in many Jewish congregations, which Callenberg thought might be responsive to Christian persuasion and literary propaganda gently brought to bear. In this cause he was able to rally support from Zinzendorf and Bengel who did not care much for the Halle brand. The second sphere of interest is that Callenberg showed much shrewdness in building up two networks of friends, one to disseminate his pamphlets and the other to subscribe. These networks, which extended from the SPCK in London to Astrakhan, in a good measure replicated those which Francke had created for the support of his Halle institutions (from which the Institutum Judaicum remained independent), but included other sources as well, and are an interesting measure of the places where Pietism had taken root. The third level is

that of popular religious belief where all manner of worms were turning. The Orthodox had expected the conversion of the Jews while doing little towards achieving it; but Callenberg was able to pick up collaborators who had already responded to individual vocations to Jewish mission. And while it was known that the sight of the poor Salzburger exiles trekking across Europe stimulated Protestant revivals, it comes as a surprise that they also stimulated enthusiasm for Jewish missions. Alas! Rymatzki's narrative shows that the Institutum Judaicum was not exempt from the introversion which afflicts religious, and perhaps especially evangelistic, institutions. By 1736 (where the book ends) Callenberg thought he had got his institution set up, with policies, publishing, finances and the rest. But he did not convert many Jews, he had already surrendered his hope of uniting Jewish baptism with Pietist conversion, and largely abandoned his intention of extending the work into Arabic missions; still worse he had been advised by one backsliding alumnus of Halle that he would never cut any ice till he gave up the doctrine of the Trinity!

PETERSFIELD

W. R. WARD

The altar's fire. Charles Wesley's Hymns on the lord's supper, 1745. Introduction and exposition. By Daniel B. Stevick. Pp. xix + 276. Peterborough: Epworth, 2004. £19.99 (paper). 0 7162 0586 6
JEH (57) 2006; doi:10.1017/S0022046905286232

This careful introduction and commentary places the 1745 collection of eucharistic hymns by Charles Wesley in their historical setting, providing a useful handbook to supplement the current discussion of these hymns in ecumenical debate. Particularly helpful is the comparison of this collection with the full text of Brevint's remarkable *The Christian sacrament and sacrifice*, published in Oxford in 1673 and purchased by John Wesley in 1732, and read by him during his voyage to Georgia. At points expressing opposition to Calvinist views of the effect of the sacrament as limited to the elect and also to extreme Moravian views on the dispensability of outward sacramental means for faith (the 'stillness' movement) which caused John Wesley to separate his followers from the Fetter Lane Society in 1740, the 1745 collection is best known for its eucharistic theology, including its emphasis on the unitary character of the threefold eucharistic sacrifice, the 'once for all' on the cross, the continual heavenly offering of the eternal priest and the Church's repeated sacrifice. The texts, the explanations of eighteenth-century vocabulary and the relation of the 1745 collection to Wesley material of that period are all reliably presented, providing a valuable reference work. If there are weaknesses these are due to the wide range of issues which the collection raises, and which require monographs in their own right: the relation of penitential discipline to the evangelical invitation to the Lord's Table, the understanding of emotion in the tradition of the Wesleys and the sociological implication of their eucharistic practice. A reference to the low mass obscures the debate between the visual advantages of medieval practice and the social implications of Reformed practice superbly illustrated by the frontispiece of Wheatly's 1710 *A rational illustration of the Book of Common Prayer*.

LINCOLN

IVOR H. JONES

Anti-Catholic strategies in eighteenth-century Scotland. By Clotilde Prunier. (Scottish Studies International. Publications of the Scottish Studies Centre of the Johannes Gutenberg Universität Mainz in Germersheim, 35.) Pp. 230 incl. pull-out map. Frankfurt-am-Main: Peter Lang, 2004. £28 (paper). 3 631 52050 6; 0 8204 6555 0; 0430 9572

JEH (57) 2006; doi:10.1017/S0022046905296239

Roman Catholics comprised a tiny fraction of the population of Scotland in the eighteenth century, yet, huddled in a small number of Highland and Island parishes, they constituted a significant presence and, in cases, even a localised majority over Protestants. Clotilde Prunier focuses on the anti-Catholic attitudes and policies of Scottish Presbyterians and their attempts to force conversions to Protestantism through education and missionary activity, primarily undertaken by the Society in Scotland for Propagating Christian Knowledge (the SSPCK) from 1709. Prunier deconstructs the Protestant nightmare of Scottish Catholicism – that Highland geography created enormous parishes where the reach of the law and of a few Presbyterian ministers was slight. In such places, it was perceived, the Catholic population was constantly increasing, both in numbers and influence, due to the aggressive nature of the Scottish mission and the willingness of Catholic priests to celebrate mixed marriages and to baptise the children of Protestant parents. In the second half of the eighteenth century, as Jacobitism waned, as the demands of European wars and the British empire invited Scottish Catholics to join the British army and demonstrate their loyalty to the Hanoverian regime, and as the French Revolution temporarily made an alliance of Christianity against irreligion appear more important than Christian sectarian differences, Catholicism slowly became more acceptable in Britain and in Scotland. Yet the comparative confidence that the British state and some elements of the Church of Scotland were able to place in Scottish Catholicism by the 1770s was not matched by Scottish popular opinion, as the violent opposition to the proposed Catholic Relief Bill of 1778–9 demonstrates. This treatment of anti-Catholicism offers tantalising insights into the nature of the Scottish Presbyterian mind and its complex and often tortured views on Church–State relations, as Prunier points to the existence of at least one Church of Scotland minister who was troubled by the prospect of excessively close co-operation between Church and State in the suppression of Catholicism. Prunier ably covers not only the attitudes and imperatives of the Presbyterian would-be persecutors, but also makes a valuable contribution to the under-researched field of the Highland Catholic population itself, and the struggles of and divisions between those who sought to protect, direct, and minister to it. She provides insights into the day-to-day coexistence of Catholics and Protestants in Highland communities, and the pragmatic rather than zealous imperatives that were often at work in education. Catholic parents were keen to have their children educated, and this could entail the subversion of Protestant teaching initiatives such as the SSPCK. Catholics became adept in some instances at accepting instruction in literacy but avoiding or ignoring the Protestant religious education. Prunier's work demonstrates the ineffectual nature of strictures 'from above', whether from the British government, from the Church of Scotland, from the SSPCK or from the vicars apostolic who claimed authority over Scotland's Catholics. In many instances the conditions and lives of Scottish Catholics in the

Highlands and Islands developed with their own local logic, regardless of official policies.

UNIVERSITY OF GLASGOW

CAROLINE ERSKINE

Literarisches Leben in Melk. Ein Kloster im 18. Jahrhundert im kulturellen Umbruch. By Johannes Frimmel. (Schriftenreihe der Österreichischen Gesellschaft zur Erforschung des 18. Jahrhunderts, 10.) Pp. 254. Vienna–Cologne–Weimar: Böhlau, 2005. €39 (paper). 3 205 77156 7
JEH (57) 2006; doi:10.1017/S0022046905306233

The Benedictine abbey of Melk, poised on a cliff near the Danube, has always been exposed to external influences from visitors on their way to and from Vienna. This study, originally a Vienna doctoral dissertation, shows how readily its inmates responded to the Austrian Enlightenment and to changes in literary culture. Earlier in the eighteenth century, cultural production was subordinate to the abbey's ceremonial duties: talented monks wrote plays, poems and musical works to be performed on grand occasions, such as the installation of a new abbot. The virtual abolition of censorship by Joseph II in 1781 caused a huge expansion of periodical and pamphlet publication and encouraged the growth of the public sphere based on salons, Masonic lodges and reading groups. Despite fierce opposition by older monks, the younger ones responded enthusiastically, even sympathising with Freemasonry (though not actually joining lodges). Ulrich Petrak, who became prior of Melk in 1786, frequented Viennese salons, received visits from leading poets and contributed to the annual anthologies, including some delightful satires on monastic superstition from which generous excerpts are here quoted. This and much more intriguing information is deftly contextualised and supplemented by an edition of letters addressed to Petrak by several leading lights of the Josephinian Enlightenment. By illuminating the complex relations between clerical and secular culture, this well-written, concise and impeccably documented study softens the rather gloomy account of their conflict recently presented by Derek Beales in *Prosperity and plunder* (Cambridge 2003).

ST JOHN'S COLLEGE,
 OXFORD

RITCHIE ROBERTSON

L'Église constitutionnelle Napoléon et le Concordat de 1801. By Rodney J. Dean (preface Jean Tulard). Pp. xiv + 737. Paris: Picard, 2004. €42 (paper). 2 7084 0719 8
JEH (57) 2006; doi:10.1017/S002204690531623X

The publication of Rodney Dean's compendious work on the importance of the Constitutional Church under Grégoire in the negotiations leading up to the Concordat and then in its aftermath is a milestone in the religious history of Napoleonic France. Dean offers scholars a massive amount of detail about the genesis of the Concordat and the gradual reconciliation of the Constitutionals to a settlement with the Holy See under Pius VII that would not require them to disown their original acceptance of the Civil Constitution of the Clergy in the face of papal condemnation. According to Dean, First Consul Bonaparte had quite a positive

attitude towards this influential clerical minority and he found them a useful bargaining counter in dealing with Caprara, Consalvi and, ultimately, Pius VII. They certainly had a high regard for him and glimpsed in his accession to power and in his victories a figure called by Providence to save France – and themselves. As one bishop fawningly said in a pastoral letter of August 1800, ‘Dieu avait suscité un de ces rares homes qu’il donne quelquefois à la terre pour le bonheur des ceux qui l’habitent; un homme semblable à ce Josué qu’autrefois il chargea d’introduire son peuple dans la terre Promise. Comme lui, Bonaparte fut vaillant dans la guerre’ (quoted p. 85). In his search for a definitive settlement of religious divisions, Bonaparte would not contemplate an agreement that entirely excluded the Constitutionalists and several draft plans (all fully treated in this book) fell at this hurdle in the winter of 1800–1. It was exasperating for the papacy but, as both sides knew, Caprara and Consalvi could not afford to pass up the chance of a Concordat with the dominant state in Europe when it was on offer. The constantly improving international situation allowed Napoleon the latitude to sustain the pressure, and the longer the papal negotiators procrastinated down to the climactic negotiations of June–July 1801 the more warmly the First Consul regarded the willingness of the ‘patriotic’ Constitutional clergy to move to an accommodation. As Dean insists (p. 292) ‘il ne pouvait envisager une paix religieuse sans la réconciliation des constitutionnels’. The latter were concurrently assembled in their second national council and Dean offers the best coverage to date on its debates and controversial closure based largely on documents in the Bibliothèque de Port-Royal, fonds Grégoire. The text also deals thoroughly with the opposition to the Concordat in various quarters and convincingly argues that Bonaparte’s hard-won right to nominate some ex-Constitutional prelates to sees in the Concordatory Church bought off opposition from the more hardline anticlericalist politicians advising him. Revealingly, the one bishop that he would not recommend for inclusion – and in this he shared Pius VII’s misgivings – was Grégoire himself.

Dean emphasises that the Constitutional Church was no monolith and that its much vaunted conciliarist model made it hard for Grégoire to keep all his episcopal colleagues in line, with figures such as Royer and Le Coz more reluctant than he was himself to make concessions to either the Consulate or the papacy. Personality clashes mattered more than theological tensions, and the willingness of seven Constitutional bishops to accept episcopal office in the Concordatory Church occasioned some upset among former colleagues who would not ‘sign up’. Dean offers a comprehensive guide to this immediate post-Concordat era. Chapter xiii brings forward much new material concerning the difficulties of selling the Concordat to the Constitutional clergy; many found the formula of reconciliation distinctly unpalatable and they were encouraged to hold out when Leblanc de Beaulieu, the former bishop of Rouen and newly appointed bishop of Soissons, retracted his oath. It took all the abundant conciliatory skills of Portalis, Bonaparte’s Minister of Cults, to reassure most of the malcontents, and the generous pastoral line of former nonjuring prelates, most notably the nonagenarian archbishop of Paris, Mgr Belloy, also helped. It was Le Coz (denounced by d’Aviau, the *quondam* archbishop of Vienne, as ‘le coryphée et le patriarche de la secte constitutionnelle’) (quoted p. 661), who made most fuss despite Bonaparte approving his nomination to Besançon and he was not pacified until the eve of Pius VII’s visit to France for the coronation of the emperor in late 1804.

L'Église constitutionnelle is a long book and it is not the better for it. It has an astute historiographical dimension and is valuable as a source book, for instance the reproduction in full on pp. 463–7 of the Organic Articles, but the besetting weaknesses cannot be disguised. Dean has simply not thought hard enough about his criteria for the inclusion of materials so that informational overload, a tendency to repetition, and a disappointingly thin analytical dimension blunt the impact of his years of sustained archival research. Rodney Dean's acquaintance with the sources for his subject may be unrivalled (though the Vatican Library is strangely absent from his bibliography) but his decision to overburden the published version of his Sorbonne dissertation with exhaustive – and sometimes excessively trivial details – unfortunately obscures the originality and importance of his labours. It is symptomatic that in a book of 737 pages only 14 are given up to 'Récapitulation et conclusions' despite the surprising insistence (p. 715) (in the light of what has gone before) that the promulgation of the Concordat was a defeat for the Constitutional Church. Here was the major theme that could have been threaded through the book. Instead the reader, particularly if he has started at the beginning and just read on, could be forgiven for missing that crucial conclusion. The absence of an index in a book of this length and detail is unpardonable, and there are some embarrassing problems with the typesetting such as different fonts and footnotes that vary in size.

UNIVERSITY OF LEICESTER

NIGEL ASTON

Ludwig Harms. *In treuer Liebe und Fürbitte. Gesammelte Briefe, 1830–1865*, I/1: *Einleitung und Briefe, 1830–1859*; II: *Briefe, 1860–1865 und Anhänge*. Edited by Hartwig F. Harms and Jobst Reller. (Quellen und Beiträge zur Geschichte der Hermannsburger Mission und des Evangelisch-lutherischen Missionswerkes in Niedersachsen, 12). Pp. 1232. Münster: LIT, 2004. €39.90. 3 8258 7981 X
JEH (57) 2006; doi:10.1017/S0022046905326236

The Lutheran pastor Ludwig Harms (1808–65) was one of the central figures in the north German revival movement. In the small village of Hermannsburg he preached a conservative evangelicalism in the face of attacks from rationalist clergy and democratic politicians. These two volumes of letters reveal the very spirit of the founder of the Hermannsburg Mission. Ludwig Harms is said to have written between 50,000 and 70,000 letters in total, many of them thank-you letters to supporters and friends of foreign mission. Of these 830 have now been gathered, ordered chronologically and carefully annotated by Hartwig Harms and Jobst Reller. Letters can only tell half the story, Ludwig Harms once told his key business supporter and close colleague in Hamburg, Johann Nagel. The story they tell is of a man of prayer, deeply grateful for every widow's mite contributed to his mission. Many pastoral aspects of the early history of the Hermannsburg Mission, which contributed to the evangelisation of Australia and southern Africa, find expression in these private letters. But so do the fears and jealousies of the personnel of the various societies – unfortunate by-products of the rather uncoordinated attempts to conquer the world for Christ. Ludwig Harms's obvious dislike of the English ('generally a very overbearing, presumptuous people') and his narrow confessionalist approach did not lend themselves easily to co-operation. His ambiguous and strained

relationship with liberal and democratic elements within the Lutheran Church permeate many of these letters. Harms keenly felt that his 'dear mother', the Lutheran Church, was selling her soul to the devil and would one day force out all true believers who could then assemble as 'a watchman's hut in a cucumber field'. Here is the portrait of a man hoping against hope that his Church would return to its biblical moorings. These letters are introduced by three short biographical essays on Ludwig Harms. Biographical details on Harms's friends and supporters round off an excellent and useful work.

UNIVERSITY OF ULSTER

NICHOLAS M. RAILTON

Mapping the landscape. Essays in Australian and New Zealand Christianity. Festschrift in honour of Professor Ian Breward. Edited by Susan Emilsen and William W. Emilsen. (American University Studies. Ser. IX. History, 193.) Pp. ix + 358 incl. frontispiece. New York: Peter Lang, 2000. £42. 0 8204 4880 X

JEH (57) 2006; doi:10.1017/S0022046905336232

The eighteen papers in this volume, accompanied by two reflections on the life and work of Ian Breward and a list of his published works up to 1999, constitute a very thorough map of the methodology of research into the Christian history and theology of Australasia. This is fitting to honour perhaps the most influential of religious historians in Australasia across the last half century; that the volume is international, rather than local, its publication is also fitting in view of Ian Breward's contribution to bringing Australasian church history to the attention of a wider world.

The papers in the volume divide equally between Australian and New Zealand subjects. It is perhaps a tribute to Breward's own particular vision of space and place that so many of them address the distinctive features of the Australian and New Zealand experience of Christianity, and write with a shared consciousness of the special characteristics of island geography, large and small.

Hilary Carey ('"Attempts and attempts": responses to failure in pre- and early Victorian missions to the Australian Aborigines'), in a study that is thoughtful and wide-ranging in methodological terms, considers the problem of how 'missions that did not lead on to a later harvest were an oddity which could not be incorporated into the grand narratives of later mission narratives'. Taking as her main subject the Church Missionary Society's station in the Wellington Valley, which closed in 1842, she considers in a wider frame the rhetoric of missionary reportage – with its definitions of 'success' (pp. 48–9) ranging from numbers of schools built, through translations of Scripture, to the successful maintenance of personal ideals. She concludes that it is a more modern tendency to measure success in terms of sheer numbers of converts. Most important, she also highlights the problems of denominational historiography, which, working backwards from 'successful' cases of mission, encounters cases of failure of missions with a greater degree of surprise than a broader knowledge of colonial history might inspire. This study could be read with benefit by any historian of conversion working in any period.

One of the most interesting contributions from the theological side comes from Christiaan Mostert ('Is a non-contextual theology viable?'), who, in somewhat

playful tone, particularly in view of the church historian's inevitably local perspective, asks (p. 119) whether much of the contemporary debate concerning 'contextual' theology begs two questions: firstly, whether theologians can ever divorce themselves from the context in which they write, and, secondly, whether theology is the study of a 'universal' doctrine of 'one holy, catholic and apostolic church'. His critique addresses questions of context and indigenisation that are increasingly at issue in most of the major Churches. Some of these questions are also well addressed in Clive Pearson's contribution ('Christ and context down under: mapping transTasman Christologies'), where he reviews the varied perspectives raised at the 'Christ and Context' conference held in Otago in 1991. A very accessible and amusing examination of Australian Christologies is also provided by Stuart Piggin ('Jesus in Australian history and culture'), in which he examines the images of Christ that have been assimilated to visions of mateship, the Labour movement and in the works of writers from Joseph Furphy through to Patrick White. He concludes that 'Australians have been anticlerical, and antichurch, but rarely AntiJesus', and sees that Australians have most often made common cause with Jesus as an anti-institutional figure.

The space available to a reviewer is insufficient to consider all the worthwhile contributions to this collection. Especially notable is the frank and critical survey of New Zealand religious history by Allan Davidson ('New Zealand history and religious myopia'). A very interesting study by Bill Emilsen ('The origins of the Uniting Aboriginal and Islander Christian Congress') identifies (p. 79) the degree to which contact between Aboriginal and Maori leaders enabled the development of a theology and of institutions that would liberate Aboriginal ministry from its mission context and bring it under indigenous leadership. *Festschriften* can be notoriously uneven and eclectic, but, while there are a few weak contributions to this volume, in general what is striking is the overall quality of the papers and the faithful adherence of most of the authors, not simply to the general theme, but to its specific terms. This reflects very well on the work of the editors, who have brought together a fine collection that ranges across history, systematics, hymnody and critical theory. The resultant mix is a rich one and fitting to honour the diversity and quality of the work of its honorand.

UNIVERSITY OF WALES,
LAMPETER

JONATHAN M. WOODING

Opium, soldiers and evangelicals. England's 1840-42 war with China, and its aftermath.

By Harry G. Gelber. Pp. v+252. Basingstoke: Palgrave Macmillan, 2004.
£35. 1 4039 69799 5

JEH (57) 2006; doi:10.1017/S0022046905346239

Recent high-ranking publications have dealt with contraband opium in China and the related conflicts (Polachek, Trocki, Wong), both as events and in their historical significance. Why yet another book on a topic which has crowded the shelves ever since the 1840s? Official Chinese historiography, in the People's Republic as well as in Taiwan, has emphasised the significance of the war as part of China's nation-building process, bestowing on officials such as Lin Zexu heroic epithets for their struggle against the 'opium evil' and against 'foreign imperialism'. Beyond China,

historians have tended to reflect the international political climate, from the free trade mission of the outgoing nineteenth century, to post-colonial soul-searching and the divisions of the Cold War era. Within this wide spectrum of scholarly opinion, one common denominator has been the condemnation of the British empire, as the main agent of foreign imperialism in nineteenth-century China. Where other authors renounce this unique historical burden, Gelber enters the scene, patiently renarrating the story of the first armed conflict between the two empires – from a British perspective.

While the much needed revision of China's opium myth has only just begun (Dikötter, Laamann, Newman, Zhou), Gelber sets out to correct public perceptions of the first Anglo-Chinese war. In order to readjust the historical balance, the author presents the 'forgotten voices' of the public debate in Britain at the time. Certainly such opinions often expressed support for military action, citing well-known reasons such as free trade and the introduction of international (i.e. European) diplomatic rules. But in the same process, Gelber excavates arguments which go flatly against the later view that China's conduct was 'humiliating' and warfare unavoidable. Surgeon Charles Paterson, for instance, is cited as saying that conditions for foreign traders during Lin Zexu's siege of the Canton factories were 'merry' (p. 66). In a similar vein, the anti-Chinese rhetoric so commonly accepted in subsequent decades is carefully deflated, laying bare domestic political divisions.

Gelber's sources are derived from the political discourse of the day: parliamentary papers, the correspondence of senior officials, events documented in the *Chinese Repository* and public letters sent to publications such as *The Times*. Wading through hundreds of pertinent documents, Gelber pursues a succinct and linear trajectory: first, by gathering evidence for events leading to the genesis of the armed conflict as a specifically *opium* war; secondly, by reconstructing the moralistic connotations which developed over the decades; and, finally, by assessing the role of the conflict for the creation of modern Chinese nationalism. His argument gathers pace very gradually, and in chronological sequence. While the first three chapters introduce the Canton trade system (as well as Palmerston), centre stage is reserved for a description of the war itself (chapters iv–viii), as reflected in the debate in London's leading circles. This minute account is followed by an analysis of the consequences, both immediate (ch. ix) and long-term (chs x–xi).

Harry Gelber's study is unabashedly one-sided, excluding any Chinese interpretations through his exclusive use of western (mostly British) sources. His latest book is in fact more of a 'revisionist' reappraisal of the later British empire. As a historical exploration of the conflict's implications for China, this study would be insufficient, be it for the mere fact that not a single Chinese source was used. Lack of familiarity with Chinese history is also revealed through inconsistencies in romanisation and through the misspelling of the names of well-known China historians (for example, J. Gernet). An analysis of the 'Chinese perspective' was, however, never the main objective. Instead, the changing self-perceptions of the British empire (nineteenth century) and of the United States (twentieth century) are exposed, as reflected in their steadily altering foreign policies. Towards the end, valuable comparisons are made, for instance between the moral enlightenment campaign of the Anglo-American evangelical elite and today's mission to safeguard 'human rights'. Another cited example is the almost hysterical campaign against the

use and abuse of narcotic substances. Despite its lack of Chinese sources, this monograph is a well-observed, diligent and intelligent analysis of the nineteenth-century British empire in China.

SCHOOL OF ORIENTAL AND AFRICAN STUDIES,
UNIVERSITY OF LONDON

LARS PETER LAAMANN

Freikirchen in Deutschland (19. und 20. Jahrhundert). By Karl Heinz Voigt. (Kirchengeschichte in Einzeldarstellungen, III/6.) Pp. 265. Leipzig: Evangelische Verlagsanstalt, 2004. €24. 3 374 02230 8

A Church divided. German Protestants confront the Nazi past. By Matthew D. Hockenos. Pp. xiii + 271 incl. 16 ills. Bloomington, IN: Indiana University Press, 2004. \$29.95. 0 253 34448 4

Bleiben, wohin uns Gott gestellt hat. Zeitzeugen berichten über die Kirche in der DDR. By Reinhard Höppner. Pp. 256 incl. 9 ills. Leipzig: Evangelische Verlagsanstalt, 2004. €12.80 (paper). 3 374 02207 3

JEH (57) 2006; doi:10.1017/S0022046905356235

The number of works analysing German Protestantism continues to expand. Karl Heinz Voigt has written a very useful study of the main German Free Churches, focusing on the themes of mission and evangelism, Sunday school work and the difficult and frustrating relationships with the provincial churches of Lutheran and Reformed persuasion. From their origins in the middle decades of the nineteenth century Free Churches were demonised by Lutheran politicians and churchmen alike as ‘Anglo-Saxon sects’. Persecution and discrimination, combined with a breathtaking ignorance, only gave way to tolerance and partial acceptance with the birth of the modern ecumenical movement in the inter-war years. The collapse of the German monarchies and the establishment of a modern republic at Weimar led to a reconsideration of the place of voluntary religious groupings in German society. In the Third Reich the close British and American links led to their being upgraded by the Nazis in the interests of political propaganda. The Nazi regime granted Free Churches a status and rights denied to them by previous ‘Christian’ governments. Political *naïveté* and zealous nationalism amongst Free Church adherents involved them in embarrassing accommodations with the Nazi regime. They proved to be as gullible as other Christians. Their more international outlook made little difference in the face of violent antisemitism and war fever. Yet the Evangelical Alliance and the Association of Free Churches in Germany in many respects prepared the way for contemporary ecumenical activities. It is probably too early to say whether the ecumenical movement, which only counts some of the German Free Churches as members, and the tolerance of historical-critical approaches to the Bible has harmed or helped the nonconformist testimony. Sunday school work, once the pride of Free Churches, is slowly disappearing. Evangelism no longer has a central place in Free Church praxis. Statistically, the current situation seems rather bleak for Free Churches in Germany.

The Free Churches are excluded altogether from Matthew Hockenos’s interesting study of German Protestant responses to the defeat of National Socialism. It is really a study of the mindsets of a select group of Lutheran and Reformed Christians. Guilt and repentance are central themes of the book. Hockenos seeks to show how

churchmen tried to come to terms with their complicity in National Socialist barbarity. The feeble and embarrassing attempts to explain their silence and inactivity in the Third Reich is ably described by Hockenos. He separates a supposedly unrepentant conservative-nationalist majority (represented by men of the calibre of Otto Dibelius and Theophil Wurm) from a forward-looking radical minority (Martin Niemöller, Karl Barth) seeking organisational and theological changes. Unfortunately, the radical party was not representative of German Protestantism. Neither wing of the Confessing Church had actually offered much ideological opposition to the totalitarian, ultra-nationalist and antisemitic Nazi regime, not least because for centuries churchmen and theologians had been incorporated into the political administration of the country. Though Dietrich Bonhoeffer and Martin Niemöller may have toyed with the idea of a re-establishing Protestantism as a united Church free from all state control, there has been no serious attempt since 1945 to separate the Churches financially, or in other ways, from the German states.

Hockenos devotes two chapters to the post-war debate on anti-Judaism and antisemitism within Protestantism. He adopts the politically correct liberal shibboleths of the post-Auschwitz era, following the lead taken by John Conway, who once suggested that adherents of missions to Jews could either choose to label themselves 'ecclesiastical imperialists' or 'theological deviants'. Church history is reduced by Hockenos to 'two thousand years of Christian contempt for Jews' (p. 66). The attempt to convert Jews is, in his view, little more than carrying on the holocaust by peaceful means. Actually, the mission to Jews never permeated more than the fringes of German Protestantism. Most of those involved were themselves Jews who were zealously philo-Semitic and Zionist in orientation. The belief that Israel was still the chosen nation – the apple of God's eye – may have been a new insight for some German theologians in 1945, but it had been a cornerstone of Jewish missionary theology for at least 150 years.

Attempts by Lutherans to deal with the guilt incurred between 1933 and 1945 seem now to have been rather superficial. The desire amongst all ecclesiastical parties to reChristianise the German nation after the defeat of National Socialism clearly failed to bear fruit. Parishioners, long disillusioned with the *Volkskirche*, have voted with their feet and left.

That process of apostasy was helped along in the German Democratic Republic by the SED government. The book edited by Reinhard Höppner sheds some light on the Church–State struggles. It contains contributions from six Lutherans, two Catholics and one Free Churchman, which were initially presented at a conference in Berlin (the date is not given). The focus in this section is on the early post-war period. Reflections on the Nazi period do not seem to have played a role in the decisions of these men to study theology. The conservative Otto Dibelius is remembered by his contemporaries as the bishop of Berlin who in 1959 called for all-out resistance to the Communist government and its laws – including the traffic regulations. Three decades later German Protestants, who had been encouraged the previous year by the 'radical' Karl Barth to submit to those authorities, were in the forefront of organising the peaceful revolution in eastern Germany. Höppner's book provides a general overview of the central issues in Church–State relations (youth work, peace education) particularly following the summit meeting of March 1978. Space given to the discussion of socio-political

matters far surpasses that devoted to theological or religious trends. Few new details are in fact given. History is told by means of personal stories and recollections. Protestantism's image of being an 'honest broker' was seriously marred by revelations of its complicity in the State Security Police spying activities. The march out of mainstream ecclesiastical institutions, in east and west, continued to gather pace in the 1990s.

UNIVERSITY OF ULSTER

NICHOLAS M. RAILTON

Altkatholiken in Österreich. Geschichte und Bestandsaufnahme. By Christian Halama (foreword Hannes Androsch). Pp. xviii + 940 incl. 35 ills + 64 plates. Vienna: Böhlau, 2004. €69. 3 205 77224 5

JEH (57) 2006; doi:10.1017/S0022046905366231

In this book, the Old Catholic priest Christian Halama describes the origins, the history and the present situation of the Old Catholics in Austria. It offers a good insight into the theology and the development of the Old Catholic community from the First Vatican Council right up to the present day and, moreover, it reveals a great wealth of information about prominent Austrian Old Catholics such as the politician Hannes Androsch, the actress Paula Wessely and the artist Alfred Hrdlicka. The latter has donated a watercolour painting for the cover design of the book. In spite of the enormous quantity of material used and the very detailed research apparatus (about 1,500 footnotes), the book does not suffer from being unreadable. Hannes Androsch, former socialist finance minister and deputy chancellor, now a leading Austrian industrialist, who has written the foreword, explains what affiliates him, as a socialist, to this religious community. Androsch makes the point that 'at the time of "Austro-Fascism" between 1934 and 1938, many Austrian socialists found a new spiritual home in the Old Catholic Church. My family, too, has belonged to this denomination since those days'. Although the Old Catholic Church has remained a small community in comparison with the Roman Catholic and the Protestant Churches, its history reflects none the less many decisive and eventful developments in Austrian and European history.

KARL VON VOGELSANG-INSTITUTE,
VIENNA

HANNES SCHÖNNER

Theologie zwischen den Weltkriegen. Hermann Wolfgang Beyer (1898–1942). By Irmfried Garbe. (Greifswalder Theologische Forschungen, 9.) Pp. 747 incl. colour frontispiece + 38 figs. Frankfurt-am-Main: Peter Lang, 2004. £68.70. 3 631 52277 0; 1439 1708

JEH (57) 2006; doi:10.1017/S0022046905376238

Garbe's biography of the church historian and theologian, Hermann Wolfgang Beyer, is witness to a growing interest today amongst historians in churchmen who saw Hitler and National Socialism as the way forward out of a lost war and postwar national humiliation. It is a new prosopography which serves to balance a primary postwar interest, culminating in Bethge's 1970 biography of Bonhoeffer, in the Protestant and Catholic clergy minority which opposed National Socialism. This biography is a goldmine of information, packed with telling photos of interwar

Protestant nationalistic theologians, their networks and their ephemeral but obviously very persuasive popular penny theology. Beyer, a lecturer briefly in Göttingen (1925–6), was heavily influenced by Hirsch's German nationalist mission temper, and by Kittel and his erasure of Jewish parallels in his controversial dictionary of the New Testament to which Beyer contributed several articles. As professor at Greifswald (1926–36) and Leipzig (1936–40), he thus soon fell in line, given his active German nationalist mission in school RE textbooks and student politics (his chief book was a history of the Gustavus Adolphus Association, published in 1932), with the German Christians. Though he joined the Nazi Party and Nazi Teachers' Union first in 1937, he would have done so in 1933 had it been possible then. Joining the SA, it seems, was his 'contribution' to the Luther anniversary in November 1933. He was an adviser to Ludwig Müller, asserting the need for strong links with the Nazi Party, and briefly 'Church Minister' from December 1933 to February 1934. Board membership of the *Evangelischer Bund* in 1930 and editorship of *Deutsche Theologie* (1934–7) were seen as means to assert the 'pure' quality of German Lutheranism and to combat an ascendant postwar Roman Catholicism and Bolshevik atheism. But, as one student noted in June 1935, there was something funny about such teaching which began and ended with 'Heil Hitler' (storm of applause), lectures on Luther and entelechy in Creation. And yet, Hauer's German Faith Movement proved too much for Beyer, as did his realisation (too late as Leipzig's dean of theology) that Protestant theology faculties were 'unwanted' by the party leadership. Leipzig's was officially closed on 18 January 1940. Beyer joined, voluntarily, the Wehrmacht as a military chaplain. He was killed in action on the Don front on Christmas Day 1942, thereby making a reality of the 'sacrificial death' which he had learned as a frontline soldier (after 1916), and had preached in a university sermon on Remembrance Sunday 1931. If the reader can bear the detail and the apologetic tone, this is a book well worth reading.

DULL BY ABERFELDY

NICHOLAS HOPE

The Cambridge companion to Hans Urs von Balthasar. Edited by T. Oakes and David Moss. (Cambridge Companions to Religion.) Pp. xviii + 282. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2004. £45 (cloth), £16.99 (paper). 0 521 81467 7; 0 521 89147 7

JEH (57) 2006; doi:10.1017/S0022046905386234

The editors of the *Cambridge Companions*, an excellent series of collective scholarship, have decided to dedicate a volume to the work of the Swiss Roman Catholic theologian Hans Urs von Balthasar (1905–88). The reasons for this decision are not self-evident. The reception of the theology of Balthasar, who was not an academic theologian and rather an author of poetic vision than of systematic thought, has only recently started to develop and it may be too soon to tell what the importance of his work will be for the history of modern theology. The editors are more optimistic and this volume, itself a starting point for future research into one of the most controversial theologians of the twentieth century, might therefore prove to be a self-fulfilling prophecy. Yet Balthasar has inevitably been of influence on, for example, John Milbank and the Radical Orthodoxy movement, and a favoured author in clerical catholic circles. For that reason alone, a wider and critical

perspective on his work was necessary and is admittedly well provided for by this volume.

Unfortunately, the authors are exclusively either British or North American and seem unaware, with some notable exceptions, of German and Spanish Balthasar-research, which is much more advanced and occasionally also highly critical. Due to the idiosyncratic form and content of Balthasar's theology, the articles are somewhat arbitrarily divided into four sections: theological topics, the trilogy, disciplines and contemporary encounters. In the section on theological topics Rowan Williams's contribution on the Trinity and Geoffrey Wainwright's article on Balthasar's radical change of modern eschatology are of great importance. The authors who introduce Balthasar's theological aesthetics and dramatics, Oliver Davies and Ben Quash, are well chosen. Aidan Nichols, who introduces the *Theologic*, is probably one of the few English-speaking authors who have read the yet untranslated last volume of that part of the trilogy. The cross sections of Balthasar's biblical hermeneutics, patristics, literary criticism and metaphysics – the latter by Fergus Kerr – are groundbreaking experiments. Balthasar's work is highly original and voluminous, and very few authors have dared or were able to rearrange his ideas systematically. John Webster analyses the decisive influence of Karl Barth on Balthasar, but refutes the assertion that the influence was reciprocal. In her article on the intellectual relationship of Balthasar and Karl Rahner, Karen Kilby possibly touches upon the essence of Balthasar's slow and complicated reception. According to her Balthasar and Rahner differ in their apologetic attitude: 'With Balthasar it is harder to know how to engage him in a conversation and how to disagree.' The volume closes with a short bibliography of publications in the English language and an index.

RADBOUD UNIVERSITY,
NIJMEGEN

STEPHAN VAN ERP

Evangelicalism and national identity in Ulster, 1921–1998. By Patrick Mitchel. Pp. xii + 362 incl. 2 figs and 4 tables. Oxford–New York: Oxford University Press, 2003. £60. 0 19 925615 2
JEH (57) 2006; doi:10.1017/S0022046905396230

Patrick Mitchel has written an impressive and important book. He argues that the 'political Protestantism' found in Ulster Unionism and what he terms the 'closed' evangelicalism of Paisleyism and the Orange Order can best be understood as a form of nationalism. Hence, like other nationalisms it is obsessed with the past, identifies with a territorial homeland and manipulates religion in its sense of destiny as a chosen people. He is critical of the way that such 'religious nationalism' came to dominate even the 'open' evangelicalism of the mainstream Presbyterian Church (the largest Protestant denomination in Northern Ireland), leading to complacency during the 'golden era' of Unionism up to 1972 and a failure to recognise the existence of the Catholic nationalist minority. But, although he acknowledges the huge importance of evangelicalism to Ulster Protestant identity, he argues that such stances are perversions of evangelicalism. Authentic biblical evangelicalism calls for love of thy neighbour. He traces the long-overdue beginnings of a recognition of this within mainstream evangelicalism and is frustrated by the way that Paisleyism and Orangeism continues to be mistaken for the authentic voice of Ulster Protestantism.

Rather they are political movements, which have 'adapted a religious discourse to a nationalist agenda – the survival of Ulster unionism'. Indeed for true evangelicalism to flourish he believes that it should distance itself entirely from unionism. This is a trenchant and authoritative analysis of contemporary Northern Ireland, written by someone from within the evangelical tradition. Its message is unlikely to be accepted readily by most Ulster Protestants, but that it is being made at all is a token of a genuine effort at reimagining a different and less divisive future.

UNIVERSITY OF LIVERPOOL

MARIANNE ELLIOTT

Battle for the BIA. G. E. E. Lindquist and the missionary crusade against John Collier. By David W. Daily. Pp. xii + 217 + 9 ill. Tucson: The University of Arizona Press, 2004. \$39.95. 0 8165 2437 8
JEH (57) 2006; doi:10.1017/S0022046905406235

In the period 1933–45 the attitude of the Bureau of Indian Affairs (BIA) towards Native Americans underwent a dramatic, albeit temporary, reversal. Rejecting the previous policy of total assimilation, the so-called 'Indian New Deal', spearheaded by the Commissioner of Indian Affairs, John Collier, was an attempt to reorganise Indian tribal governments, restore tribal land and protect native American cultural expression. Historians have tended to focus upon the politico-economic aspects of the 'Indian New Deal' and also upon Collier, its Euro-American architect. In contrast Daily adopts a multi-focused approach, examining also the implementation of Circular 2970, the BIA regulation intended to ensure cultural tolerance. *Battle for the BIA* explores Collier's relationship with the body of (largely Protestant) missionaries who had, under previous BIA policy, wielded a substantial degree of influence over Native Americans at the reservation level. As a professed cultural pluralist, whose veneration of Native American cultures bordered upon romanticism, Collier sought to limit aggressive Christian proselytising in the government-run Indian schools, and to promote religious tolerance. This policy attracted the concern and opposition of certain missionary conservatives, notably G. E. E. Lindquist, who believed that the policy of rehabilitating Indians as Indians ran contrary to their welfare and 'progress'. *Battle for the BIA* is a well-researched and energetic exploration of the 'Indian New Deal' from the perspective of the missionary community. Daily redresses the tendency of 'Indian New Deal' historians to adopt a Collier-centric, politics-focused approach and instead places missionary grievances and aims at centre stage. Indeed, Daily probes the variety of missionary responses to Collier's pluralist policies, and reveals the tensions between the accommodationist Home Missions Council and the isolated field missionaries who vehemently opposed the new regulations and formed the anti-BIA National Fellowship of Indian Workers (NFIW) in 1935. He therefore demonstrates that missionaries did not respond to the 'Indian New Deal' as a homogeneous unit, but were driven into factions. Despite his missionary focus, Daily also makes a contribution to the ongoing historical debate over Collier's motivation: was he a romantic preservationist, a balanced pluralist or a clandestine assimilationist? Daily concludes that total assimilation was the very antithesis of New Deal policy as the Indian Reorganisation Act strengthened the legal foundations for Indians' political distinctiveness: 'Collier was moving in the direction of Indian nationhood – the political antithesis of assimilation.' Yet it is precisely this return to

the driving forces and grand themes of the 'Indian New Deal' that reveals the limitations of this study. Daily's work is primarily an analysis of the relationship or 'battle' between Lindquist and Collier: it is in essence a biographical study of Lindquist's crusade against 'Indian New Deal' cultural and political policies, rather than an examination of the impact of Circular 2970 upon Native American communities. Although Daily includes reactions from leading Native American educationalists and spokespersons such as Ruth Muskrat Bronson and Henry Roe Cloud, his interest is directed towards the individual rather than the community or indeed the grassroots level. He makes brief reference to the theoretical unsuitability of Hopi religious lessons to the classroom environment, yet includes no reactions from the Native American parents whose children were educated in the government Indian schools. Similarly, he notes that by 1940 half the NFIW members were Native American missionaries, yet he offers little insight into the reactions of Native community members, and indeed non-Christians, towards the policy of cultural tolerance. However, *Battle for the BIA* confirms that both sides (Collier and Lindquist) in the debate over Indian policy in the 1930s were driven by paternalistic visions – that both, despite their differing claims to promote Native American empowerment, 'continued to act on the assumption of western superiority over tribal nations'. Daily's contribution to work on the 'Indian New Deal' is therefore an important one.

SIDNEY SUSSEX COLLEGE,
CAMBRIDGE

GABRIELLA TREGLIA

The church struggle in South Africa. By John W. de Gruchy (with Steve de Gruchy). Twenty-fifth anniversary edition. Pp. xxx + 286. London: SCM, 2004 (first publ. by Eerdmans, 1986, 1979). £19.99 (paper). 0 334 02970 8
JEH (57) 2006; doi:10.1017/S0022046905416231

In 1979, at the height of the struggle against apartheid, the first edition of this volume was published. As one of the first books on the subject it quickly became a standard text on the Churches' involvement in the struggle and was updated in 1986. This third edition, celebrating the twenty-fifth anniversary of the original publication, is noticeably different from the first. The authors demonstrate a development in their approach and the book reflects in its evolution something of the historical process that is its subject. The first four chapters of this edition contain the fewest alterations. They reflect the historiography of the 1970s by approaching the struggle in terms of public declarations, institutional action and the involvement of prominent leaders. The Cottesloe Consultation and the reaction of different denominations to it, the role of the Christian Institute of Southern Africa, the South African Council of Churches and the University Christian Movement, the contributions of Beyers Naudé, Manas Buthelezi and Allen Boesak among others, are all examined. John de Gruchy is a well-known South African theologian whose writings have often taken historical form. He provides the theological comment of one committed to the struggle as well as measured explanations of different theological positions. He carefully charts the Churches' protests (and sometimes acquiescence) in the developing context of apartheid. The anniversary edition is written as apartheid fades and new struggles face the nation and the Church. It has retained and added prefaces and postscripts (five in all) that explain the revision of the text. One chapter

has been eliminated and two new ones added. The first of these discusses the impact of the Kairos document and follows the apartheid struggle through to the democratic elections of 1994. The historical process is echoed in the authorship as father hands over the final chapter and postscript to his son, also a theologian. Steve de Gruchy outlines poverty, sexuality and gender issues, pluralism and globalisation as the contemporary struggles which face South Africa and its Churches: issues that he recognises cannot be fully addressed in a single chapter. His postscript acknowledges the meta-narrative of the earlier chapters and the bias towards the male, the institutional and the influential in its history. Many books have been written on the Churches in South Africa since 1979. This one rightly claims to be at 'interface between history, theology, and sermon'. It remains a helpful and thorough introduction to the role of the Churches in the apartheid years and beyond. Reworked as it is, it also offers an insight into a changing intellectual process of interpreting the Churches' response to apartheid.

CAMBRIDGE

EMMA WILD-WOOD

Trevor Huddleston. Turbulent priest. By Piers McGrandle. Pp. xiv + 226 + 9 plates. London–New York: Continuum, 2004. £16.99. 0 8264 7123 4

JEH (57) 2006; doi:10.1017/S0022046905426238

Bishop Trevor Huddleston was arguably one of the most influential Anglo-Catholic priests of the twentieth century and certainly one who made more of a difference in the world than most of his colleagues. Born into comfortable middle-class privilege, after Oxford he became a monk at the Community of the Resurrection in Mirfield, whence he was sent at the age of thirty in 1943 to minister in the impoverished black township of Sophiatown outside Johannesburg. The experience transformed his life and he became an angry and outspoken opponent of the developing apartheid system, so much so that eventually he was recalled to England. If that was intended to shut him up it had the reverse effect and for the next thirty years his impassioned and principled Christian witness to the wickedness of white rule and its oppression of the black population made him an uncomfortable figure both for the Church of England and the British government and an inspirational one for anti-apartheid campaigners and black leaders in southern Africa, including Nelson Mandela and Archbishop Desmond Tutu. This biography makes clear that he could be a very difficult man indeed, though it perhaps underplays the effect Huddleston's diabetes played in contributing to his foul temper. The period of the long struggle against apartheid was however quite frustrating and aggravating enough to try the patience of a saint and Huddleston was certainly not that. Despite being made a bishop in three dioceses, Masasi, Stepney and Mauritius, his energies and abilities were unfulfilled – he left Stepney under a cloud of allegations, which the author says remain unproven, of sexually molesting two boys – and when the apartheid system was finally dismantled, now retired and ailing, he found reverence but no place in the new South Africa. This is a curiously unsatisfactory book. Indeed the foreword that Tutu has contributed is perhaps the most moving thing in it, coming closer than the author ever manages to the wellsprings of Huddleston's faith. The former archbishop recalls the exotic figure in a flowing cassock who actually raised his hat to his mother: 'I couldn't understand a white man doffing his hat to a black woman, an

uneducated woman ... it made a very deep impression on me and said a great deal about the person who had done this.' This is a first book by Piers McGrandle, a schoolmaster at Downside, but unfortunately it is written in the lofty and patronising style beloved of a certain sort of juvenile writer in weekly magazines, full of sweeping assertions and not devoid of the odd, weary *cliché*. I may be being uncharitable in this since McGrandle seems to save his most ill-informed prejudices for the *Guardian*, a hapless collateral victim if ever there was one. I found this rather tiresome – and maybe reflective of other judgements elsewhere in the book – and it is therefore the author's misfortune to have his work reviewed by an employee of that newspaper.

THE GUARDIAN,
LONDON

STEPHEN BATES

An introduction to Pentecostalism. Global charismatic Christianity. By Allan Anderson. Pp. xiii + 302 incl. 12 ills. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2004. £42.50 (cloth), £15.99 (paper). 0 521 82573 3; 0 521 53280 9
JEH (57) 2006; doi:10.1017/S0022046905436234

Allan Anderson's study is a useful update to Walter Hollenweger's *The Pentecostals* (London 1972). Since Hollenweger's classic study the Pentecostal movement has evolved considerably. It is now firmly rooted in Latin America, Africa and the Pacific Rim, often upstaging Catholicism as the most vital and dynamic form of Christianity. In countries such as Zambia or Brazil Pentecostal leaders wield enormous influence and some have directly entered politics as presidential candidates. Anderson's vivid cameos of Pentecostal services across the globe leave the reader in no doubt about the movement's significance. The Yoido Full Gospel Church of Seoul has the largest congregation in the world. The church has hot-seating and consecutive services to accommodate all its 700,000 members and those unable to get inside can watch the service outside on large video screens. Adherents in Japan participate *via* satellite transmissions. Anderson is a Pentecostal himself and his great sympathy for his subject comes as a refreshing counter to the ironic tones of some social scientists working in the same field. He does, however, write from within the fairly limited subdiscipline of 'Pentecostal Studies', which limits itself to issues such as the movement's doctrinal origins, its denominational boundaries, theological credentials and multicultural character. Anderson knows this literature well and highlights the major issues for discussion. But since the 1970s the explosion of Pentecostal and charismatic Christianity has attracted the attention of more secularly orientated social historians, anthropologists and political scientists who have thought about the movement in a variety of ways ranging from its relation to social mobility and class formation to its relation to modernity and neo-liberalism. Two recent articles in the *Annual Review of Anthropology* (2004) by Birgit Meyer and Joel Robins show how rich and provocative this new scholarship has become. Beside this more sociological literature Anderson's approach comes across as both simplistic and outdated. In his chapter on writing Pentecostal history he is keen to correct the white male bias of early accounts by highlighting the movement's appeal to women and non-European peoples and its reliance on indigenous agents for its propagation. But social historians, particularly those working on African Christianity, have been doing this for three or more decades and it is precisely Pentecostalism's appeal to the

socially marginal that has attracted their attention. Likewise his castigation of missionaries, particularly American ones, does not really advance scholarship. While many missionaries were authoritarian cultural imperialists their part in shaping notions of hearth and domesticity and their work as collectors and ethnographers was vital in the shaping of identities and the construction of colonial knowledge. Thus, those wishing to engage with more pressing questions such as the social and cultural meaning of Pentecostalism, its political connections in the Third World or its social significance should look elsewhere, to the work of Grant Wacker, Paul Freston and David Martin respectively. But Anderson's book remains a good introduction.

KEELE UNIVERSITY

DAVID MAXWELL

John Courtney Murray in a Cold War context. By Thomas W. O'Brien. Pp. xvii + 170. Dallas: University Press of America, 2004. £22 (\$28) (paper). 0 7618 2808 7

JEH (57) 2006; doi:10.1017/S0022046905446230

Thomas W. O'Brien's worthwhile study of John Courtney Murray's impact upon his Church and nation posits a link between the 'Americanism' criticised by Pope Leo XIII and the work of the mid twentieth-century Jesuit, who 'ushered the second coming of Americanism into the mainstream of Roman Catholic Doctrine' (p. xvii). What allowed Murray to succeed, to see both the election by his nation of a Catholic president and the promulgation by his Church of a declaration on religious freedom largely authored by himself? The answer, says O'Brien, is anti-Communism, which formed a link between Catholics and other Americans while rendering more plausible to the Church's leadership Murray's contention that the American political system rested upon the same natural law tradition as did Catholic teaching. Yet the author regards the very success of Murray's project as problematic. The idealised America he portrayed, along with the 'hybrid Americanized Thomism' (p. 89) from which he traced the alleged common roots of Catholicism and America, joined to obscure weaknesses of American policy in such areas as economic justice, world order and modern armaments. Not every reader will be persuaded by the author's thesis, but the challenges he poses to the sometimes glib canonisation of Murray's thought merits serious consideration. The book, unfortunately, is marred by poor editing: chapter numbers are confused and misidentified (pp. 67, 93), while reference is made (pp. 136, 138) to information provided by a non-existent bibliography. A peculiar typeface that delights in setting off the first letters of words also detracts from readability.

BENEDICTINE UNIVERSITY

JAMES P. FLINT

The Catholic revolution. New wine, old wineskins, and the Second Vatican Council. By Andrew Greeley. Pp. xiii + 224 incl. 7 tables. Berkeley-Los Angeles-London: University of California Press, 2004. £15.95. 0 520 23817 6

JEH (57) 2006; doi:10.1017/S0022046905456237

Since the Second Vatican Council the Roman Catholic Church has been in turmoil. Andrew Greeley thinks that is a good thing. He sees the first day of the council, when the bishops overthrew the curia's procedure, as the beginning of a revolution. For

four years the assembled bishops were in a state of collective 'effervescence', which spread to the Church as a whole. This dissolved a centuries-old immobilism. The author sees the essentials of Catholic faith unchanged but the stance of clergy and laity radically altered. The total immobility of church teaching and practice has crumbled and Catholics no longer, in his view, see anything as fixed forever. In particular, matters of sex are on the table for redefinition. The rules, and sin, that shaped the authoritarianism of the past is rejected. Yet he claims that Catholics still like to be Catholics and remain so. Greely's expertise is in sociology. He collects and analyses data. Since Vatican II he has conducted several enquiries into American belief and practice, and he has analysed others. He has compared these results with earlier ones. He concludes that Americans have changed from being immigrant peasant conformists to being questioning, conscientious, educated believers. Mixed in with his scientifically gathered data there is anecdotal evidence, coloured by Greely's perceptions. He makes valiant efforts to suggest new attitudes for the Church. He sees that the Church must present itself as attractive in its goodness and truth. This it will achieve through its beauty. He claims – vehemently – that post-conciliar liturgists, ecumenists and pastoral workers have stripped away much of Catholicism's sacraments and sacramentality, which are that beauty. One might think that Greely's world is specifically American, but he has the data and a strong passion for reform.

PONOMA,
QUEENSLAND

T. P. BOLAND